

# *Bibliography*

## General Publications on Compensation and Teacher Quality



This annotated bibliography presents publications on the following general topics related to educator compensation and teacher quality:

- **Educator Pay and Compensation Reform:** publications about reforming teacher salary and educator compensation reform
- **Compensation and Teacher Recruitment and Retention:** publications about the influence of pay incentives and alternative compensation on educator recruitment and retention
- **Compensation and Teacher Quality:** publications about how compensation may or may not influence teacher quality or effectiveness
- **Compensation and Teacher Attitudes, Motivation, and Job Satisfaction:** publications about teacher attitudes, motivation, and job satisfaction as each relates to compensation
- **Examples of Compensation Reform:** publications detailing examples of district- and state-level alternative compensation programs, including information about design, development, and lessons learned

This bibliography presents findings from a thorough scan of the literature. CECR does not necessarily promote the ideas shared in the publications but seeks to present the reader with a comprehensive list of recent relevant publications on various subtopics of compensation reform.

---

Each citation includes the following information:

- The title, author, source, and date of publication
- The publication type—CECR has typed each publication according to one or more of the following eight publication types.
  - **Scientific research:** Peer-reviewed reports on quantitative or qualitative research
  - **Rigorous research:** Peer-reviewed reports on research of a more general nature
  - **Case study:** Systematic reviews of one or more individual compensation reform initiatives
  - **Policy paper:** Reports on public policies affecting educator compensation reform
  - **Issue paper:** Brief overviews of specific educator compensation reform topics of interest that might prove useful to those implementing such programs
  - **Information guide:** Practical suggestions for implementing educator compensation reform programs
  - **Literature review:** Systematic evaluations of educator compensation reform research or reflections on the current state of the art
  - **Perspective piece:** First-person reflections offering perspective or personal experience with educator compensation reform programs
- A link to the publication if it is electronically available
- An abstract of the publication

---

## Educator Pay and Compensation Reform

### All Teachers Are Not the Same

Author(s): Koppich, J. E. Date: 2005

Source: *Education Next*, 1

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20051\\_13.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20051_13.pdf)

Abstract: This article looks at the need to adapt a new teacher salary schedule that is based on incorporating all facets of teaching, not just student performance into a merit-based system. Existing compensation systems do not acknowledge the complexity of the teaching profession, and does not reward performance. Compensation that relies solely on test scores fails to address value-added issues associated with measuring teacher performance.

### Better Pay for Better Teaching: Making Teacher Compensation Pay Off in the Age of Accountability

Author(s): Hassel, B. C. Date: 2002

Source: Washington, DC: Progressive Policy Institute

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.ppionline.org/documents/Hassel\\_May02.pdf](http://www.ppionline.org/documents/Hassel_May02.pdf)

Abstract: This report focuses on the teacher compensation debate. The author reviews the arguments on both sides, both for and against compensation reforms such as performance pay. Insight is offered on the current system of teacher pay and the need for reform, and what factors drive teacher pay. Reformed programs across the nation are detailed and the article offers recommendations to guide policy makers considering reforming their teacher pay systems.

### Better Salaries for Teachers in Texas Public Schools

Author(s): Patterson, C., & Story, J. Date: 2005

Source: Austin, TX: Texas Public Policy Foundation

Type: Research review and books; policy paper; issue paper

Full text: <http://www.texaspolicy.com/pdf/2005-11-teacherpay-rr.pdf>

Abstract: This article takes a look at teacher salaries in Texas, exploring them by not solely comparing them to the national average. It is argued that comparing teacher salaries to the national average does not account for the economic condition of the state. In 2005 Texas teachers were paid on average \$6,100 less than the national average. However, citing a 1991 Southern Regional Education Board (SREB) report found that included cost of living adjustments in it, Texas teachers were earned a comparable salary to the national average. This article also explores the idea of looking at teacher pay by comparing salaries to similar professions. Patterson goes on to examine teacher salaries by exploring different market conditions. In order to determine what is the 'Right Pay' for teachers, these types of market considerations must be taken into account.

## Bush and Kerry on ... The Role of Performance Pay in Improving Education

Author(s): Delisio, E. R. Date: 2004

Source: *Education World*;

Type: Perspective piece; issue paper

Full text: [http://www.educationworld.com/a\\_issues/issues/issues412c.shtml](http://www.educationworld.com/a_issues/issues/issues412c.shtml)

Abstract: This brief article revisits the 2004 presidential election, and both candidates'—President George W. Bush and Senator John Kerry—stances on performance pay and their plan to use performance pay to improve education. President Bush proposed that if elected he would push for a \$500 million Teacher Incentive Fund that would reward effective teachers. Senator Kerry proposed the Great Expectations Fund, which would reward teachers for the acquisition of new skills, along with increased student performance.

## The Changing Structure of Teacher Compensation, 1970–94

Author(s): Lankford, H., & Wyckoff, J. Date: 1997

Source: *Economics of Education Review*, 16(4), 371–384

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: The authors examine how school districts allocate money to teacher salaries and whether the observed salary-expenditure patterns are consistent with what is known about using teachers to improve student learning, considering New York state data from 1970–94. Analyses revealed that backloading of salaries (higher increases to veteran teachers) was a common practice across districts and time periods in New York. As a result, veteran teachers received substantially larger salary increases than novice teachers. Although it is clear that increases in teacher salaries are needed, an alternative allocation of the salary increases may have done more to improve the quality of teachers and the quality of educational outcomes. The substantial increase in the money spent on teacher salaries likely has not had as large an impact on educational attainment as would have occurred had the money been targeted to the recruitment and retention of more highly qualified teachers.

## Collective Bargaining in Education and Pay for Performance

Author(s): Hannaway, J., & Rotherham, A. J. Date: 2008

Source: *Working Paper 2008–11*. Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Literature review; policy paper; scientific research

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Hannaway\\_et\\_al\\_2008.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Hannaway_et_al_2008.pdf)

Abstract: This paper examines the relationship between teacher compensation reform and the teacher unions. The authors review the shift in policy, as well as the arguments for and against performance pay. The paper concludes with a discussion of the response of teacher unions to compensation reform and the indications for policy in the future.

## Comparable Worth

Author(s): Vedder, R. Date: 2003

Source: *Education Next*, 3

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20033\\_14.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20033_14.pdf)

Abstract: When taking into account factors such as work year and work day and fringe benefits, teachers are not significantly underpaid. Data that has been dedicated to teacher salaries has failed to take into account that teachers receive more time off, and have more generous benefit packages than comparable professionals. The article examines many factors that accounted for public school teachers being underpaid. Paying teachers based on inputs (years of experience, education level, etc.) prevents teachers from earning above-market average salaries based on performance. Teachers who specialize in hard-to-staff areas also cannot earn salaries that reflect their need and value.

## Compensation and Skill Development in Four Professions and Implications for the Teaching Profession

Author(s): Kelley, C., & Taylor, C. Date: 1995

Source: Madison, WI: Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: Policy paper; information guide

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This paper examines the compensation systems in four complex, knowledge-based professional settings: law firms, research universities, actuarial science departments, and financial companies. Lessons from these four models provided suggestions for possible modifications to the current teacher compensation system. In various ways, the compensation programs in these professions link pay to the development of knowledge and skills for the pursuit of organizational goals. Based on the understanding of the compensation systems in these four professions, the authors pointed out two important implications for the development of a teacher compensation system. First, the teaching profession could benefit from a compensation and career development system designed with elements of skill-based pay. Second, teacher knowledge and skills should be identified and assessed both internally and externally by members of the teaching profession.

## Does Performance Related Pay for Teachers Improve Student Performance? Some Evidence From India

Author(s): Kingdon, G. G., & Teal, F. Date: 2002

Source: *Economics of Education Review*, 26, 473–486

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content\\_storage\\_01/0000019b/80/1b/1e/91.pdf](http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/0000019b/80/1b/1e/91.pdf)

Abstract: This paper examines data from India to answer the question of the effects of performance pay on student achievement. The authors survey students in India in both public and private schools. The data is compared to teacher pay and student achievement scores. The paper concludes that private schools had higher student achievement scores, in which teacher pay is related to student performance.

## Experimenting With Teacher Compensation

Author(s): Odden, A., & Wallace, M. Date: 2004

Source: *The School Administrator*

Type: Policy paper

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This issue paper argues that the primary sources of teacher salary data—annual reports from two teachers unions—do not provide a comprehensive picture of teacher compensation. The authors suggest that the National Center for Education Statistics and the Bureau of Labor Statistics partner to present more thorough data on teacher pay, including fringe benefits, to inform policymakers and state- and district-level decision makers. The authors summarize a series of issues around teacher salaries and offer an alternative analysis of teacher compensation. In addition, the authors address how components of the teacher salary and benefits system can impact the overall analysis of teacher compensation, including the following: shorter work days and work years for teachers (9- or 10-month school years) versus full-year employees; teachers' starting salaries as compared to other beginning professionals; fringe or other nonsalary benefits, such as health insurance and retirement plans; and trends within a state's salary schedule, including raises.

## Exploring the Theoretical Base for Teacher Performance Pay: A Micropolitical Perspective

Author(s): Ansell Hayes, S. Date: 2006

Source: Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University

Type: Policy paper

Full text: <http://etd.library.vanderbilt.edu/ETD-db/available/etd-07132006-094139/unrestricted/Hayes.pdf>

**Abstract:** This paper discusses the theoretical base of teacher performance pay. The author begins with a literature review on performance pay, including examples of current programs. Next, the author examines the programs through three lenses, different theoretical perspectives: the rational perspective, the culturalist perspective, and the structuralist perspective. The paper then examines literature on teacher motivation and concludes that teacher responses to performance pay encompass a rationalist perspective; they will respond if they value the goals the program rewards.

## Focus on Teacher Salaries: Recent Actions in the SREB States

Author(s): Gaines, G. F. Date: 2003

Source: Atlanta, GA: Southern Regional Education Board

Type: Issue paper; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available.

**Abstract:** This article focuses on recent actions taken on reforming teacher salaries in states that are members of the Southern Regional Education Board (SREB). Teacher compensation has become an indicator for progress in education. Recently, many states have taken action to increase teacher pay through diverse plans. Some states opt to increase pay over time for all teachers, other states have legislated on employee benefits, while still other states focus on performance pay for teachers.

## Fringe Benefits: There Is More to Compensation Than a Teacher's Salary

Author(s): Podgursky, M. Date: 2003

Source: *Education Next*, 3

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20033\\_71.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20033_71.pdf)

**Abstract:** In a review of alternative teacher compensation models that have been used in school districts around the country, the authors present the prevalent approaches, and highlight the implementation in selected districts. Based on the premise that teachers can be the most important factor in positively impacting student-achievement, states and school districts are introducing new measures to attract and reward high-quality teachers. These strategies include market-based salary incentives for certain populations of teachers, and pay-for-performance structures that reward both improved teacher performance and increased student achievement. The article highlights alternative compensation approaches adopted by schools and districts around the country and summarizes the outcomes.

## Frozen Assets: Rethinking Teacher Contracts Could Free Billions for School Reform

Author(s): Roza, M. Date: 2007

Source: Washington, DC: Education Sector

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.educationsector.org/usr\\_doc/FrozenAssets.pdf](http://www.educationsector.org/usr_doc/FrozenAssets.pdf)

**Abstract:** This policy paper provides a cost-benefit analysis of several aspects of the typical teacher contract. Roza argues that a reallocation of funds away from certain pieces of standard teacher contracts would help alleviate the scarcity of resources currently at play in American public education. In the author's own words, "Money spent on seniority-based raises and generous health plans for more veteran teachers might be better used for raising minimum salaries to recruit younger educators who meet high teaching standards" (p. 1). Of the contract stipulations examined, salary increments based on years of experience and costs associated with class-size reduction policies would yield the greatest returns. When taken together, the eight contract areas would, if reformed, free up roughly \$77 billion per year.

## History of Teacher Pay and Incentive Reforms

Author(s): Protsik, J. Date: 1996

Source: *Journal of School Leadership*, 6(3), 265–289

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content\\_storage\\_01/0000019b/80/13/c4/84.pdf](http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/0000019b/80/13/c4/84.pdf)

**Abstract:** This paper discusses three major changes in the method of teacher pay since the 1800s, from an initial rural tradition of paying teachers room and board to a grade-based salary schedule and, finally, to the single-salary schedule. Two new waves of compensation-reform attempts also are discussed: the 1980s individual merit-pay and career-ladder programs and the 1990s group-incentive pay plans based on student performance. The author suggests that the structure of teacher compensation has changed through the years to meet changing social and educational needs. For present educational needs, the single-salary schedule as the dominant model of teacher compensation may be ineffective in most circumstances in encouraging continued teacher professional development. Group-based performance pay plans offer one way to focus teacher efforts on producing student learning. Although teacher compensation is only one of the many aspects that affects school performance, options do exist that can help improve schools to meet tomorrow's needs.

## Holding Accountability to Account: How Scholarship and Experience in Other Fields Inform Exploration of Performance Incentives in Education

Author(s): Rothstein, R. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Literature review

Full text: <http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Rothstein.pdf>

Abstract: This paper examines accountability and performance incentive plans in various fields and relates the experiences and lessons learned to current reform movements in education policy. The author focuses on health care, job training and welfare administration, and the private sector. The paper explores the possibilities for negative consequences following the use of performance incentives, focusing on goal distortion, gaming, and corruption. The author does, however, note that despite these negatives, there is also the possibility that performance incentive plans may improve performance.

## How Has Teacher Compensation Changed?

Author(s): Goldhaber, D. D. Date: 2001

Source: *Selected Papers in School Finance 2000–01*. Washington, DC: National Center for Education Statistics

Type: Literature review; policy paper

Full text: [http://nces.ed.gov/pubs2001/2001378\\_2.pdf](http://nces.ed.gov/pubs2001/2001378_2.pdf)

Abstract: This paper examines the course of teacher compensation throughout recent history. The author reviews policy from the mid-1900s through 2001. Through comparisons of salary, adjusted for inflation, the author finds that teaching is less attractive today than 20 years ago. The paper reviews alternate teacher compensation and provides justification for reform.

## Improving Student Learning Through Strategic Compensation

Author(s): Center for Teaching Quality Date: 2008

Source: Hillsborough, NC: Center for Teaching Quality

Type: Policy paper; perspective piece

Full text: <http://catalog.proemags.com/showmag.php?mid=ggfgt#/page0/>

Abstract: In 2007, the Center for Teaching Quality convened a small group of highly accomplished teachers from the state of Kansas to think strategically about innovative and transformative teacher incentives. The initiative, TeacherSolutions, funded the Alternative Compensation Study Committee; the work of that committee is summarized in this executive summary. Among the recommendations of the committee is the notion that student growth must be included in any measurement of teacher performance that will eventually lead to additional compensation and the idea that extra pay should be granted to teachers who agree to teach mathematics or science or are willing to relocate to a high-needs, high-risk school setting. Finally, the report stresses the group's strong feeling that all teachers be eligible to participate in an alternative compensation system to ensure a sense of equity among all faculty members in a school or across a district.

## Incentives, School Organization, and Teacher Compensation

Author(s): Odden, A. Date: 1995

Source: Madison, WI: Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: Case study; policy paper; literature review

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** In order for compensation to serve as a reinforcement for organizational goals, the norms of the compensation structure must be aligned with the norms of the school organization. This report reviews the history of teacher compensation structure. The author also discusses exemplary cases of teacher compensation-system reform. Drawing from the lessons learned from the past, the author concludes that the school organization, incentives, and teacher compensation should be closely linked. The incentives imbedded in the compensation system function best when aligned with the broader goals of the organization and directly reinforce them. Teacher compensation should change from the traditional single-salary schedule to a salary schedule that provides increments based on direct professional measures of teacher knowledge and skills, and which also includes performance awards for teams and schools. Developing, designing, implementing, and funding such new compensation strategies raise many technical, financial, and political issues, all of which need additional research.

## Individual Teacher Incentives and Student Performance

Author(s): Figlio, D. N., & Kenny, L. W. Date: 2006

Source: *NBER Working Paper No. W12627*. Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: [http://www.caldercenter.org/PDF/1001069\\_Individual\\_Teacher.pdf](http://www.caldercenter.org/PDF/1001069_Individual_Teacher.pdf)

**Abstract:** This article focuses on the relationship between teacher performance and student achievement at an individual level. Using existing national data sources along with a survey of teachers, the study finds that test scores are higher in schools that offer individual financial incentives for performance. The relationship between the presence of merit pay and student achievement was found to be strongest in schools that had the least parental oversight. This article has significant policy implications for future compensation reform.

## Invisible Ink in Collective Bargaining: Why Key Issues Are Not Addressed

Author(s): Cohen, E., Walsh, K., & Biddle, R. Date: 2008

Source: Washington, DC: National Council on Teacher Quality

Type: Policy paper, issue paper

Full text: [http://www.nctq.org/p/publications/docs/nctq\\_invisible\\_ink.pdf](http://www.nctq.org/p/publications/docs/nctq_invisible_ink.pdf)

**Abstract:** In this issue paper, the authors outline the work of the National Council on Teaching Quality (NCTQ) and the organizations' collection of information on teacher contracts from across the country. NCTQ began by collecting information from the country's 50 largest school districts and discovered that the language protecting teachers was not found in the contracts but in state laws. The paper further explores the various state entities that influence teacher regulations, including the courts, the Attorney General, and the labor relations board. The paper explained that these government agencies were detrimental in maintaining local district decision-making power, something that local unions should have more participation in. The paper also provides a series of bargaining questions regarding all topics of the educator career continuum.

## Lessons Learned About Implementing Performance-Based Pay

Author(s): U.S. Department of Education. Date: n.d.

Source: Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Education

Type: Information guide; literature review

Full text: <http://www.ed.gov/admins/tchrqual/performance/pay-performance.pdf>

Abstract: This information guide disseminated by the U.S. Department of Education gives a brief rationale for the use of alternative compensation systems in public school classrooms, then highlights some key components of effective performance-pay models. These tenets include linking data systems with human resources, payroll, student performance, and teacher evaluations; implementing multiple valid assessments of teachers; offering incentives large enough to change behavior; and continually refining the system based on stakeholder input. Finally, the guide lays out specific differences between alternative compensation systems and traditional pay models. According to this piece, “by continuing to evaluate the effect of these innovative programs and harnessing emerging insights ... we can ensure that these promising developments will benefit greater numbers of schools, teachers, and students across the nation” (p. 4).

## Let the Market Decide

Author(s): Ballou, D., & Podgursky, M. Date: 2001

Source: *Education Next*, 1(1)

Type: Issue paper

Full text: <http://educationnext.org/let-the-market-decide/>

Abstract: This article details how the single-salary schedule in public schools is a restrictive system that does not allow compensation to adjust based on teacher performance and realities of the teacher market. Implementing new compensation systems such as knowledge- and skill-based pay are improvements but do not remove the need to align compensation models with market realities. Public schools that function in this system differ from private schools that have a greater ability to set pay based on market factors. The authors describe how private schools have fared in establishing pay in this way.

## Linking Performance to Rewards for Teachers, Principals, and Schools: The 1990 SREB Career Ladder Clearinghouse Report

Author(s): Career Ladder Clearinghouse. Date: 1991

Source: Atlanta, GA: Southern Regional Education Board

Type: Case study; issue paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This report looks at teacher incentive programs implemented across the country. Incentive programs were designed to meet the specific needs of states and helped in improving teacher pay. States increased funding to teacher incentive programs that brought in mixed results.

## Making Schools Work: Improving Performance and Controlling Costs

Author(s): Hanushek, E. A. Date: 1994

Source: Washington, DC: The Brookings Institution

Type: Literature review; policy paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This book presents education reform plans that rely on economic principles. Panelists whose focus was on both economics and education claim school improvement can be achieved when reform efforts incorporate three principles: efficient use of resources, performance incentives for teachers and students, and the continuous learning and adaptation of schools. The book suggests that the importance of schools makes it a necessity for their reform to be guided by economic ideals.

## Merit Pay in a Public Higher Education Institution: Questions of Impact and Attitudes

Author(s): Schulz, E. R., & Tanguay, D. M. Date: 2006

Source: *Public Personnel Management*

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article presents the findings from a survey on merit pay perceptions. The survey was administered to the faculty at a public university. The article includes indicators that best predict merit awards as well as which faculty members are the most supportive of merit pay.

## New and Better Forms of Teacher Compensation Are Possible

Author(s): Odden, A. Date: 2000

Source: *Phi Delta Kappan*, 81(5), 361–366

Type: Issue paper; perspective piece

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: The author proposed a change in the way teachers are paid to simultaneously enhance teaching and reinforce the goals and strategies of standards-based education reform. The author discusses the reasons for the past failure in changing the teacher compensation structure. The creation of the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards and many private sectors that work on knowledge- and skills-based pay has made the change in teacher compensation structure more viable. The reports from the National Commission on Teaching and America's Future and the Consortium for Policy Research in Education regarding teaching salary structure also have helped pave the way for workable changes in teacher compensation. Many states, districts, and teacher unions already are moving forward to change the pay structures. The author discusses three different sets of tools for knowledge and skills assessment: for beginning teachers, midcareer teachers, and experienced teachers. The author offers an example of how the tools could be crafted into a new teacher salary schedule. Finally, the author discusses how the performance-based pay would affect teachers and schools.

## On Rewards, Punishments, and Possibilities: Teacher Compensation As an Instrument for Educational Reform

Author(s): Malen, B. Date: 1999

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 12(4), 387–394

Type: Research reviews and books

Full text: <http://www.springerlink.com/content/g38r4842586g2170/>

Abstract: This brief article provides commentary on existing literature on teacher compensation that focuses on three major themes: assessing school-based rewards, envisioning other promising possibilities, and evaluating policy as well as people as they relate to teacher compensation and educational reform. The examination of these themes allows for the critique of existing policy initiatives, and the development of new initiatives in teacher compensation for the future.

## The Patterns of Teacher Compensation

Author(s): Chambers, J. G., & Bobbitt, S. A. Date: 1996

Source: *Statistical Analysis Report NCES 95-829*. Washington, DC: National Center for Education Statistics

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: <http://nces.ed.gov/pubs95/95829.pdf>

Abstract: This report examines teacher compensation trends in public and private schools. Data from the 1990–91 Schools and Staffing Survey (SASS) administered by the NCES show that, on average, public school teachers can earn more than private school teachers. Analysis of the data also indicates differences in salary based on ethnicity, gender, and school level taught. The authors also consider the effect of the teacher market on salaries. The report details limitations of the research and suggestions for future research.

## Pay for Performance: What Are the Issues?

Author(s): Delisio, E. R. Date: 2006

Source: *Education World*

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://www.educationworld.com/a\\_issues/issues/issues374a.shtml](http://www.educationworld.com/a_issues/issues/issues374a.shtml)

Abstract: Reforms to the traditional pay system for teachers are becoming more common. This article discusses the alternative proposals that have gained national attention. Many districts are moving toward one of many types of performance pay for teachers. Advocates of the programs say that they will help attract and retain teachers. The article indicates, however, that there are still flaws to this reform to be addressed by research.

## Pay for Performance in Public and Private Schools

Author(s): Ballou, D. Date: 2001

Source: *Economics of Education Review*, 20(1), 51–61

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article compares merit pay systems used in public and private schools. Using national data sets, the characteristics of merit awards were analyzed to see how awards differed, how the merit pay systems were implemented, and the opinions of them. Ballou argues that the conditions that exist in private schools make it easier for administrators to implement merit pay systems. Major deterrents of implementing a successful merit pay system are teacher unions and their resistance to merit pay.

## Paying for Public Education: New Evidence on How and Why Money Matters

Author(s): Ferguson, R. F. Date: 1991

Source: *Harvard Journal on Legislation*, 28, 465–498

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study utilized regression analyses and data from more than 800 Texas school districts to understand the determinants of student test scores, factors that influence which districts attract the most effective teachers, and how and why money matters. The study found that teacher basic literacy skills, teacher experience, and class size all predict student test scores. Furthermore, the teacher supply to districts was related to teacher salary levels relative to other occupations in the district and the racial makeup and educational attainment of the district population. The study concluded that money matters for student achievement when it is used to attract higher-quality teachers and to avoid large classes.

## Paying Teachers Properly

Author(s): Finn, C. E., Jr. Date: 2005

Source: *Education Next*, 1

Type: Issue paper; perspective piece

Full text: <http://www.hoover.org/publications/ednext/3258871.html>

Abstract: This article focuses on the need for updating the teacher salary schedule. The current system, the uniform salary schedule, has come under pressure in recent years as failing to adequately compensate teachers. This paper discusses the flaws of the system and indicates the need for reform in the future.

## Performance-Based Pay for Teachers

Author(s): Stedman, J. B., & McCallion, G. Date: 2001

Source: Washington, DC: Congressional Research Service, The Library of Congress

Type: Literature review; policy paper

Full text: <http://digital.library.unt.edu/govdocs/crs/permalink/meta-crs-1646:1>

Abstract: This article provides an overview of performance-based pay for teachers, including key findings from the research. The article includes a policy overview, focusing on the interest of the federal government in compensation reform. In addition to policy, the author discusses several issues including dissatisfaction with the traditional single salary schedule, the different types of performance-based pay, and the factors that lead to successful implementation of a performance based pay program.

## Performance-Based Pay in the Federal Government

Author(s): Nelson, S. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Literature review; policy paper

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Nelson\\_2008.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Nelson_2008.pdf)

Abstract: This article reviews performance-based compensation in the federal government. The article begins with a history of performance-based compensation in government, continues with the research that has been conducted on performance-based compensation, and concludes with the current state of performance-based compensation.

## Performance Pay System Preferences of Students Preparing to Be Teachers

Author(s): Milanowski, A. Date: 2006

Source: *WCER Working Paper No. 2006-8*. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin–Madison, Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: Scientific research; policy paper; issue paper

Full text: [http://www.wcer.wisc.edu/publications/workingPapers/Working\\_Paper\\_No\\_2006\\_08.pdf](http://www.wcer.wisc.edu/publications/workingPapers/Working_Paper_No_2006_08.pdf)

Abstract: This paper presents the result of a study designed to answer three questions: Do college students preparing to be K-12 teachers view pay for performance as a desirable or undesirable attribute of a teaching job? Do the students prefer some forms of pay for performance (e.g., knowledge- and skills-based pay, group-based performance pay, or individual performance pay based on objective indicators, such as student achievement) over others? and Do students' work values and personality characteristics influence their preferences for performance pay or for different performance pay systems? The author conducted focus groups about pay for performance with college students (education majors, pre-education majors and their equivalents in other fields), and a survey with education or pre-education as their major. During the focus groups, the students expressed interest in pay for performance but recognized the issues with measuring performance. The results of the survey showed that students preferred pay for individual performance and pay for increases in knowledge and skills about equally, and these ratings were higher than those for increases in pay based on group performance or pay increases not based on performance at all. Finally, personality and work values had a weak association with respondents' pay system preferences.

## Performance-Related Pay: The Views and Experiences of 1,000 Primary and Secondary Head Teachers

Author(s): Wragg, T., Haynes, G., Chamberlin, R., & Wragg, C. Date: 2003

Source: *Research Papers in Education*, 18(1), 3–23

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article examines the views of teachers who participated in a performance-pay program in England, Threshold Assessment. The authors interviewed teachers who were unsuccessful in meeting the threshold requirements of the program, as well as those who implemented the program. The research indicates that implementation of the program was smooth and the success rate was high; however, the candidates who did not meet the threshold assessment seemed to miss on more than one aspect of their teaching. In both cases, there was strong opposition to the program.

## Performance-Related Pay and the Teaching Profession: A Review of the Literature

Author(s): Chamberlin, R., Wragg, T., Haynes, G., & Wragg, C. Date: 2002

Source: *Research Papers in Education*, 17(1), 31–49

Type: Literature review

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article provides an overview of the research on the effects of pay on employee behavior. Specifically, the authors focus on performance pay for teachers. The research examines multiple pay-for-performance programs in the United States including factors that lead to success for a program.

## The Politics of Teacher Pay Reforms

Author(s): Goldhaber, D. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Literature review; policy paper

Full text: <http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Goldhaber.pdf>

Abstract: This paper studies the political field of pay-for-performance programs. The author presents information on the various positions on alternative compensation taken by key stakeholders: how teacher and teacher union views affect the decision makers. The paper also presents an analysis of the barriers and facilitators to implementing teacher compensation reform.

## Principals' Instructional Leadership and Teacher Development: Teachers' Perspectives

Author(s): Blase, J., & Blase, J. Date: 1999

Source: *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 35(3), 349–378

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study explores teachers' perceptions on the instructional leadership of principals by exploring the question of what characteristics of principals have a positive or negative effect on classroom instruction. Data were collected using the Inventory of Strategies Used by Principals to Influence Classroom Teaching (ISUPICT) questionnaire, which was administered to more than 800 teachers in different regions across the country. Inductive data analysis suggests two major themes of effective principal-teacher interaction: the need of principals to talk with teachers to promote reflection and professional growth. Components of each theme are discussed.

## Professional Development and Incentives for Teacher Performance in Schools in Mexico

Author(s): Lopez-Acevedo, G. Date: 2004

Source: *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper No. 3236*

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This report examines student achievement data from Mexico. The authors specifically focus on the effect of a professional development program on students and teachers. The analysis of student achievement data showed that teacher enrollment in the program had a positive impact and that teacher behavior has a significant effect on student learning.

## Proposals for Performance Related Pay for Teachers in English Schools

Author(s): Tomlinson, H. Date: 2000

Source: *School Leadership and Management*, 20(3), 281–298

Type: Policy paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: The objective of this paper is to report on the political climate and policy developments surrounding the decision of the English government to institute a performance-pay system for its public school teachers. The article first contextualizes the decision by providing background information on the Education Reform Act of 1988 and the 1998 Green Paper "Teachers: Meeting the Challenge of Change." Tomlinson concludes by arguing that a merit-pay scheme is appropriate and aligned with a new vision of professionalism for teachers, while acknowledging that the system has met some resistance from certain factions of educators.

## The Pros and Cons of Performance-Based Compensation

Author(s): Solmon, L. C., & Podgursky, M. Date: 2000

Source: Santa Monica, CA: Milken Family Foundation

Type: Issue paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This paper focuses on the research behind performance-based compensation for teachers. The purpose is to compile and analyze the current and historical criticisms of the program, along with highlighting the positive research. The researchers concluded that while there are many objections to performance-based compensation systems, including many teachers, research has shown how objections can be fixed in a new system. They also indicate that it is important to continue experimenting with these new programs.

## Redesigning Teacher Salary Systems for Education Reform

Author(s): Firestone, W. A. Date: 1994

Source: *American Education Research Journal*, 31(3), 549–574

Type: Literature review

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article focuses on recent efforts to reform teacher salary systems. According to past research, some efforts to reform pay systems though merit pay have not been successful. However, research indicates that there are good reasons to consider new approaches. The author focuses on three specific alternatives: knowledge- and skill-based pay, job enlargement, and collective incentives. The research review indicates that these reforms have the potential to contribute to the motivation of teachers.

## Reinventing Teacher Compensation Systems

Author(s): Kelley, C., & Odden, A. Date: 1995

Source: Madison, WI: Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: Policy paper; information guide

Full text: <http://www.ed.gov/pubs/CPRE/fb6/index.html>

Abstract: This report provides a history of changes in teacher compensation during the last century and a discussion of key organizational and educational changes that could be reinforced by a new teacher compensation structure. The discussion builds upon the context of changes in the society and in education systems. Three types of new compensation systems are described: skills- or competency-based pay, pay-at-risk, and group-based performance awards. The authors also provide examples of implemented innovative compensation programs, including the Kentucky Instructional Results Information System, the South Carolina School Incentive Reward Program, the Douglas County, Colorado, pay plan, and school-based rewards in Dallas. The authors identify 10 key process principles for a successful compensation system: involvement of all key parties; broad agreement on the most valued educational results; sound, comprehensive evaluation systems; adequate funding; investments in ongoing professional development; avoidance of quotas; good working conditions; management maturity; labor maturity; and persistence. Technical principles of each innovative compensation system were suggested.

## Report of the Task Force on 21st Century Teaching and Learning

Author(s): Blackmon, D., Cooper, A., Sawyer, G., Taylor, A. M., Beaty, K., Coon, B., et al. Date: 2008

Source: Columbia, SC: South Carolina Department of Education

Type: Issue paper; information guide

Full text: <http://www.scteachers.org/Cert/certpdf/TeachingReportFINAL.pdf>

Abstract: This issue paper presented to the South Carolina Department of Education offers an information guide on strategies and best practices for recruiting and retaining high-quality teachers. The report lays out four key areas in the reform effort: “reinventing teacher compensation, recasting the teaching profession, improving teacher working conditions, and improving community infrastructure and support for teachers” (p. 3). For each of the four recommendations, task force members present a rationale and a series of action steps, bolstered by specific, illustrative examples. Finally, the report concludes with a compendium of current retention and recruitment efforts in South Carolina.

## Research on Performance Pay for Teachers

Author(s): Ingvarson, L., Kleinhenz, E., & Wilkinson, J. Date: 2007

Source: Camberwell, VIC, Australia: Australian Council for Educational Research

Type: Literature review; information guide; issue paper

Full text: [http://www.acer.edu.au/documents/Ingvarson\\_PerformancePaypaperMar07.pdf](http://www.acer.edu.au/documents/Ingvarson_PerformancePaypaperMar07.pdf)

Abstract: This report is an extensive review of literature from Australia and the rest of the international evidence base on performance pay for teachers. The report does include research from the United States, mentioning the Teacher Incentive Fund programs. The authors focus on the provisions for performance pay programs and identify potential barriers to introducing performance pay.

## Returns to Seniority Among Public School Teachers

Author(s): Ballou, D., & Podgursky, M. Date: 2002

Source: *Journal of Human Resources*, 37(4), 892–912

Type: Literature review

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article reviews literature on teacher compensation policies. Wage growth among public school teachers has relied on returns to seniority, where teachers are rewarded for years of teaching experience and education credentials. Research suggests the wage tenure profile of teachers is comparable to that of white collar workers. The examination of the impact of the returns to seniority on teacher turnover suggest that while returns to seniority can impact teacher turnover, it is questioned whether the costs of teacher turnover are high enough to warrant being used as the costs reflect a significant portion of overall school resources.

## Rewarding Expertise

Author(s): Odden, A. Date: 2001

Source: *Education Next*, 1

Type: Issue paper

Full text: <http://educationnext.org/rewarding-expertise>

Abstract: The author discusses the history of a traditional teacher pay model and why it is important to change the pay structures today. He emphasizes the importance of aligning compensation with state and district standards to account for students' academic achievement. Knowledge and performance are key components of recent models that are currently being implemented. Newer compensation models, as previously implemented and followed in Cincinnati and Los Angeles, must have the full support of teachers and administrators in order for them to be successful. Teachers should be encouraged to pursue advanced degrees and supplementary professional development activities to enhance their abilities in their teaching area, which should ultimately help to increase student achievement. Principals require rigorous training to be able to conduct effective performance reviews and award appropriate incentives.

## Rewarding Teacher Excellence: A Teacher Compensation Handbook for State and Local Policy Makers

Author(s): Odden, A., & Wallace, M. Date: 2007

Source: Madison, WI: Consortium for Policy Research in Education, Wisconsin Center for Education Research, University of Wisconsin–Madison

Type: Policy paper; literature review

Full text: [http://cpre.wceruw.org/publications/TComp%20Handbook%20Feb%2028%2007%20Final%20\(3.05.07\).pdf](http://cpre.wceruw.org/publications/TComp%20Handbook%20Feb%2028%2007%20Final%20(3.05.07).pdf)

Abstract: This handbook is designed to answer various questions regarding teacher compensation. It includes discussions of salary schedules, including how to determine beginning and average salaries; bonus program structure, implementation, and sustainability; and performance measurement. The handbook is designed for state and local policymakers.

## “Show Me the Money!”

Author(s): Hopkins, G. Date: 1997

Source: *Education World*

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://www.educationworld.com/a\\_admin/admin/admin001.shtml](http://www.educationworld.com/a_admin/admin/admin001.shtml)

Abstract: This brief article focuses on teacher pay reform in the education system. Through a review of literature, the author suggests that secure funding is an important step to implementing and continuing performance pay compensation reforms. The article points toward a couple of case site examples that support this. It also suggests 10 keys to success of performance pay programs, based on a review of the literature.

## The Single Salary Schedule for Teachers in K–12 Public Schools

Author(s): Podgursky, M. Date: 2002

Source: Houston, TX: Center for Reform of School Systems

Type: Policy paper; issue paper

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This paper begins with a historical background of teacher compensation from the 1800s, when a teacher negotiated his or her pay with the local school board to the current ubiquitous single salary schedules that compensate teachers for years of service and educational attainment. Podgursky pointed out that a single pay schedule results in shortages by field. For instance, it is more difficult to recruit high school math teachers than elementary school teachers. In the single salary schedule effective and poor teachers are compensated at the same rate. The author uses data from Houston Independent School District to illustrate that high poverty schools tend to have the teachers with the least experience. Podgursky then discusses objections to merit pay. The article ends with a summary of current reforms: recruitment incentives or higher starting salaries for hard to fill positions (e.g., special education), bonuses for hard to staff schools, and merit or performance-based pay.

## Teacher and Principal Compensation: An International Review

Author(s): Sclafani, S., & Tucker, M. S. Date: 2006

Source: Washington, DC: Center for American Progress and National Center on Education and the Economy

Type: Policy paper; literature review

Full text: [http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2006/10/teacher\\_compensation.html/pdf/education\\_report.pdf](http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2006/10/teacher_compensation.html/pdf/education_report.pdf)

**Abstract:** This report examines various approaches to educator compensation from around the world—all with the intent of improving educator quality and student performance. According to the authors, many countries are addressing educator recruitment and retention issues using roughly similar compensation reform models to those being implemented in the United States. The authors examine the various incentives used to reward and retain teachers and discuss how teachers respond to new compensation models as compared to other professions. According to the evidence marshaled in this report, teachers support the same types of incentives used in other professions and claim that in order for these incentives to work, they must be structured in a way that allows them to be effective. This report is enhanced with five very detailed appendices focused on the following topics: teacher education and compensation systems, incentives in specific countries, performance-related salary systems, principal compensation systems, and the influence of unions on compensation.

## Teacher Compensation and Teacher Teaming: Sketching the Terrain

Author(s): Muncey, D., & Conley, S. Date: 1999

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 12(4), 363–385

Type: Scientific research; policy paper

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This article examines the changes in a teacher compensation system that supports teachers working in groups through three interrelated aspects: the relationship of teaming to teachers' overall work, the investment to accomplish educational teaming, and the extent to which the team aims to increase employee self-management and self-governance. Drawing from the concepts of work teams in the general organization literature, the authors discuss two major forms of teacher teams: interdisciplinary and grade-level. The authors provide examples of pay practices in schools that support teacher teaming. These teacher compensation options were conceptualized on a continuum. Compensation as a primary motivator for teachers in a teaming arrangement does not yet exist. There also are differences in how teachers and administrators view compensation in the context of teaming. The authors also suggest ways to increase the likelihood of maintaining teacher teaming practice.

## Teacher Compensation in Charter and Private Schools: Snapshots and Lessons for District Public Schools

Author(s): Kowal, J., Hassel, E. A., & Hassel, B. C. Date: 2007

Source: Washington, DC: Center for American Progress

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2007/02/pdf/teacher\\_compensation.pdf](http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2007/02/pdf/teacher_compensation.pdf)

**Abstract:** To further explore the debate about teacher compensation reform, this report draws from examples from charter and private schools. Both have historically been exempt from the compensation rules and regulations used in public schools and have utilized more radical forms of teacher compensation when compared to public schools. Charter and private schools rely much less on salary schedules than do public schools. As a result, these entities have more control over their budgets, so they are afforded a greater flexibility in determining teacher pay. The authors suggest many charter and private schools use some form of performance pay and they go on to examine the impact of these programs.

## Teacher Incentives in the Developing World

Author(s): Glewwe, P., Holla, A., & Kremer, M. Date: 2008

Source: Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Department of Economics

Type: Policy paper; literature review

Full text: [http://www.economics.harvard.edu/faculty/kremer/files/KntchinV9\\_080915.pdf](http://www.economics.harvard.edu/faculty/kremer/files/KntchinV9_080915.pdf)

**Abstract:** This report is a study that was conducted to survey education policies that are designed to improve teacher quality in several developing countries. The report examined education policies designed to improve working conditions, incentives for increased teacher attendance and incentives for increased student achievement, and human resources policies that prohibit local schools from making hiring decisions. The study also examines the ability of local education systems to communicate with the community regarding student achievement, teacher quality, and other education issues. The report concludes with recommendations for addressing the various teacher quality education policy issues in developing countries.

## Teacher Pay and 21st Century School Reform

Author(s): Hess, F., & Castle, J. Date: 2008

Source: In T. L. Good (Ed.), *21st Century Education: A Reference Handbook* (pp. 68–75). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications

Type: Literature review

Full text: [http://www.aei.org/docLib/20081211\\_TeacherPayHess.pdf](http://www.aei.org/docLib/20081211_TeacherPayHess.pdf)

Abstract: This issue paper, one chapter of the book “21st Century Education: A Reference Handbook,” provides a historical perspective on the teacher salary schedule and discusses various arguments and perspectives regarding teacher pay. Originally, the uniform salary scale was instituted among the teaching force to equalize pay for males and females and to further “professionalize” teaching as a career choice. Although this strategy made sense when implemented, Hess and Castle explain that it does not take into account the various factors on which teacher pay should be based, such as qualifications and effectiveness. To the question of measuring these factors, the authors describe “value-added” measures in which student-level and school-level effects are controlled for, such that only teacher effects are estimated. Finally, the authors engage in a brief discussion on the merits of teacher pensions.

## Teacher Pay for Performance Gaining Ground

Author(s): Smith-Mello, M. Date: 2007

Source: *Policy Notes*, 22. Frankfort, KY: Kentucky Long-Term Policy Research Center

Type: Issue paper; policy paper

Full text: [http://www.kltprc.net/policynotes/pn0022\\_teacher\\_pay.pdf](http://www.kltprc.net/policynotes/pn0022_teacher_pay.pdf)

Abstract: This report details a discussion about the growing support for teacher pay-for-performance programs as a mechanism to reward teachers. Pay-for-performance programs emphasize the role of the teacher in improved student achievement. The use of student achievement data to make compensation decisions has grown such that many states and districts have experimented with different forms of alternative compensation. The article discusses these experiments, including details about their funding and implementation, and early research findings on their impact on student achievement.

## Teacher Performance Pay: A Review

Author(s): Podgursky, M. J., & Springer, M. G. Date: 2006

Source: Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University, National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Research review and books

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This working paper examined the “economic case” for performance-related pay in K–12 education. The first part of the review was a history of compensation models from the grade-based model to the current single-salary schedule, currently ubiquitous in the U.S. educational system. The authors reviewed the theoretical arguments involving performance-related pay (e.g., performance, monitoring, team production) followed by a review of several performance-based programs in Denver, Texas, and Minnesota, as well as programs supported by the Milkin Family Foundation, and the U.S. Department of Education’s Teacher Incentive Fund. The paper concluded with a review of empirical research on performance-based pay. The authors concluded that the methodologies employed by empirical studies on performance-based pay were extremely diverse. Consequently, they were unable to draw any general conclusions from them. They recommended rigorous program evaluations of programs as they are implemented.

## Teacher Salaries and State Priorities for Education Quality: A Vital Link

Author(s): Gaines, G. F. Date: 2000

Source: Atlanta, GA: Southern Regional Education Board (Educational Benchmarks 2000 Series)

Type: Policy paper

Full text: URL not available.

**Abstract:** This report reviews the pay structures for teachers to illustrate how salary policies support (or do not support) state priorities for education. The major issues addressed in this report are goals that Southern Regional Education Board states have set for teacher salaries, lessons that states have learned about linking teacher salaries to performance and accountability, how competitive teacher salaries are, the effects of supply and demand on teacher compensation, and states' efforts to recruit and retain quality teachers. Three major challenges are teacher shortages in certain subjects, too few teacher-education graduates getting into teaching, and accountability programs that raise the stakes for getting a quality teacher in every classroom. Finally, the author suggests directions for state policymakers to improve teachers' salary policies that promote student achievement and quality teaching. State leaders should continue to support salary goals, take actions that encourage good teachers to remain in teaching, conduct systematic reviews of supply and demand and teacher compensation, develop a method to check competitiveness of teacher salaries to address specific needs in salary decisions, and develop a plan for tying salary decisions to student achievement and accountability.

## Title 2.0: Revamping The Federal Role in Education Human Capital

Author(s): Rotherham, A. J. Date: 2008

Source: Washington, DC: Education Sector

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://www.educationsector.org/usr\\_doc/Title\\_2.pdf](http://www.educationsector.org/usr_doc/Title_2.pdf)

**Abstract:** In this issue paper disseminated by Education Sector, author Andrew Rotherham explains the ways in which Title II funds could be better allocated to increase spending on human capital in education. According to Rotherham, "there is little evidence that [Title II] funds are driving the sort of changes needed to help schools recruit, train, place, induct, and compensate quality teachers or changes that are aligned with broader human capital reform efforts in education" (p. 1). Given the recent change in federal government administration, Rotherham believes that school and district officials have an opportunity to adjust funding to funnel more money into the recruitment and retention of high-quality, highly effective teachers.

## Understanding Alternative Teacher Compensation

Author(s): USC California Policy Institute Date: 2005

Source: *Expert Insights From USC California Policy Institute's California K-12 School Finance Policy Symposium*.  
Sacramento, CA: USC California Policy Institute

Type: Research reviews and books; issue paper

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This paper reviews research on alternative compensation for teachers. This paper is derived from the California K-12 School Finance Policy Symposium and a roundtable discussion on the subject. The research review contends that the current method of compensating teachers, the single-salary schedule, is outmoded and not aligned to the goal of improving student achievement. The research finds that designing and implementing alternative systems is complex, however with careful planning, changes can be effectively made.

## Why Merit Pay Will Improve Teaching

Author(s): Malanga, S. Date: 2001, summer

Source: *City Journal*

Type: Policy paper; issue paper

Full text: [http://www.city-journal.org/html/11\\_3\\_why\\_merit\\_pay.html](http://www.city-journal.org/html/11_3_why_merit_pay.html)

**Abstract:** This article argues that merit pay for teachers will improve classroom performance by comparing the current debates among educators to the 1980s debates among private sector employees (whereby performance seemingly increased as a result of a new merit pay structure). In addition to evidence from American industry, the author includes information from evaluation experts that suggests teacher performance can be objectively measured and thereby performance should be linked to pay. The author marshals examples of teacher merit pay programs from both the state and district levels, including a discussion on the role of teachers unions, to demonstrate the emerging interest in performance-based pay for teachers and the promise of this approach for improving student achievement. The article concludes by briefly discussing the importance of using merit pay to improve teacher performance and claims that without it, student learning will suffer. Finally, a short case summary highlighting the use of merit pay in private schools is presented.

---

## Compensation and Teacher Recruitment and Retention

### Adding the Critical Voice: A Dialogue With Practicing Teachers on Teacher Recruitment and Retention in Hard-to-Staff Schools

Author(s): Shapiro, S. K., & Laine, S. W. M. Date: 2005

Source: Naperville, IL: Learning Point Associates

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: In 2005, Learning Point Associates performed a small qualitative study to hear from teachers themselves about incentives. Researchers convened several focus groups of teachers, in which the educators were asked to comment on incentives that, in their opinions, worked best to attract high-quality teachers to hard-to-staff schools. The focus groups concluded that a focused and supportive administration can be the greatest incentive of all and that high-quality mentoring would serve to recruit teachers to at-risk schools. Finally, the report stresses the group's ambivalent feelings about merit pay schemes.

### Addressing the Teacher Qualification Gap: Exploring the Use and Efficacy of Incentives to Reward Teachers for Tough Assignments

Author(s): Goldhaber, D. Date: 2008

Source: Washington, DC: Center for American Progress

Type: Policy paper; literature review

Full text: [http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2008/11/pdf/teacher\\_qualification\\_gap.pdf](http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2008/11/pdf/teacher_qualification_gap.pdf)

Abstract: This policy brief presents the issue of teacher quality and qualifications through the lens of labor-market economics. The author cites previous research studies that have shown the inequitable distribution of highly qualified teachers in at-risk areas and schools and then uses the socioeconomic demographics of the students at those schools to show that, in general, the poorest students are being taught by the least qualified teachers. He uses this argument to make the case for increased teacher incentives in hard-to-staff areas and references several examples of incentives policies in action, such as the Teacher Education Assistance for College and Higher Education grant program.

### Alternative Wages and Teacher Mobility: A Human Capital Approach

Author(s): Rickman, B. D., & Parker, C. D. Date: 1990

Source: *Economics of Education Review*, 9(1), 73–79

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study used data about 636 teachers to estimate the effect of the wage differential between teaching and alternative occupations on teacher retention. The authors estimated two predicted alternative wages: the average wage of occupations into which teachers in the Current Population Survey (CPS) often report moving and the average wage for all occupations in the CPS. Teacher retention was significantly linked to wage differentials. Using the first predicted alternative wage, the authors found that a 1.0 percent increase in the wage differential was associated with a 2.11 percent reduction in the probability that a teacher would quit teaching, while a 1.0 percent increase in the more general predicted wage was associated with a 1.75 percent reduction in the quit probability. The difference between teachers' responses to the two alternative wages indicates that teachers are more sensitive to changes in salaries of occupations they are most likely to enter than to changes in general salaries.

### An Analysis of Occupational Change and Departure From the Labor Force: Evidence of the Reasons That Teachers Leave

Author(s): Stinebrickner, T. R. Date: 2002

Source: *The Journal of Human Resources*, 37(1), 193–216

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study examined the length of first teaching spells—periods of uninterrupted employment—using data from the National Longitudinal Survey of the High School Class of 1972. Separate proportional hazards models were estimated for 313 female teachers and 772 female nonteachers who were tracked through 1986. In the sample of teachers, the most important determinant of exit from teaching was the presence of a newborn child in the household. The study found that two thirds of the females who left teaching also left the full-time workforce altogether, suggesting that they were not lured away by higher wages in other professions.

### An Analysis of the Factors Affecting the Supply and Demand for Teacher Quality

Author(s): Galchus, K. E. Date: 1994

Source: *Journal of Economics and Finance*, 18(2), 165–178

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study used data on public schools in 75 Arkansas counties to investigate the supply and demand for teacher quality, as measured by the countywide teacher pass rate on a mandatory test of basic skills administered in 1985. The authors estimated county-level demand for teacher quality using educational level, median income, and race and ethnicity of the population; the school property tax rate; and spending on teacher salaries and other educational factors. They found that average teacher salaries had a significant negative effect on demand for teacher quality and a significant positive effect on supply. The percentage of whites and college graduates in a county was positively associated with demand for teacher quality. Demand was price-inelastic, while supply was much more elastic. Higher student achievement and lower population density were associated with greater teacher quality on the supply side, suggesting that counties most in need of quality teachers had the most difficulty attracting those teachers.

### Analyzing the Determinants of the Matching of Public School Teachers to Jobs: Estimating Compensating Differentials in Imperfect Labor Markets

Author(s): Boyd, D., Lankford, H., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. Date: 2003

Source: *Working Paper No. 9878*. Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: [http://www-cpr.maxwell.syr.edu/efap/Jerry\\_Miner/Lankford.pdf](http://www-cpr.maxwell.syr.edu/efap/Jerry_Miner/Lankford.pdf)

Abstract: This paper investigates the appropriate way to mathematically study how teacher and district choices affect the distribution of qualified teachers between schools, using data from New York. The authors found that distance from home is an important factor in determining which jobs teachers take. Other job selection factors important to teachers are salary and the number of minority students in the school or district. The authors suggest that districts prefer teachers with higher test scores who attended more selective colleges. They argue that the proportion of minority students in a school may really be a proxy for other factors such as working conditions that often are not measured.

## Can Pay Incentives Improve the Recruitment and Retention of Teachers in America's Hard-to-Staff Schools? A Research Summary

Author(s): Wheeler, J., & Glennie, E. Date: 2007

Source: Durham, NC: Center for Child and Family Policy, Duke University, Terry Sanford Institute of Public Policy

Type: Literature review

Full text: <http://www.childandfamilypolicy.duke.edu/pdfs/pubpres/Incentives.pdf>

Abstract: This article investigates whether providing incentives in hard-to-staff schools will increase teacher recruitment and retention. The article offers examples of recruitment and retention bonuses currently being used across the United States. In addition, the article provides a more extensive look at a district recruitment initiative in Charlotte-Mecklenburg, North Carolina. Finally, the article provides a brief summary of the research currently available on teacher recruitment and retention incentives and a look at how incentives are viewed depending on age, gender, and race.

## Can Public Schools Buy Better-Qualified Teachers?

Author(s): Figlio, D. N. Date: 2002

Source: *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*, 55(4), 686–697

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study examined the effect of a districtwide increase in teacher salaries on the credentials and qualifications of newly hired teachers in the district. Using data from the Schools and Staffing Survey on 2,672 teachers in 188 school districts, the authors found that districts that unilaterally raised teacher salaries relative to other districts within their county experienced a significant increase in the quality of new teacher hires, as measured by average SAT scores of teachers' undergraduate alma maters and by whether teachers have undergraduate majors and/or master's degrees in the subject that they teach. Raising salaries by one standard deviation, or approximately 10 percent, increased average alma mater SAT scores by one third of a standard deviation, or 12 SAT points. For subject matter preparation, the effect of increasing salaries was significantly greater in nonunion districts than in unionized districts.

## Career Paths and Quit Decisions: Evidence From Teaching

Author(s): Brewer, D. J. Date: 1996

Source: *Journal of Labor Economics*, 14(2), 313–339

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study probed the influence of teachers' future career opportunities—particularly those in school administration—on their decisions to leave their districts. The author used longitudinal data, tracking more than 5,000 teachers in New York state (excluding New York City) between 1975–76 and 1989–90, and estimated a discrete time hazard model. For women, a teacher's current salary was negatively associated with her probability of leaving her district, while for men higher alternative rewards in the form of teacher salaries outside their district increased the likelihood of leaving. Higher administrative salaries in the district did not have a significant effect on women's leave decisions, but reduced the likelihood that men would leave.

## Compensation Policies and Teacher Decisions

Author(s): Stinebrickner, T. R. Date: 2001

Source: *International Economic Review*, 42(3), 751–779

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study examines the occupational decisions of individuals certified to teach using a dynamic, discrete choice, utility maximizing model. The study used data from a sample of 551 individuals who became certified to teach between 1975 and 1985 and participated in the National Longitudinal Survey of the High School Class of 1972. An analytic framework was used to model the effects of possible changes in teacher salary policy. One policy would provide pay raises of 20 percent to all teachers, while another policy would use the same amount of money but would target raises to those with higher academic ability. The models suggested that the two policies would increase the overall supply of teachers by equal amounts, but the second policy would increase the proportion of teachers with high SAT scores.

## The Distribution of Salary Increments and Its Effect on Teacher Retention

Author(s): Jacobson, S. L. Date: 1988

Source: *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 24(2), 178–199

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study used data on 57 school districts in two regions of New York state to examine the effect of internal salary distribution on teacher retention. Districts with high salaries at the midcareer level relative to surrounding districts had better retention in the suburban region, while districts with high relative salaries at the senior level had the highest retention in the rural region. Retention of female teachers was more strongly linked to relative salaries than was retention of male teachers. The author suggests that the popular practice of backloading salary increments to the advantage of senior teachers is not the most efficient allocation of resources to promote teacher retention. Because teachers are most likely to leave teaching within the first five to seven years, districts with the most attractive midcareer salaries target economic incentives to teachers at the point in their careers when they are most likely to migrate or leave, which may account for improved retention rates.

## Do School Accountability Systems Make It More Difficult for Low-Performing Schools to Attract and Retain High-Quality Teachers?

Author(s): Clotfelter, C. T., Ladd, H. F., Vigdor, J. L., & Diaz, R. A. Date: 2004

Source: *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 23(2), 251–271

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study uses North Carolina state administrative data to examine the recruitment and retention of teachers before and after the implementation of the state's accountability system. The authors found that the implementation of the accountability system slightly increased the probability a teacher would leave a school and that teaching in a low-performing school increased that probability by about 25 percent. However, being low-performing in the era of school accountability did not make it more difficult for that school to attract an experienced teacher or one prepared at competitive college. Also, the authors found that statewide policy initiatives (including raising salaries) to increase the quality of teachers are associated with an overall increase in the experience level of teachers. After the implementation of the accountability system, there was not an absolute decline in the number of experienced teachers working in low-performing schools, which may be the result of the statewide efforts to increase teacher quality. The authors recommend that policymakers consider the effect of accountability systems on low-performing schools' ability to retain teachers when implementing accountability systems.

## An Econometric Analysis of Teacher Mobility

Author(s): Bempah, E. O., Kaylen, M. S., Osburn, D. D., & Birkenholz, R. J. Date: 1994

Source: *Economics of Education Review*, 13(1), 69–77

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study examined the relationship between new teacher mobility and teacher and school district characteristics. It also sought to determine the relationship between teachers' annual earnings and selected demographic and geographic variables. A simultaneous equation model was estimated using data from 358 respondents to a survey mailed to all beginning teachers in Missouri in 1989; the response rate was 22 percent. Home ownership by teachers and the leadership style of school administrators were the most important predictors of teacher mobility. Earnings of teachers who did not change districts were related to education, gender, and the combination of the willingness and ability of the community to pay for education. Results concerning the earnings of teachers who did change districts were inconclusive.

## The Effects of Salaries and Opportunity Costs on Duration in Teaching: Evidence From Michigan

Author(s): Murnane, R. J., & Olsen, R. J. Date: 1989

Source: *Review of Economics and Statistics*, 71(2), 347–352

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study used longitudinal data about 7,852 Michigan teachers, tracked for at least 10 years, to examine the influence of salaries and opportunity costs on the length of teaching spells. Teachers earning high salaries stayed in teaching significantly longer than other teachers, though a fixed effects model reduced this effect by one third. The authors speculated that this might be because some differences in salary compensate for differences in working conditions and the fixed effects model controls better for school contexts. Salary differences between districts also were strongly and significantly associated with differences in teaching spell duration. Observed school district demographic characteristics such as poverty rates, racial makeup, median family income, and median family education accounted for little of this difference, which may indicate the importance of district practices such as support for beginning teachers. The authors also found that teachers with better paying alternative careers, particularly physics and chemistry teachers, left teaching sooner than other teachers, as did teachers aged 30 or younger when they started teaching and white teachers.

## The Effects of Salaries and Opportunity Costs on Length of Stay in Teaching: Evidence From North Carolina

Author(s): Murnane, R. J., & Olsen, R. J. Date: 1990

Source: *The Journal of Human Resources*, 25(1), 106–124

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study examined the length of stay in teaching for teachers who began their careers in North Carolina from 1975 to 1984. Generalized least squares models with fixed effects, time-varying covariates, and censored observations were estimated using longitudinal state data on 13,890 teachers. Higher salaries were found to be associated with longer periods of teaching. Teachers with higher opportunity costs as measured by subject specialties and test scores were more likely to leave teaching than other teachers. For example, high school chemistry and physics teachers had the shortest periods of employment. Teachers with higher test scores were less influenced to stay in teaching by higher salaries than were teachers with lower test scores.

## The Effects of School District Spending Priorities on Length of Stay in Teaching

Author(s): Gritz, R. M., & Theobald, N. D. Date: 1996

Source: *Journal of Human Resources*, 31(3), 477–512

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research, state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study examined the relationship between district spending priorities and attrition among inexperienced teachers. Using data on 9,756 white teachers in Washington state who began teaching between 1981 and 1990, the authors found that beginning teachers work for shorter periods of time in districts that spend more on central administration or on classified staff involved in teaching activities. Raising spending without raising salaries will have little effect on retention, but may be linked to higher attrition if spending is targeted at classified staff only. For female teachers, attrition from a district was most influenced by teaching salaries in other districts, while for male teachers attrition was related to salaries in occupations outside teaching.

## Eight Questions on Teacher Recruitment and Retention: What Does the Research Say?

### A Summary of the Findings

Author(s): Allen, M. Date: 2005

Source: Denver, CO: Education Commission of the States

Type: Issue paper; literature review

Full text: <http://www.ecs.org/clearinghouse/64/58/6458.pdf>

Abstract: This report reviews the body of research addressing teacher recruitment and retention to ascertain what evidence the research truly provides and what its implications are for policy. The report is based on a review of 91 studies selected, using rigorous criteria, from more than 300 originally considered. These studies were used to answer eight questions about teacher recruitment and retention of particular importance to policy and to education leaders. This report is the second in a series of reports on teaching quality. The first report on teacher preparation is available at <http://www.ecs.org/tpreport/>. The third, focusing on research regarding teacher licensure and certification, was released in October 2005.

### An Event History Analysis of Teacher Attrition: Salary, Teacher Tracking, and Socially Disadvantaged Schools

Author(s): Kelly, S. Date: 2004

Source: *The Journal of Experimental Education*, 72(3), 195–220

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study uses event history analysis of a school and staffing survey to determine how different factors such as salary and school behavioral climate affect the retention of teachers throughout the teacher's career. The researcher found that individual characteristics, such as teaching science and being fully certified, are more important factors in attrition than district or school factors, such as salary, school size, and the behavioral climate of a school. The evidence suggests that the poverty level and ethnicity of students in a school are less important to teacher attrition than the behavioral climate. Finally, despite the fact that teachers assigned to teach lower track classes are less satisfied, their attrition rate is not higher than other teachers.

### An Examination of the Influence of Personal, Professional, and School District Characteristics on Public School Teacher Retention

Author(s): Theobald, N. D. Date: 1990

Source: *Economics of Education Review*, 9(3), 241–250

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study used data on more than 37,000 teachers in Washington state to examine the factors contributing to teachers' decisions to continue teaching in the same school district or to pursue alternative opportunities. Greater experience and higher expected salary in the next year were both associated with "stay" decisions. Young and old teachers were most likely to leave their schools, but this relationship between age and retention differed somewhat by gender, as older female teachers were more likely to stay than older male teachers. Male teachers with master's degrees were significantly more likely to leave than other male teachers. Finally, contrary to other research, the authors found that teachers in "wealthy" high-assessed property value districts were more likely to leave than teachers in other districts.

## An Exploration of the Pay Levels Needed to Attract Students With Mathematics, Science, and Technology Skills to a Career in K–12 Teaching

Author(s): Milanowski, A. Date: 2003

Source: *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 11(50)

Type: Policy paper; scientific research

Full text: <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaa/v11n50/v11n50.pdf>

Abstract: This article examines the use of financial incentives in attracting STEM teachers into schools. The researcher uses focus group and survey data to study teacher attitudes toward current pay levels. The findings suggest that STEM university students might be attracted to teaching if beginning teacher salaries were higher. Entry-level salaries would not have to be increased to match the private sector; however, salaries would have to be 5 to 10 percent higher to attract a majority of the survey and focus group respondents.

## Financial Incentives for Hard-to-Staff Positions: Cross-Sector Lessons for Public Education

Author(s): Kowal, J., Hassel, B. C., & Hassel, E. A. Date: 2008

Source: Washington, DC: Center for American Progress

Type: Literature review; policy paper

Full text: [http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2008/11/pdf/hard\\_to\\_staff.pdf](http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2008/11/pdf/hard_to_staff.pdf)

Abstract: In this policy brief, staff writers provide a literature review of current research and materials focused on the human capital management strategy of providing fiscal incentives to recruit teachers to hard-to-staff schools and hard-to-fill subject areas within those schools. In the brief, “hard-to-fill subject areas” are defined as mathematics and science. The authors conduct an analysis of incentives of this sort in both the private and public sectors and present a series of policy implications for school districts and state education agencies. Among them are the following: incentives should be provided as a bundled package, including loan repayment plans, housing allowances, and salary supplements; a performance-pay component can help elevate the attractiveness of a hard-to-staff school; although school officials at the top should determine which schools qualify as hard-to-staff, administrators within those specific schools should have discretion over the amounts and distribution of awards.

## Higher Pay in Hard-to-Staff Schools: The Case for Financial Incentives

Author(s): Prince, C. D. Date: 2002

Source: Arlington, VA: American Association of School Administrators

Type: Case study; information guide; perspective piece

Full text: [http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content\\_storage\\_01/0000019b/80/1a/4e/aa.pdf](http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/0000019b/80/1a/4e/aa.pdf)

Abstract: This report argues that differentiated pay is needed to address the challenge of recruiting and retaining teachers for high-needs schools. The author describes the evidence showing that teachers respond to financial incentives and reviews research showing that teacher mobility patterns disadvantage high-needs schools. After discussing the views of teachers unions, the second section of the report describes several different ways to design financial incentives based on recent examples. The report ends with lessons learned from existing efforts to differentiate pay for high-needs schools and a list of relevant resources on the Internet.

## How Principals Can Attract Teachers to the Middle Grades

Author(s): Carter, M. S., & Carter, C. M. Date: 2000

Source: *Schools in the Middle*, 9(8), 23–25

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study explored the attitudes of teacher education majors concerning the possible choice to teach in middle school grades. Tabulations from a survey of 170 teacher candidates from North Carolina and Virginia were presented and discussed. Only nine percent of the respondents expressed an interest in middle school education. Concerns about classroom discipline and perceptions of adolescent attitudes were the main reasons given for not choosing middle school education. Respondents listed monetary incentives, smaller classes, strict discipline plans, scholarships, and waiver of licensure requirements as factors that might increase their motivation to teach in the middle grades.

## How Teaching Conditions Predict Teacher Turnover in California Schools

Author(s): Loeb, S., Darling-Hammond, L., & Luczak, J. Date: 2005

Source: *Peabody Journal of Education*, 80(3), 44–70

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study used telephone surveys of teachers combined with state administrative data to examine the relationships between teaching conditions and various measures of school turnover (i.e., perceptions of school vacancies as well as derived measures of turnover). The researchers found that turnover is predicted by both schools student characteristics (e.g., poverty, race) and working conditions (e.g., class size, facilities, multitrack schools, salary, lack of textbooks). The researchers argue that improving working conditions can serve to offset the influence of student characteristics on school turnover. Policy recommendations focus on increasing resources available to schools serving low-income and minority students in order to improve working conditions and salaries.

## The Impact of Salary Differentials on Teacher Shortages and Turnover: The Case of Mathematics and Science Teachers

Author(s): Rumberger, R. Date: 1987

Source: *Economics of Education Review*, 6(4), 389–399

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study used data about 453 school districts in large metropolitan areas to examine the relationship between teacher salaries and salaries in alternative careers and teacher turnover among mathematics and science teachers. The author found that every \$1,000 difference between average teacher salaries and average engineering salaries in a district was associated with a significant 0.19 percentage point increase in teacher shortages, measured as the percentage of mathematics and science teachers who were uncertified. Higher district teacher salaries and higher engineering salaries for women were associated with reduced teacher turnover in most states.

## Improving the Distribution of Teachers in Low-Performing High Schools

Author(s): Alliance for Excellent Education Date: 2008

Source: Washington, DC: Alliance for Excellent Education

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.all4ed.org/files/TeachDist\\_PolicyBrief.pdf](http://www.all4ed.org/files/TeachDist_PolicyBrief.pdf)

Abstract: This policy paper examines the national problem of the inequitable distribution of teachers in low-performing high schools. The paper proceeds to examine teacher qualifications, teacher effectiveness, teacher labor markets, and recruitment strategies. The paper concludes by offering federal policy recommendations that are designed to address the inequitable distribution of teachers in high schools.

## The Influences of Salaries and “Opportunity Costs” on Teachers’ Career Choices: Evidence From North Carolina

Author(s): Murnane, R. J., Singer, J. D., & Willett, J. B. Date: 1989

Source: *Harvard Educational Review*, 59(3), 325–346

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study examined the relationship between the probability of leaving teaching and teacher salary and opportunity costs. Conditional hazard models were estimated using state data on 5,100 white teachers who began their careers in North Carolina from 1976 to 1978. For secondary teachers, the likelihood of leaving teaching was higher in the first years of teaching; among physics, chemistry, and biology teachers; and among teachers with higher NTE scores. Higher salaries were associated with longer careers in teaching. Elementary teachers had lower attrition than secondary teachers. Elementary teachers were more likely to leave the profession if they had lower salaries and higher NTE scores.

## Market-Based Pay Reform for Public School Teachers

Author(s): Podgursky, M. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Literature review

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Podgursky\\_2008.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Podgursky_2008.pdf)

Abstract: This paper is a study of the teacher labor market, focusing on the effect of personnel economics on teacher compensation. The author first analyzes the traditional single salary schedule, pinpointing areas for compensation reform based on inefficiency in the market. The paper uses these areas for change to argue for compensation reform, specifically a move toward performance-based pay.

## Monetary Incentives and the Reform of Teacher Compensation: A Persistent Organizational Dilemma

Author(s): Jacobson, S. L. Date: 1995

Source: *International Journal of Educational Reform*, 4(1), 29–35

Type: Policy paper

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** The use of monetary incentives in the private sector is based on the basic economic assumption that workers will increase their level of effort if they believe their rewards will increase accordingly. The application of monetary incentives to education assumes that teachers are subject to the same income and leisure substitution effects as workers in other careers. Merit-pay plans have been tried in public education, but their use has always been short-lived. This article examines the conflicting values that underlie debates about the reform of teacher compensation. The author examines the effects of monetary incentives on teacher recruitment, retention, and absence, focusing on the conflicts in personal and organizational values that cause problems in teacher compensation. The author points out that while monetary incentives can influence teacher recruitment, retention, and attendance, their use tends to conflict with personal and societal expectations of what a good teacher is and wants.

## Netting an Elusive Breed

Author(s): Warner, M. R. Date: 2004

Source: *Education Next*, 4

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20044\\_38.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20044_38.pdf)

**Abstract:** In this article, Virginia Governor Mark Warner explores strategies aimed in recruiting and retaining high-quality teachers. Innovative policies must be developed to help address teacher shortages. Incentive programs, as well as professional development/training programs can all be used to attract and keep performing teachers in the classroom. An example of policies Governor Warner implemented was the Partnership for Achieving Successful Schools (PASS) initiative which provided assistance to low-performing school by dispatching, academic, business, and community resources to these schools.

## The New Economics of Teachers and Education

Author(s): Flyer, F., & Rosen, S. Date: 1997

Source: *Journal of Labor Economics*, 15(1, part 2), S104–S139

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study investigated the teacher labor market from both a demand and supply perspective. The authors used data from the NCES Digest of Education Statistics, the Schools and Staffing Survey, the National Longitudinal Study of Youth, and the Current Population Survey. Decreases in the number of students per teacher have been a major factor in the rise in education costs since 1960. Increased female labor market participation contributed to the substitution of public sector time inputs (e.g., more teachers, aides) for household time inputs (e.g., stay-at-home moms), and so accounted for 22 percent of the increase in teacher–student ratios. On the supply side, the authors found that when workplace experience and education are controlled, teacher salaries declined somewhat relative to the wages of other college graduates. However, teachers who return to work after taking time off do not face wage penalties for the interruption as great as those faced by women who take time off in other careers, which helps to attract many women despite the declining teacher salaries.

### No Teacher Left Behind: Results of a Five-Year Study of Teacher Attrition

Author(s): Harrell, P., Leavell, A., van Tassel, F., & McKee, K. Date: 2004

Source: *Action in Teacher Education*, 26(2), 47–59

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study mailed a self-report survey about teacher retention in the occupation to all 2,388 possible respondents, representing all teachers certified by the University of North Texas between 1995 and 2000. After a follow-up to nonresponders, 43 percent of all surveys were returned. The survey asked whether respondents had remained in teaching and about factors that might affect retention in the field. Of those responding, 79.1 percent remained in teaching. The four top reasons for leaving teaching were income, discipline problems, leaving to raise a family, and problems with parents.

### Profile of Utah Teachers Leaving the Teaching Profession

Author(s): Allred, W. E., & Smith, R. B. Date: 1984

Source: *Rural Educator*, 5(3), 2–5

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study profiles characteristics of teachers in Utah who left their school during or immediately following the school year. Survey data were collected from 233 teachers from 30 rural districts and 834 teachers from 10 urban districts. Additional data came from district personnel files. Researchers found that teachers in rural districts were more likely to leave their districts than were teachers in the urban districts. Most teachers who left rural districts were elementary teachers in Grades 1–3, were inexperienced, and held only a bachelor's degree. Maternity was the most frequently cited reason for leaving during the school year, while salary concerns were the most frequently cited reason for leaving after the school year.

### Putting Teacher Labor Markets in Context: A Comparison of Turnover Across Professions and Industries

Author(s): Harris, D., & Adams, S. J. Date: 2003

Source: Washington, DC: Economic Policy Institute

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study compared turnover in teaching and in other professions and occupations with similar characteristics. Using data on nearly 17,000 individuals from the March Current Population Survey for 1992 through 2001, the authors found that turnover is higher among teachers than among nurses or accountants, but lower than among social workers, all college graduates, and all workers.

## A Qualitative Critique of Teacher Labor Market Studies

**Author(s):** Berry, B., Noblit, G. W., & Hare, R. D. **Date:** 1985

**Source:** *Urban Review*, 17(2), 98–110

**Type:** Scientific research; state or regional reports

**Full text:** URL not available

**Abstract:** This study used case studies of six universities and six school districts in the Southeast to analyze recruitment and retention decisions of teacher education programs, teachers, and school administrators. The authors found that neither universities nor school districts exerted much effort in recruiting teachers. School administrators pointed out qualities beyond academic excellence that they value in teachers and that influence hiring decisions, such as relating to children and parents, being involved in school extracurricular activities, and fitting into the community. Teachers reported that their mobility decisions often were related to family, with urban teachers bound to nuclear families and rural teachers bound to extended family. Money and career opportunities were not major influences on teachers' career decisions, but poor working conditions in schools did play a large role in teacher satisfaction.

## The Quest for Quality: Recruiting and Retaining Teachers in Philadelphia

**Author(s):** Neild, R. C., Useem, E., & Farley, E. **Date:** 2005

**Source:** Philadelphia: Research for Action

**Type:** Scientific research; state or regional reports

**Full text:** [http://pdf.researchforaction.org/rfapdf/publication/pdf\\_file/226/Neild\\_R\\_Quest\\_for\\_Quality\\_ES.pdf](http://pdf.researchforaction.org/rfapdf/publication/pdf_file/226/Neild_R_Quest_for_Quality_ES.pdf)

**Abstract:** This study draws on district personnel data, teacher surveys, interviews, focus groups, and observations to describe and evaluate Philadelphia's efforts to recruit and retain teachers as well as other teacher-related issues. About 40 percent of teachers who entered the district in 1999 remained four years later, with lower retention in middle schools and high-poverty schools; however, high-poverty elementary schools had higher retention. There is evidence that teachers who entered in 2003 have higher retention rates, which may be due to the district's new induction program. Retention in schools managed by external providers (e.g., Edison) dropped after schools were taken over and has increased in the second year after takeover. That said, retention after two years in externally managed schools has not returned to pretakeover levels. Recruitment efforts appear to have increased applications by 44 percent, with one third of new teachers reporting that financial incentives were important to their applying to the district and more than 500 applicants coming through alternative preparation programs. Current expanded induction efforts and future plans to implement a new teacher contract and hiring process are described. Continuing challenges to recruitment and retention include working conditions, continued use of underprepared teachers in special education, implementation of No Child Left Behind highly qualified requirements, many new teachers stating the intention to teach for only a few years, and the cost of recruitment and retention efforts.

## Recruiting and Retaining Quality Teachers for High-Needs Schools: Insights From NBCT Summits and Other Policy Initiatives

Author(s): Berry, B., Rasberry, M., & Williams, A. Date: n.d.

Source: Hillsborough, NC: Center for Teaching Quality

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.teachingquality.org/legacy/Nat\\_Strategy\\_Forum.pdf](http://www.teachingquality.org/legacy/Nat_Strategy_Forum.pdf)

Abstract: This policy brief provides an informal case study of innovative recruitment and retention strategies for National Board Certified Teachers in five different states: North Carolina, Ohio, Oklahoma, South Carolina, and Washington. These strategies are targeted specifically toward teachers who are certified by the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (NBCTs) due to overwhelming evidence that “poor children and those of color are far less likely to be taught by qualified teachers” (p. 1). With this in mind, the incentives discussed in this paper are aimed at attracting NBCTs to high-needs and high-risk schools. The recommendations in this brief come directly from NBCT summits held nationwide during which these highly qualified teachers collaborate with policymakers to find solutions to the qualified teacher shortage.

## Recruiting and Retaining Teachers in Alabama: Educators on What It Will Take to Staff All Classrooms With Quality Teachers

Author(s): Hirsch, E. Date: 2006

Source: Hillsborough, NC: Center for Teaching Quality

Type: Case study; scientific research

Full text: [http://www.teachingquality.org/legacy/al\\_recruitretain.pdf](http://www.teachingquality.org/legacy/al_recruitretain.pdf)

Abstract: This report synthesizes information gathered from a teacher survey in Alabama’s Mobile County, Talladega County, and Hoover County. The report is designed to offer insight into how policymakers can improve incentive initiatives and school conditions within Alabama’s schools. Respondents agreed that financial incentives are important, which include relocation and housing subsidies as well as signing and retention bonuses. The report also offers recommendations for the Governor’s Commission, including providing teachers with a supportive school environment and allowing local districts the autonomy to target their funds to the areas that best suit their needs.

## Recruiting and Retaining Teachers With Alternative Pay

Author(s): Reichardt, R., & Van Buhler, R. Date: 2002

Source: Denver, CO: Mid-continent Research for Education and Learning

Type: Literature review; issue paper; policy paper; case study; scientific research

Full text: [http://www.mcrel.org/PDF/TeacherPrepRetention/5021RR\\_RecruitingRetainingTeachers.pdf](http://www.mcrel.org/PDF/TeacherPrepRetention/5021RR_RecruitingRetainingTeachers.pdf)

Abstract: This article investigates alternative teacher compensation systems and their link with recruiting and retaining teachers. Specifically, the researchers make a comparison between the Douglas County (Colorado) performance-pay system and the rest of the state. Using data from a variety of state sources, the researchers use statistical models to look separately at recruitment and retention. The article finds that there is a link between the performance pay programs and the retention of teachers; however, there was no evidence that they worked to attract qualified teachers.

## Recruiting Smarter Teachers

Author(s): Ballou, D., & Podgursky, M. Date: 1995

Source: *Journal of Human Resources*, 30(2), 326–338

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** In this study, the authors used an analytic model of short-term flows in and out of teaching calibrated by behavioral parameters from the National Longitudinal Survey of the High School Class of 1972 (NLS–72) survey to simulate the expected effect of a 20 percent across-the-board increase in teacher wages on the percentage of teachers from each of four SAT percentile groupings under several assumptions regarding the behavior of districts and teachers. According to their estimates, a 20 percent wage increase would increase the share of teachers with high SAT scores (86th–100th percentile) from 5.1 percent to 7.6 percent in their basic model to 9.0 percent under the assumption that districts place a great deal of weight on SAT scores and to 5.4 percent under the assumption that districts place very little weight on SAT scores. Targeted raises to only high-ability teachers would be most efficient, increasing the share of high SAT teachers to 9.2 percent. The authors argue that these changes are relatively slight and attribute this to the fact that raising wages across the board will slow the rate of exit of existing teachers, regardless of ability, from the profession. With increases in salary, the supply of teachers grows, while the number of vacancies declines; this in turn reduces the probability that high-ability candidates will invest in teacher certification, given the poor job prospects. These perverse effects will offset the positive effect of enlarging the applicant pool.

## Recruiting Teachers for Hard-to-Staff Schools: Solutions for the Southeast and the Nation

Author(s): The Southeast Center for Teaching Quality Date: 2002

Source: Chapel Hill, NC: The Southeast Center for Teaching Quality

Type: Case study; policy paper

Full text: [http://www.teachingquality.org/legacy/HTSS\\_regional.pdf](http://www.teachingquality.org/legacy/HTSS_regional.pdf)

**Abstract:** This policy paper provides an extensive list of incentives designed to assist hard-to-staff schools attract qualified and effective teachers. Some of the suggestions offered by the paper include developing Grow Your Own programs, establishing a comprehensive recruitment plan, collecting and using teacher data to inform hiring decisions, and improving working conditions. This article also offers lessons learned from the implementation of hard-to-staff school and subject incentives initiatives from other states. The article concludes with policy recommendations for both rural and urban districts struggling to attract highly qualified and effective teachers into their classrooms.

## Regional Specific Incentives for Teacher Recruitment and Retention

Author(s): Hines, D., & Mathis, K. Date: 2007

Source: Raleigh, NC: Public Schools of North Carolina, State Board of Education, Department of Public Instruction

Type: Issue paper

Full text: <http://www.dpi.state.nc.us/docs/intern-research/reports/incentives-trr.pdf>

**Abstract:** This article offers suggestions on how to recruit into rural, hard-to-staff schools in North Carolina. The article provides examples of how other states and districts are recruiting teachers to rural areas and covers differentiated pay for mathematics and science teachers, housing incentives for teachers agreeing to teach in a hard-to-staff district, and a grow-your-own program that recruits students in high school to become a teacher. The article also offers suggestions for districts hoping to recruit in areas including using professional development as a recruitment and retention tool and using incentives to attract teachers to hard-to-staff subject incentives.

## The Revolving Door

Author(s): Hanushek, E., & Rivkin, S. G. Date: 2004

Source: *Education Next*, 1

Type: Perspective piece; issue paper; policy paper

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20041\\_76.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20041_76.pdf)

Abstract: This article reports on research that has been conducted in Texas on the reasons that teachers leave the profession. There are many different factors that influence the recruitment and retention of teachers, such as salary, working conditions, and preferences. The research that this article reviews posits that working conditions mattered more to teachers than salary when making decisions to stay, leave, or teach in a certain district. Teaching in low-achieving schools was also a strong decision factor in movement between districts. The results of this study have policy implications for the recruitment and retention of teachers in Texas public schools.

## Science Teachers Who Left: A Survey Report

Author(s): Hounshell, P. B., & Griffin, S. S. Date: 1989

Source: *Science Education*, 73(4), 433–443

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study surveyed graduates of a single university teacher education program in science during a six-year period to determine employment status and possible reasons for choosing not to teach. Of the 77 respondents, 52 percent were still teaching when surveyed. Among those not teaching, about one third had never taught, and the others had taught for some period before leaving the profession. Among those who had left, concerns about low salaries, slow advancement, and lack of prestige, respect, and professional work settings were the most commonly cited reasons for deciding not to teach.

## Solving the Shortage of Mathematics and Science Teachers

Author(s): Levin, H. M. Date: 1985

Source: *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 7(4), 371–382

Type: Information guide; policy paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This paper describes the history of shortages of mathematics and science teachers in secondary schools and offers possible explanations and solutions. According to previous studies, shortages of mathematics and science teachers have continued at varying degrees since the 1940s. The article argues that the causes of shortages can be found in salary schedules that fail to offer competitive salaries, particularly for qualified mathematics and science personnel. An examination of starting salaries in teaching compared to starting salaries in business and industry shows that disparities in mathematics and science were much larger than in the humanities or social sciences. Policy recommendations include careful reviews of salary schedules and special salary increments for mathematics and science teachers as needed.

## Supply and Demand of Minority Teachers in Texas: Problems and Prospects

Author(s): Kirby, S. N., Berends, M., & Naftel, S. Date: 1999

Source: *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 21(1), 47–66

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study used longitudinal administrative data about 98,951 teachers to investigate the demand and supply of minority teachers in Texas. On the supply side, the authors found that Latinos and African Americans accounted for 23 percent of the Texas teaching force during 1995–96. High-risk schools—those with more than 60 percent of their students eligible for free or reduced-price lunch—were staffed primarily by African Americans and Hispanics. These high-risk schools also reported higher proportions of uncertified teachers than other schools. Beginning teachers were an increasingly important source of new hires, and the proportion of Hispanics and African Americans among new teachers had been rising. Teacher certification tests, however, continued to be a larger hurdle for Hispanics and African Americans than for other teachers. Alternative certification programs seemed to be a good source of minority teachers. On the demand side, the authors found an aging teacher population, particularly among black teachers. New Hispanic teachers had lower rates of attrition than new African-American or Caucasian teachers. Younger teachers had higher attrition than older teachers. Districts with lower salaries, fewer resources, or more students eligible for free or reduced-price lunch all had higher attrition.

## Teacher Compensation and Teacher Workforce Development

Author(s): Kelley, C., & Finnigan, K. Date: 2004

Source: *The Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education*, 104(2), 253–273

Type: Literature review; perspective piece

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This article reviews the research on the role of teacher compensation in improving the quality of the teacher workforce through recruitment, retention, and development. The authors argue that compensation can be used to attract higher quality teachers to the workforce; however, overall increases may be inefficient, and current evidence suggests that compensation may not be effective at solving issues regarding the distribution of teachers. They argue that compensation is a factor in teacher retention; however, other factors regarding working conditions also are important. The authors conclude by arguing that compensation has a role in creating a high-quality workforce and that it should be part of a systemic approach to enhance the teacher workforce.

## Teacher Compensation and the Supply of Teachers

Author(s): Ferris, J., & Winkler, D. Date: 1986

Source: *The Elementary School Journal*, 86(4), 389–403

Type: Policy paper; literature review

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This article reviews the research on the connection between teacher compensation and supply of quality teachers. The researchers examine labor markets for teachers; the data show that wage can affect the quality and supply of teachers. The paper also looks at previous research on the determinants of teacher supply and the responsiveness of teachers to changes in compensation. Evidence was found linking teacher supply to compensation, suggesting the changes in compensation should be examined as possible policy to increase the supply and quality of teachers.

## Teacher Effectiveness, Mobility, and Attrition in Florida: A Descriptive Analysis

Author(s): West, M., & Chingos, M. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/West\\_and\\_Chingos\\_2008.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/West_and_Chingos_2008.pdf)

Abstract: This report uses elementary school data for new teachers in Florida to determine the effectiveness of the teachers. The data are collected from 2001-02 through 2005-06 and compare mobility statistics with effectiveness calculations. The effectiveness calculations are determined through a value-added model. This report concludes that there are no correlations between mobility and attrition and schools losing effective teachers.

## Teacher Performance Incentives and Student Outcomes

Author(s): Eberts, R., Hollenbeck, K., & Stone, J. Date: 2002

Source: *Journal of Human Resources*, 37(4), 913–927

Type: Issue paper; case study; scientific research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article focuses on merit pay systems for teachers. In reviewing evidence from one case study, the researchers analyze the effect that teacher performance has on student achievement. This study found that the merit pay system increased teacher retention. The analysis also showed no teacher effects on student achievement.

## Teacher Recruitment and Retention in Public and Private Schools

Author(s): Ballou, D., & Podgursky, M. Date: 1998

Source: *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 17(3), 393–417

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study examines how well private and public schools are able to meet their recruitment and retention objectives and whether private schools benefit in these efforts from market competition. Data from the 1990–91 Schools and Staffing Survey were used to estimate the association between school type and principal ratings in several logit models. New teachers in public schools and private schools were given similar performance ratings by their principals, but experienced teachers in private schools were rated significantly higher than experienced teachers in public schools after controlling for school and community characteristics and salary levels. In addition, experienced teachers in private schools received higher ratings relative to beginning teachers in private schools than did experienced teachers in public schools relative to beginning teachers in public schools. The authors argue that this implies that private schools do a better job of retaining better teachers and developing the talent of their staff. The authors speculate that this is due to an advantage private schools have in recruiting, retaining, and developing high-quality staff, including greater pay flexibility, greater ability to recruit noncertified teachers, better staff development through in-service training and mentoring, and greater authority to dismiss low-performing teachers.

## Teacher Recruitment in a School Reform State: Factors That Influence Applicant Attraction to Teaching Vacancies

Author(s): Winter, P. A., & Melloy, S. H. Date: 2005

Source: *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 41(2), 349–372

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study used a survey of teacher trainees and experienced teachers in Kentucky to investigate the relationship between school accountability ratings, signing bonuses, experience, and interest in a job. Researchers found that vacancies at lower-rated schools were significantly less interesting to teachers even if they included a 10 percent signing bonus. They also found that experienced teachers generally were less interested in vacancies than inexperienced teachers. Policy recommendations include different recruitment strategies for new and experienced teachers and further exploration of nonmonetary inducements for teaching in low-rated schools.

## Teacher Retention and Attrition From Public Schools: Evidence From SASS91

Author(s): Shen, J. Date: 1997

Source: *Journal of Educational Research*, 91(2), 33–39

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study used discriminant analysis to examine differences between teachers who stay in the same school, teachers who move to another school, and teachers who leave the profession. Data came from the 1991 Schools and Staffing Survey and the 1992 Teacher Follow-up Survey and included responses from 3,612 teachers. Teachers who stayed in their schools had higher salaries and more experience than those who left teaching. Compared to leavers and quitters, stayers believed that they had more influence over school and teaching policies, administrators better understood their problems, and teaching has more advantages than disadvantages. Stayers worked in schools that had lower percentages of minority students and students on free lunch, more experienced teachers, and higher salaries at the top end of the pay scale.

## Teacher Salaries and Teacher Attrition

Author(s): Imazeki, J. Date: 2003

Source: *Economics of Education Review*, 24(4), 431–449

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: <http://www-rohan.sdsu.edu/~jimazeki/papers/EERAugust2005.pdf>

Abstract: This study used state-level administrative data from Wisconsin to examine the relationship of salary to new teachers' decisions to transfer between districts or quit teaching within the state. Key findings from this extensive data analysis include the importance of salary in neighboring districts to the decision to transfer and that higher salaries for veteran teachers are important to retaining inexperienced female teachers. Policy recommendations include targeting salary increases to districts with relatively low salaries compared to their neighbors; the author found that it would take salary increases of at least 15 percent to 20 percent to reduce attrition from Milwaukee to levels found in the average Wisconsin district.

## Teacher Sorting and the Plight of Urban Schools:A Descriptive Analysis

Author(s): Lankford, H., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. Date: 2002

Source: *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 24(1), 37–62

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This paper examines teacher sorting and variation by schools and districts in the average attributes of teachers in New York state using longitudinal data on all teachers during a 15-year period ending in 1999–2000. As proxies for school-level teacher quality, the study measured the percent of teachers with no prior teaching experience; with no more than a bachelor's degree; not certified in any of their current teaching assignments; certified in all of their current teaching assignments; who failed the NTE General Knowledge Exam or the NYSTCE Liberal Arts and Science Exam on their first try; and who attended competitive, less competitive, or least competitive schools. The study found that teachers sorted systematically across schools and districts, with most of the variation in teacher qualification occurring between schools within districts and between districts rather than between regions of the state. The New York City region was the only region that stood out with substantially less qualified teachers than other regions. Students from low-income families, low-performing students, and minority students, particularly in urban areas, attended schools with less qualified teachers. Teacher attrition was higher in poor, urban schools, especially for teachers with higher qualifications. Salary structures did not appear to help reduce the uneven distribution of teachers.

## Teacher Turnover and Teacher Shortages:An Organizational Analysis

Author(s): Ingersoll, R. M. Date: 2001

Source: *American Educational Research Journal*, 38(3), 499–534

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study examined the factors that drive teacher turnover and school staffing problems using data from the 1990–91 Schools and Staffing Survey and the 1991–92 Teacher Follow-up Survey on 6,733 teachers. The authors found that annual turnover in teaching—including migration, attrition, retirement, layoffs, and terminations—was quite high compared to other occupations such as nursing, and that teacher retirement was a less important factor than had previously been thought. Private schools had higher annual turnover than public schools, and small schools had greater annual turnover than large schools. Rural schools had lower annual turnover than other schools, while high-poverty schools had higher annual turnover than more affluent schools. Schools that offered higher salaries, provided more administrative support, had better student discipline, and had higher levels of faculty decision-making and autonomy had lower levels of annual turnover. Teachers who were young, old, white, or female were more likely to leave their schools, but mathematics and science teachers had the same rate of turnover as other teachers. Personal reasons and job dissatisfaction were the major reasons for teachers to leave their schools. Low salaries, lack of administrative support, and student discipline problems contributed to job dissatisfaction.

## Teacher Turnover and the Quality of Worklife in Schools: An Empirical Study

Author(s): Seyfarth, J. T., & Bost, W. A. Date: 1986

Source: *Journal of Research and Development in Education*, 20(1), 1–6

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study explored the relationship between quality of worklife and teacher turnover using survey data from 126 district superintendents in Virginia. The analysis focused on the size of the relationship between district-level teacher turnover rates and survey responses concerning the quality of teacher worklife. Higher pay and more fringe benefits were related to lower levels of turnover. Districts with large numbers of teachers commuting more than 25 miles to work had higher teacher turnover rates, as did districts with old and out-of-date buildings.

## Teacher Turnover, Tenure Policies, and the Distribution of Teacher Quality: Can High-Poverty Schools Catch a Break?

Author(s): Miller, R., & Chait, R. Date: 2008

Source: Washington, DC: Center for American Progress

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2008/12/pdf/teacher\\_attrition.pdf](http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2008/12/pdf/teacher_attrition.pdf)

Abstract: This policy paper explores three components of teaching that affect the proportion of economically disadvantaged students served by highly effective teachers. The report argues that teacher quality distribution, teacher turnover, and teacher tenure policies, as they currently exist, do little to equally distribute highly effective teachers to students of low-income families. The brief suggests that districts utilize measures of teacher quality and be cognizant of how high-quality teachers are distributed. The brief continues by discussing teacher turnover and mobility. The brief specifically suggests that districts work to remove ineffective teachers from the classroom and retain effective teachers. Finally, the brief examines the role of tenure on retaining ineffective teachers. The brief suggests that teacher tenure be a reward for demonstrating effective practices and not a given for teachers after a certain number of years.

## Turnover Among Mathematics and Science Teachers in the U.S.

Author(s): Ingersoll, R. M. Date: 2000

Source: Washington, DC: National Commission on Mathematics and Science Teaching for the 21st Century

Type: Scientific research; policy paper

Full text: <http://www.ed.gov/initiatives/Math/glenn/Ingersollp.doc>

Abstract: This article uses national data to showcase the national retention issues for mathematics and science teachers. This report includes data indicating the rate of teacher turnover and the reasons teachers leave the profession. Overall, the report concludes that the consistent need for teachers in schools is not a result of an increase in teacher retirement or the national demand for smaller classrooms with highly qualified teachers. This report argues that the mathematics and science teacher shortages are a direct result of the revolving door through which teachers enter and leave the profession quickly. The report suggests that teachers consistently leave the profession due to job dissatisfaction or to pursue better jobs in other careers. The report argues that these findings have great policy implication because teacher recruitment programs will never be successful if they do not first acknowledge the teacher retention issues.

## Who Chooses to Teach (and Why)?

**Author(s):** Hanushek, E. A., & Pace, R. R. **Date:** 1995

**Source:** *Economics of Education Review*, 14(2), 101–117

**Type:** Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

**Full text:** URL not available

**Abstract:** This study investigates the characteristics of those who choose to enter teaching, as well as policy variables such as teacher salaries and certification requirements that influence prospective teachers' career decisions. Longitudinal data from the High School and Beyond survey tracks a cohort of 1,325 individuals from 1980, when they were high school seniors, to 1986. The authors found that a majority of eventual teachers did not express aspirations toward teaching when they were in high school, while many high school seniors who intended to pursue teaching ended up pursuing other careers. Though students who express interest in teaching as high schoolers are disproportionately low-achieving, many weaker students drop out of the teaching track as they progress through college so that the group that actually graduates from teacher education programs is representative of the population as a whole in terms of academic achievement. State certification requirements such as teacher exams and strict course requirements lowered the proportion of college students engaged in teacher preparation, and the effect was equivalent for whites and blacks. This study suggests that salaries did not have a large or significant effect on students' choices to become teachers.

## Why Bright College Students Won't Teach

**Author(s):** Berry, B. **Date:** 1986

**Source:** *Urban Review*, 18(4), 269–280

**Type:** Scientific research; state or regional reports

**Full text:** URL not available

**Abstract:** This study used case studies and interviews with 80 college students not majoring in education to investigate career expectations of young adults and ways to attract them to public school teaching. The author found that economic incentives were not a major influence on students' opinions of the teaching profession; rather, most of the sample had formed ideas about teaching from their own experiences as public school students. Female students and students from rural areas and lower socioeconomic backgrounds were more likely to express an interest in teaching, while students from higher socioeconomic backgrounds tended to view teaching as a temporary pursuit before going to graduate school. State certification rules and extracurricular chores deterred students from higher socioeconomic backgrounds. Many students who had been designated as particularly academically able by their department believed that teaching would not allow them to pursue their own intellectual goals.

## Why Did We Choose Teaching Careers and What Will Enable Us to Stay? Insights From One Cohort of the African American Teaching Pool

Author(s): King, S. H. Date: 1993

Source: *Journal of Negro Education*, 62(4), 475–491

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study sought to determine the reasons why a cohort of 41 African-American graduates of a highly rated college of education entered teaching and what factors might influence the retention of these teachers and others. The author found that the graduates cited idealistic views about why they became teachers, such as the opportunity to work with young people, the feeling that their abilities were well suited to teaching, and the belief that teaching contributed to the betterment of society. Prospective teachers were more idealistic than teachers already in the field, who were more likely to cite concerns such as salary, good vacation time and working hours, and job security. Salary, professional prestige, and control over their work were more important to male graduates, while female graduates believed that working conditions such as ease of combining teaching and parenting and good vacation time were important. Graduates' mothers, other relatives, college teachers, and siblings were most encouraging of their decision to enter teaching, while college peers and colleagues were most discouraging. They felt that financial incentives, the development of teacher recruitment programs for minorities, more prestige, and improved working conditions would help attract more minorities to teaching.

## Why Didst Thou Go? Predictors of Retention, Transfer, and Attrition of Special and General Education Teachers From a National Perspective

Author(s): Boe, E. E., Bobbitt, S. A., Cook, L. H.; Whitener, S. D., & Weber, A. L. Date: 1997

Source: *The Journal of Special Education*, 30(4), 390–411

Type: Scientific research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study used data on nearly 5,000 teachers from the 1987–88 Schools and Staffing Survey and the 1989 Teacher Follow-up Survey to examine the association between teacher retention and various school and teacher characteristics. The authors found that teacher transfers from one school to another declined with teacher age, while teacher attrition showed a U-shape pattern, with high attrition among the youngest and oldest teachers. Teachers with certification in their teaching area and with more experience were less likely to leave their school or teaching, while teachers who had recently earned degrees were more likely to leave teaching for another career. Full-time teachers were less likely to move or leave than part-time teachers, as were teachers with higher base salaries. Family factors such as marriage and dependent children also were significant predictors of teacher attrition.

## Why Public Schools Lose Teachers

Author(s): Hanushek, E. A., Kain, J. F., & Rivkin, S. G. Date: 2001

Source: *NBER Working Paper No. 8599*. Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: <http://www.nber.org/papers/w8599>

**Abstract:** This study used longitudinal panel data from the UTD Texas Schools Project to estimate the effect of salary and school characteristics on teacher transitions in and out of school districts and out of the teacher labor force. The authors found that salary played a fairly small role in teachers' decisions to switch districts. The effect of salary was greater for males than for females and for inexperienced teachers than for teachers who had been teaching for several years. Salaries were a stronger predictor of switches between districts than of exits from teaching. School characteristics were very important in switching decisions. On average, white teachers in the sample preferred districts with high-achieving, nonminority, nonlow-income students, but black teachers favored districts with higher black student enrollment. Because school characteristics play a larger role than existing salary differences among districts in teacher retention, the authors suggest that schools serving educationally disadvantaged populations may need to increase salaries by as much as 50 percent to neutralize the probability of teachers leaving because of student characteristics.

## Will There Be Enough Teachers?

Author(s): Murnane, R. J., & Olsen, R. J. Date: 1989

Source: *The American Economic Review*, 79, 242–246

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study examined the factors that influence the length of teaching spells for new entrants to teaching. The study used waiting time regression techniques to analyze longitudinal data on samples of new teachers from North Carolina, Colorado, and Michigan in the 1970s. In all three samples, elementary school teachers had longer first teaching spells than high school teachers. In the two states with data on chemistry and physics teachers, these teachers were the first ones to leave teaching and the least likely to return to teaching later. Teaching salaries, especially early in teachers' careers, were found to have an important positive effect on the length of time spent teaching. In North Carolina, where the data included NTE scores, new teachers with high scores were more likely to leave teaching early.

## Would Higher Salaries Keep Teachers in High-Poverty Schools? Evidence From a Policy Intervention in North Carolina

Author(s): Clotfelter, C., Glennie, E., Ladd, H., & Vigdor, J. Date: 2006

Source: Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** In a measure designed to explore teacher retention methods in high-risk schools, North Carolina awarded \$1,800 annual bonuses to high-need subject areas (e.g., mathematics, science, special education) teachers. This article sets out to examine the impact of this bonus on teacher retention. The effect of the bonus on teacher turnover was measured using longitudinal data covering the time before and after bonuses were awarded. Data indicated a 12 percent reduction in mean turnover rates.

---

## Compensation and Teacher Quality

### The Academic Quality of Public School Teachers: An Analysis of Entry and Exit Behavior

Author(s): Podgursky, M., Monroe, R., & Watson, D. Date: 2004

Source: *Economics of Education Review*, 23(5), 507–518

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://web.missouri.edu/~podgurskym/articles/files/EconofEdRev\\_duration\\_published.pdf](http://web.missouri.edu/~podgurskym/articles/files/EconofEdRev_duration_published.pdf)

Abstract: This article presents the results of a study that examined how labor market decisions affect the academic quality of public school teachers. A rich longitudinal data set of recent Missouri public college graduates and new public school teachers formed the basis of the analysis. This study was novel in that it was able to link the records of Missouri's new public school teachers and recent cohorts of college graduates to a master file of ACT scores. The results show that college graduates with above-average ACT scores tended not to select teaching as a profession, and this relationship is strongest for elementary-level teachers. Although women were more likely to select teaching as a profession than men, high-ability women were as likely as men to choose another profession. High-ability men and women who did choose teaching as a profession were more likely than lower achieving men and women to leave the profession. The results also showed that high-quality teachers were not leaving the profession for higher pay and that large pay increases would be needed to retain high-ability mathematics and science teachers.

### Alignment of Human Resource Practices and Teacher Performance Competency

Author(s): Heneman, H. G., III, & Milanowski, A. T. Date: 2004

Source: *Peabody Journal of Education*, 79(4), 108–125

Type: Case study; information guide

Full text: [http://www.leaonline.com/doi/abs/10.1207/s15327930pje7904\\_6](http://www.leaonline.com/doi/abs/10.1207/s15327930pje7904_6)

Abstract: This article describes a human resources (HR) alignment model that described eight HR practices (including recruitment) and how they can be aligned to support student achievement. Case studies of two districts that have demonstrated links between teacher competency and student achievement are used to describe how these practices can be implemented. The authors discuss the importance of analyzing the alignment of HR practices to understanding districts' teacher quality efforts.

### An Analysis of the Factors Affecting the Supply and Demand for Teacher Quality

Author(s): Galchus, K. E. Date: 1994

Source: *Journal of Economics and Finance*, 18(2), 165–178

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study used data on public schools in 75 Arkansas counties to investigate the supply and demand for teacher quality, as measured by the countywide teacher pass rate on a mandatory test of basic skills administered in 1985. The authors estimated county-level demand for teacher quality using educational level, median income, and race and ethnicity of the population; the school property tax rate; and spending on teacher salaries and other educational factors. They found that average teacher salaries had a significant negative effect on demand for teacher quality and a significant positive effect on supply. The percentage of whites and college graduates in a county was positively associated with demand for teacher quality. Demand was price-inelastic, while supply was much more elastic. Higher student achievement and lower population density were associated with greater teacher quality on the supply side, suggesting that counties most in need of quality teachers had the most difficulty attracting those teachers.

## Attracting and Developing High-Quality Teachers

Author(s): The Center for Comprehensive School Reform and Improvement. Date: 2007

Source: Washington, DC: The Center for Comprehensive School Reform and Improvement

Type: Information guide; issue paper

Full text: [http://www.centerforsri.org/files/TheCenter\\_NL\\_May07.pdf](http://www.centerforsri.org/files/TheCenter_NL_May07.pdf)

Abstract: This issue paper, disseminated by The Center for Comprehensive School Reform and Improvement, provides an information guide on strategies for establishing an effective cadre of high-quality teachers. The brief offers insight into best practices for implementing a recruitment plan, building teacher capacity from within the district, and helping teachers fortify their human capital once they have been hired on. Each of these three sections deals with the merits of a pay-for-performance system, which, according to the authors, can be a significant incentive for attracting educators to a district and then keeping them on staff. The incentives mentioned are particularly effective when recruiting teachers to hard-to-staff schools and hard-to-fill subject areas, such as mathematics, science, and special education.

## Can Teacher Quality Be Effectively Assessed?

Author(s): Goldhaber, D., & Anthony, E. Date: 2004

Source: Seattle, WA: Center on Reinventing Public Education

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: [http://www.urban.org/UploadedPDF/410958\\_NBPTSOutcomes.pdf](http://www.urban.org/UploadedPDF/410958_NBPTSOutcomes.pdf)

Abstract: This working paper reviews the results of the first large-scale study based on a unique data set from North Carolina. This study involved assessing the relationship between teachers who were certified by the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (NBPTS) and the achievement of the students of these teachers. The authors found that this NBPTS certification program was successful in selecting effective teacher applicants, and the student achievement reflected the effectiveness of their teachers.

## The Challenges of Staffing Urban Schools With Effective Teachers

Author(s): Jacob, B. A. Date: 2007

Source: Princeton, NJ: The Future of Children

Type: Policy paper; literature review

Full text: [http://www.princeton.edu/futureofchildren/publications/docs/17\\_01\\_07.pdf](http://www.princeton.edu/futureofchildren/publications/docs/17_01_07.pdf)

Abstract: In this literature review, the author cites several research studies that examine the effectiveness of teachers in hard-to-staff urban schools. The author also presents supply and demand components, human resources practices, and principal support practices that all contribute and influence teacher shortages in urban schools. Finally, the author provides examples of approaches several urban school districts have taken to address the teacher shortages. Examples include providing salary increases and targeted bonuses, establishing high-quality mentoring programs for teachers, and improving working conditions teachers in urban schools.

## Compensation Policies and Teacher Decisions

Author(s): Stinebrickner, T. R. Date: 2001

Source: *International Economic Review*, 42(3), 751–779

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study examines the occupational decisions of individuals certified to teach using a dynamic, discrete choice, utility maximizing model. The study used data from a sample of 551 individuals who became certified to teach between 1975 and 1985 and participated in the National Longitudinal Survey of the High School Class of 1972. An analytic framework was used to model the effects of possible changes in teacher salary policy. One policy would provide pay raises of 20 percent to all teachers, while another policy would use the same amount of money but would target raises to those with higher academic ability. The models suggested that the two policies would increase the overall supply of teachers by equal amounts, but the second policy would increase the proportion of teachers with high SAT scores.

## Conceptualising and Evaluating Teacher Quality: Substantive and Methodological Issues

Author(s): Ingvarson, L., & Rowe, K. Date: 2008

Source: *Australian Journal of Education*, 52(1), 5–35

Type: Literature review; policy paper

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This article examines the difficulties, both substantive and methodological, in evaluating teacher quality. The paper argues that teacher performance should be rooted in the teacher standards, both their subject-knowledge and their pedagogical skills. The article also presents two approaches toward the current lack of information on the limitations of teacher quality evaluation. These approaches include evidence-based, inservice professional development and identifying and evaluating teacher standards. The paper concludes that because teachers are the most important factor in student achievement, policymakers should seriously consider pay-for-performance evaluations to determine teacher quality.

## Do Public Schools Hire the Best Applicants?

Author(s): Ballou, D. Date: 1996

Source: *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 111(1), 97–113

Type: Scientific research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study examines the determinants of district hiring decisions using data from the 1976–91 Survey of Recent College Graduates. Relying on regression models, the author found that college students were more likely to pursue a career in teaching if relative salaries increased and job prospects were favorable. Women and students with high grade point averages (GPAs) were more likely to apply for teaching jobs than other students. Among those who did apply, students from more selective colleges—measured by *Barron's* 1991 rankings—were no more likely to be offered and accept full-time teaching positions than other students. Students with high GPAs and with an education major fared better in the job market than other students, but students with training in mathematics and science did not. The author offers the findings as evidence of district officials' indifference toward college quality and training in shortage areas. The author suggests that problems with teacher quality are related to demand rather than supply and that policy prescriptions must be adjusted accordingly.

## Does New Teacher Support Affect Student Achievement?

Author(s): Strong, M. Date: 2006

Source: Santa Cruz, CA: The New Teacher Center at the University of California, Santa Cruz

Type: Issue paper

Full text: <http://www.newteachercenter.org/pdfs/NTCResearchBrief.06-01.pdf>

Abstract: The New Teacher Center explores the research surrounding new teacher support in the first two years of teaching and its connection to increased student achievement. Although it is difficult to conduct the research regarding this issue, The New Teacher Center has conducted two studies on the effect of induction and student achievement. The first study compared elementary student achievement gains in three districts. The study considered mentoring over a two-year period during which all districts received one year of mentoring, and in the second year, only one district received similar induction. The results found that the second year influenced student achievement. The second study considered five years of student achievement data in a single district. The results found that although teachers tended to be assigned to lower performing students, after two years of induction, beginning teachers' students achieved at similar levels to more experienced teachers.

## Economic Perspectives on Investments in Teacher Quality: Lessons Learned From Research on Productivity and Human Resource Development

Author(s): Plecki, M. L. Date: 2000

Source: *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 8(33)

Type: Literature review; policy paper

Full text: <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaal/v8n33.html>

Abstract: This article reviews the contributions and limitations of economic analyses of resource allocation aimed at improving teacher quality. Two major theoretical perspectives in economics were provided: productivity theory and human capital theory. Teacher compensation reforms are discussed. Finally, the author discusses implications of these economic concepts on the design and implementation of investment policies targeted at improving teacher quality. The author concludes that economic perspectives provide useful insights in addressing the complex challenge of how resources can best be allocated for the improvement of teacher quality.

## Evaluating the Effect of Teacher Degree Level on Educational Performance

Author(s): Goldhaber, D. D., & Brewer, D. J. Date: 1996

Source: In W. J. Fowler, (Ed.), *Developments in School Finance* (pp. 197–210). Darby, PA: Diane

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: <http://nces.ed.gov/pubs97/97535l.pdf>

Abstract: This piece reports the impact of teacher characteristics on student achievement. Data from the National Educational Longitudinal Study of 1988 were used to estimate models using teacher, class, and school-level variables. Results suggest that school-level variables have little to no influence on student achievement. However, there appears to be some impact on student achievement once teacher-degree information is added to the model. Specifically, there is a significant relationship between teachers who are certified and have bachelor's or master's degrees in mathematics and student achievement in mathematics. In addition, those teachers who have bachelor's degrees in science have a positive impact on student achievement in science.

## Focus on Teacher Pay and Incentives: Recent Legislative Actions and Update on Salary Averages

Author(s): Gaines, G. F. Date: 2007

Source: Atlanta, GA: Southern Regional Education Board

Type: Information guide; issue paper; case study

Full text: URL not available.

Abstract: This report provides an update on the recent actions of the Southern Regional Education Board (SREB) states with respect to alternative compensation. SREB states have attempted to address teacher quality issues, including the need to attract and retain teachers in hard-to-staff areas and subjects through the use of financial incentives. The report examines teacher incentive programs implemented in these states and details legislative updates regarding such initiatives. The report concludes with a brief discussion on teacher salaries in each of the SREB states.

## How Does Teacher Pay Compare? Methodological Challenges and Answers

Author(s): Allegretto, S. A., Corcoran, S. P., & Mishel, L. Date: 2004

Source: Washington, DC: Economic Policy Institute

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.epinet.org/books/teacher\\_pay-intro.pdf](http://www.epinet.org/books/teacher_pay-intro.pdf)

Abstract: This publication presents information on the debate about teacher pay, evidence of lagging teacher income growth, teacher pay and teacher quality, and relative weekly earnings of teachers as well as the fringe benefit bias. It also includes statistics from national surveys on weekly teacher pay.

## How Teachers' Choices Affect What a Dollar Can Buy: Wages and Quality in K–12 Schooling

Author(s): Loeb, S. Date: 2000

Source: *Education Finance Research Consortium*, 31

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: <http://www.albany.edu/edfin/symp2000/LoebW3.pdf>

Abstract: This study examines the distribution of teachers and teacher salaries in New York state and nationally. A school-level, aggregate measure of teacher qualifications was developed using factor analysis of data on certification, college degree, competitiveness of college, NTE passage, and tenure. Ordinary least squares with fixed effects was used to examine relationships between quality measures and school, district, and regional characteristics. Much of the variation in teacher qualifications across schools was found to be within districts, because salaries do not vary by school. Schools with higher-achieving and higher socioeconomic students were found to have teachers with higher qualifications. Policy recommendations include targeted salary increases and targeted improvements in working conditions to attract teachers to low-performing schools and reduce disparities in teacher quality.

## The Impact of Teacher Turnover on Teacher Quality: Findings From Four States

Author(s): Theobald, N. D., & Laine, S. W. M. Date: 2003

Source: In M. L. Plecki & D. H. Monk (Eds.), *School Finance and Teacher Quality: Exploring the Connections* (pp. 33–54). Larchmont, NY: Eye on Education

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study uses four longitudinal case studies and interviews with eight additional teachers to understand the challenges associated with recruiting, inducting, and retaining high-quality teachers in urban areas. Field experiences and multicultural education in teacher preparation were identified as very important for preparing new teachers for their urban experiences. Hiring processes were seen as bureaucratic and ineffective at informing new teachers about their schools and classes. Induction was seen as important to new teachers with those teachers in the sample who changed schools to work in a more collegial environment. Although compensation was not a primary motivator for entering teaching, low pay caused important challenges for teachers, particularly with housing and the need for supplemental income to make ends meet. Policy recommendations include creating strong supports for classroom management, reducing bureaucratic barriers to entering teaching, improving orientation to schools, ensuring induction that builds collegiality, and providing housing assistance.

## Improving Teaching Through Pay for Contribution

Author(s): Ayscue Hassel, E., & Hassel, B. C. Date: 2007

Source: Washington, DC: National Governors Association Center for Best Practices

Type: Policy paper

Full text: <http://www.nga.org/Files/pdf/0711IMPROVINGTEACHING.PDF>

Abstract: This policy paper provides an overview of various types of alternative compensation initiatives that are designed to enhance teacher effectiveness. The authors review how the current teacher salary system inadequately compensates effective teachers and retains teachers that are ineffective while offering examples of successful alternative compensation efforts including the following: incentives for hard-to-staff schools and subjects, differentiated pay, skill and knowledge-based pay, retention incentives, and performance-based awards. Suggestions for policymakers are also offered.

## Increasing the Odds: How Good Policies Can Yield Better Teachers

Author(s): Walsh, K., & Tracy, C. O. Date: n.d.

Source: Washington, DC: National Council on Teacher Quality

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.nctq.org/nctq/images/nctq\\_io.pdf](http://www.nctq.org/nctq/images/nctq_io.pdf)

Abstract: In this policy brief, senior staff writers from the National Council on Teacher Quality present research on the following aspects of teacher quality and effectiveness: advanced degrees; professional experience; professional development; certification; subject-area knowledge; level of literacy; selectivity of undergraduate university; and “soft attributes,” such as responsibility, organization, and motivation. On the whole, the authors of this literature review reveal that the factors most frequently cited in relation to teacher quality and effectiveness have produced, at best, slight gains in student achievement. Rather, the soft attributes, or noncognitive skills, are the most highly correlated with gains in student achievement. To this end, the authors of this brief argue that policies should be created and implemented to screen for these skills in incoming teachers, though they also admit that, at this point, this is an unclear and unscientific process.

## Lifting Teacher Performance

Author(s): Leigh, A., & Mead, S. Date: 2005

Source: Washington, DC: Progressive Policy Institute

Type: Issue paper; policy paper

Full text: [http://www.ppionline.org/documents/teachqual\\_0419.pdf](http://www.ppionline.org/documents/teachqual_0419.pdf)

Abstract: This paper analyzes promising new research about teacher quality and the incentives for teachers to do better. The authors assess current teacher quality approaches and offer recommendations to help policymakers modernize how teachers are prepared, hired, evaluated, and compensated. The authors discuss the current teacher quality problems. They point out that some traditional solutions do not work to solve these problems. They suggest many promising alternatives based on research studies, including performance-based pay, paying teachers more to work in hard-to-staff schools, and alternative teacher certification. Finally, they provide policy recommendations to improve teacher quality.

## Low Pay, Low Quality

Author(s): Temin, P. Date: 2003

Source: *Education Next*, 3

Type: Issue paper; perspective piece

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20033\\_8.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20033_8.pdf)

Abstract: This article dives into the problem of teacher salaries and teacher quality. The existing flaws in the teacher market are the result of the difficulty in identifying high-quality teacher candidates and a change in face of the teacher pool. The increasing opportunities for women in the workforce have taken the high-quality teacher candidate away from the profession--a traditionally attractive profession for women--into more lucrative professional opportunities. The nature of the work teachers do has become increasingly difficult; a deterring factor for high-quality candidates to pursue teaching. Raising teacher salaries to a competitive level will be essential to future education reforms.

## The Market for Teacher Quality

Author(s): Hanushek, E. A., Kain, J. F., O'Brien, D. M., & Rivkin, S. G. Date: 2005

Source: Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research

Type: Issue paper; policy paper; rigorous research; scientific research

Full text: <http://www.nber.org/papers/w11154>

Abstract: This article uses student value-added achievement gains to determine the quality of teachers in a large school district in Texas. The findings showed that advanced teacher degrees did not hold a direct correlation with high-quality teaching and that experience is a factor in only the first year of teaching. This article also suggests that schools offering higher wages and better working conditions do not have higher quality teachers. Finally, there are several policy implications offered in this article.

## A Plan to Improve the Quality of Teaching in American Schools

Author(s): Haskins, R., & Loeb, S. Date: 2007

Source: Princeton, NJ: The Future of Children

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.brookings.edu/~media/Files/rc/papers/2007/spring\\_childrenfamilies\\_haskins/spring\\_childrenfamilies\\_haskins.pdf](http://www.brookings.edu/~media/Files/rc/papers/2007/spring_childrenfamilies_haskins/spring_childrenfamilies_haskins.pdf)

Abstract: This article presents a plan that incorporates specific components needed to improve teacher quality. The article argues that effective teachers are the most influential components in a student's learning, and policies should be designed to enhance, promote, and retain effective teachers. The article examines incentives for the recruitment of effective teachers into hard-to-staff schools and subjects as well as the importance of high-quality professional development for teachers already in the school system. The article also discusses recruitment strategies that should be implemented to enhance the applicant pool, which include making the entry requirements for teachers more reasonable.

## Quality Teachers: Can Incentive Policies Make a Difference?

Author(s): Cornett, L., & Gaines, G. Date: 2002

Source: Atlanta, GA: Southern Regional Education Board

Type: Issue paper; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available.

Abstract: This report details the efforts of Southern Regional Education Board (SREB) states in implementing teacher incentive programs. Providing bonuses for advanced certification, mentoring/coaching, and teaching in hard-to-staff areas are programs that have been utilized throughout SREB states in an attempt to implement incentive programs that also would support state accountability requirements. The report also examines the history of pay-for-performance programs and the lessons learned from pay-for-performance programs implemented during the 1980s and 1990s.

## Recognizing Differences: Let's Reward the Good Teachers

Author(s): Solmon, L. C. Date: 2005

Source: *Education Next*, 1

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20051\\_16.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20051_16.pdf)

Abstract: In this piece, the author makes a strong case in favor of the Teacher Advancement Program reforms. Solmon argues that the reforms would cost less money overall and also would increase salaries. He also explains that by rewarding teachers for outcomes and gains, including nonacademic goals and measuring and crediting classroom skills, teachers would be rewarded appropriately for their performance and would be more likely to learn and improve.

## Teacher Quality

Author(s): Hanushek, E. Date: 2002

Source: In L. T. Izumi & W. M. Evers (Eds.), *Teacher Quality* (pp. 1–12). Stanford, CA: Hoover Institution Press

Type: Perspective piece

Full text: <http://edpro.stanford.edu/hanushek/admin/pages/files/uploads/Teacher%20quality.Evers-Izumi.pdf>

Abstract: Hanushek uses this perspective piece to argue his views on the federal government's role in increasing teacher quality in American public schools. The opinion expressed here is that rather than focusing resources and manpower on inputs to education, such as reduced class-size and teacher credentials, the government should instead funnel resources into performance incentives, which, he argues, are highly correlated with raising levels of student achievement. Within Hanushek's endorsement of performance incentives is a warning that schools and districts must commit to using the added resources responsibly because if extra funds are put toward an end not directly related to teacher performance and effort, then teachers will respond to that signal by lowering the bar for their own quality.

## Teacher Quality and Equity in Educational Opportunity: Findings and Policy Implications

Author(s): Rivers, J. C., & Sanders, W. L. Date: 2002

Source: In L. T. Izumi & W. M. Evers (Eds.), *Teacher Quality* (pp. 13–23). Stanford, CA: Hoover Institution Press

Type: Policy paper; issue paper

Full text: [http://media.hoover.org/documents/0817929320\\_13.pdf](http://media.hoover.org/documents/0817929320_13.pdf)

Abstract: This paper explores the Tennessee Value-Added Assessment System (TVAAS) as an indicator of student achievement and teacher effectiveness. The TVAAS utilizes an extensive database of student and teacher information to determine the effects of individual teachers on student achievement. The paper also includes policy implications for teacher quality that have been determined by using the TVAAS. These implications include the following: teacher effects are different from race, socioeconomic status, and parental influence; teacher effects are measurable at least four years after the student has left that teacher; and children, regardless of ethnicity, respond positively to effective teachers.

## Teacher Quality and Joint Production in Secondary School

Author(s): Koedel, C. Date: 2007

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/news/PapersNews/Koedel\\_2007a\\_Revised\\_4.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/news/PapersNews/Koedel_2007a_Revised_4.pdf)

Abstract: This article utilizes teacher and student data at the secondary level to determine teacher quality. Ultimately, the goal of the report was to gauge the impact teachers have on subjects that are not the primary subjects they teach. Teacher quality is determined by using student value-added test scores in mathematics and reading. Overall, the author concluded that mathematics achievement is influenced most by mathematics and social studies teachers and reading is affected most by mathematics and English teachers. Also, it was determined that teacher quality in “off-subject” classes have as much influence on student performance as “same-subject” teachers for both mathematics and reading. The policy implications for this article suggest that these findings should be considered when designing an incentive pay plan.

## Teacher Training, Teacher Quality, and Student Achievement

Author(s): Harris, D. N., & Sass, T. R. Date: 2007

Source: Washington, DC: The Calder Center, National Center for Analysis of Longitudinal Data in Education Research

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.caldercenter.org/PDF/1001059\\_Teacher\\_Training.pdf](http://www.caldercenter.org/PDF/1001059_Teacher_Training.pdf)

Abstract: This research study examines the link between teacher education and training, and student outcomes, as measured by standardized test scores. The research team behind this study takes advantage of Florida's extensive student and teacher panel data and is able to measure teacher effects over a period of time. Among the findings is the indication that content-specific professional development for teachers is positively correlated with student productivity in middle and high school mathematics. Also, the study finds that the level of experience of a teacher is associated with teaching efficacy in elementary school mathematics and reading, and middle school mathematics. Applying these findings to the American public education system as a whole, Harris and Sass explain, "policies designed to promote retention of young teachers can yield significant benefits over and above avoiding the cost of hiring new teachers" (p. 31).

## Teachers' Academic Preparation and Commitment to Teach Math and Science

Author(s): LaTurner, R. J. Date: 2002

Source: *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 18(6), 653–663

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study uses data from a national survey of college graduates and an associated follow-up to examine the relationship between preparation for teaching secondary mathematics and science and commitment to teaching. Four different paths are examined based on whether a person has more or fewer than 18 subject-related semester hours and whether they are certified. Those who are certified appear most committed to teaching while those who have 18 or more hours but are not certified are least committed to teaching. Recommendations include increased salaries to increase retention of those with 18 or more hours of subject-matter training and additional training for those without 18 hours of subject-matter training who also appear to be committed to teaching.

## Teachers, Schools, and Academic Achievement

Author(s): Hanushek, E. A., Kain, J. F., & Rivkin, S. G. Date: 1998

Source: *NBER Working Paper No. 6691*

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study used data on cohorts of fifth- and sixth-grade students from 939 Texas schools to examine relationships among schools, teachers, and student achievement. The study found that variations among teachers account for a significant portion of variation in student achievement. The study concluded that teacher quality is an important determinant of student achievement. Though teacher quality remains largely unmeasured, the study did find that new teachers' average student gains are significantly lower than those of more experienced teachers. The study found no evidence that students of teachers with master's degrees made larger achievement gains than those of students of other teachers.

## Teaching and California's Future: The Status of the Teaching Profession 2001

Author(s): Shields, P. M., Humphrey, D. C., Wechsler, M. E., Riehl, L. M., Tiffany-Morales, J., Woodworth, K., et al. Date: 2001

Source: Santa Cruz, CA: The Center for the Future of Teaching and Learning

Type: Policy paper; scientific research

Full text: <http://www.cftl.org/documents/2001report/completereport.pdf>

Abstract: This report presents data on the status of teaching in California since the introduction of the Teaching and California's Future Initiative. This report is made up of the second round of teacher, principal, and administrator surveys, focusing on recruitment, preparation, induction, professional development, and compensation. Each section of the report documents the main findings of the survey on a particular topic and provides key policy recommendations. The main conclusion of the report is that the challenges facing low-performing and hard-to-staff schools remain especially problematic in the state.

## Wage Distortion

Author(s): Hoxby, C. M., & Leigh, A. Date: 2005

Source: *Education Next*, 2

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20052\\_50.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20052_50.pdf)

Abstract: This article explores the issue of declining teacher quality among female teachers. Data shows that women entering the teaching profession are scoring lower on aptitude test than in the past. Hoxby suggests the lure and appeal of other professions is drawing females away from teaching. This article also discusses the effects of unions and collective bargaining, and how their existence has potentially made the gap between the salaries of high- and low-aptitude teachers increase.

## Wage Frictions and Teacher Quality: An Empirical Analysis of Differential Effects Across Subject Areas

Author(s): Ferguson, D. C., & Gilpin, G. Date: 2009

Source: Bloomington, IN: Indiana University–Bloomington, National Council on Teacher Quality

Type: Policy paper; rigorous research

Full text: [http://www.nctq.org/tr3/conference/docs/tr3\\_conf\\_ferguson.pdf](http://www.nctq.org/tr3/conference/docs/tr3_conf_ferguson.pdf)

Abstract: This research article examines how teacher quality is affected by collective bargaining agreements and salary schedules. The study, using data from public, private, and charter schools, ultimately found that salary schedules have an adverse effect on teacher quality. There is an even greater effect for mathematics and science teachers. The study continues by suggesting that by instituting an incentive pay initiative to reduce class size, teacher quality would actually increase by approximately 1.5 percent. Finally, the study found that schools with the least flexible salary schedules had significantly larger classrooms. The study used data from the National Center for Education Statistics Schools and Staffing Survey, the National Post-Secondary Aid Survey and the National Council on Teacher Quality's Teacher Roles, Rights, and Rules Database.

## What Different Benchmarks Suggest About How Financially Attractive It Is to Teach in Public Schools

Author(s): Goldhaber, D., & Player, D. Date: 2005

Source: *Journal of Education Finance*, 30(3), 211–230

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This article uses multiple national data sets on occupations and salaries to compare teaching salaries to those in other occupations. Generally, inflation-adjusted average teaching salaries increased in the 1960s, fell during the 1970s, increased in the 1980s, and remained flat in the 1990s. Starting teaching salaries remain lower than other occupations; however, differences have shrunk since the early 1980s. When looking at differences in salaries between teaching and competing occupations, high-skill teachers and secondary teachers have more high-paying opportunities outside of teaching than low-skill or elementary teachers. The authors argue that because of these competing opportunities districts using single-salary schedules will have trouble recruiting or will have to settle for lower skill levels for those teachers in high demand in the overall labor market. The authors recommend that districts explore different salary systems to address the labor-market reality that people with different skills have different opportunities for higher salaries outside of teaching.

## What Is the Problem? The Challenge of Providing Effective Teachers for All Children

Author(s): Murnane, R., & Steele, J. L. Date: 2007

Source: *The Future of Children*, 17(1), 15–43

Type: Policy paper

Full text: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/pdfplus/4150018.pdf>

**Abstract:** This policy paper presents an international view of approaches to attracting and retaining highly effective teachers. Murnane and Steele begin by identifying the unequal distribution of quality teachers in the American public education system and then segue into other countries' strategies to rectify their own distribution issues. In large part, the authors argue, the answer is money, in the forms of fiscal incentives and performance pay. More specifically, they point to three main policy responses that require more investigation: increasing salaries uniformly, reducing barriers to entry, and making teacher compensation more flexible.

## What It Means to Be a “Highly Qualified Teacher”

Author(s): Berry, B. Date: 2002

Source: Chapel Hill, NC: Southeast Center for Teaching Quality

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: <http://www.teachingquality.org/pdfs/definingHQ.pdf>

**Abstract:** This report illustrates the characteristics of highly qualified teachers in the context of the No Child Left Behind (NCLB) Act. The author discusses the inadequacy of the current assessments of new teachers and provides recommendations to improve teaching quality through teacher assessment and compensation. To this end, the report asserts the following ideas: states need to utilize more finely tuned definitions from the field to clarify who is qualified to teach; the federal government should help develop data infrastructures that track teachers' progress on teaching quality measures; universities need to invest more in assessing their new graduates in meeting the National Council for the Accreditation of Teacher Education's performance requirements; teachers who pass the test of teaching knowledge and performance assessment need to be paid more; school districts and states need to develop new teacher evaluation and relicensing tools that can push more experienced teachers toward meeting the highly qualified standard of the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards; school districts and universities should use the most accomplished teachers to prepare and support teacher candidates through alternative routes in new teacher induction programs; and, finally, teacher pay systems must move to provide salary benefits to its most qualified and accomplished teachers.

---

## Compensation and Teacher Attitudes, Motivation, and Job Satisfaction

### Assessment of the Motivational Reactions of Teachers to School-Based Performance Award Programs

Author(s): Heneman, H. G., III. Date: 1998

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 12(1), 43–59

Type: Scientific research; case study

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This article presents a case study of the School-Based Performance Award (SBPA) program implemented in the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Schools (CMS) and the initial results of the impact of the program on teacher motivation. The theoretical framework of the SBPA program is based on expectancy theory, which suggests that in an SBPA program, teachers' job performance is defined by student achievement results. The SBPA in CMS aimed to improve student achievement by increasing accountability and improving instruction. Data collected for the study was done by administering interviews of school principals and teachers that focused on their goals within, and expectations for, the programs. Initial results suggest that the student achievement goals of the program were considered to be understandable and that they should be held accountable for reaching achievement goals. Furthermore, the study discusses results on the perceptions of the SBPA by teachers and principals.

### A Comparison of District School Superintendents' and School Board Chair's Attitudes Toward Merit Pay Programs

Author(s): Hennly Seay, T., Smith, C., & Crews, W. B. Date: 1995

Source: *Public Personnel Management*, 24(1), 89–98

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This article provides the results of a merit pay survey distributed to 91 superintendents and school board members in several southern states. The survey intended to determine the level of support for merit-based programs by principals and superintendents. The survey examined the various demographics of the respondents and their functions of management, as described by Scanlon and Keys, to determine support for merit-based programs.

### Factors Which Deter Potential Science/Math Teachers from Teaching: Changes Necessary to Ameliorate Their Concerns

Author(s): Evans, R. H. Date: 1987

Source: *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 24(1), 77–85

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study used survey data from 98 freshmen at a medium-sized engineering university in the Midwest to examine the reasons potential teachers decide not to pursue teaching careers. Students cited low salaries as the primary reason for not entering teaching. Students identified as "teaching-oriented" listed not wanting to do the things that teachers do every day and a lack of job security as the second and third most important discouraging factors, while students who were not "teaching-oriented" identified poor job availability and not wanting to do the things that teachers do everyday as second and third most important. Students perceived teaching to involve a great deal of monotonous tasks and reported that friends and relatives often discouraged them from entering the teaching profession.

## How Does Money Affect Teachers' Career Choices? Evidence From NLS-72

Author(s): Han, Y.-K., & Rossmiller, R. A. Date: 2004

Source: *Journal of Education Finance*, 30(1), 79-100

Type: Scientific research; national reports; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study uses data about people who completed teacher training as measured in the National Longitudinal Study of the High School Class of 1972 (NLS-72) to examine multiple questions about the relationship between salary and choosing to teach. The authors found that differences in salary between teaching and other careers were important to men and not important women in choosing to start teaching. Other variables that increased the probability of starting teaching were a mathematics or science major for men and a high grade point average for women. Once teaching, low salary was the main reason given by men while family responsibilities was the main reason given by women for leaving teaching. Other factors associated with teachers who remained teaching were higher education levels, having fewer children, being female, and teaching elementary grades. The author recommends that increased salaries should attract more new teachers and reduce turnover.

## How Principals Can Attract Teachers to the Middle Grades

Author(s): Carter, M. S., & Carter, C. M. Date: 2000

Source: *Schools in the Middle*, 9(8), 23-25

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study explored the attitudes of teacher education majors concerning the possible choice to teach in middle school grades. Tabulations from a survey of 170 teacher candidates from North Carolina and Virginia were presented and discussed. Only nine percent of the respondents expressed an interest in middle school education. Concerns about classroom discipline and perceptions of adolescent attitudes were the main reasons given for not choosing middle school education. Respondents listed monetary incentives, smaller classes, strict discipline plans, scholarships, and waiver of licensure requirements as factors that might increase their motivation to teach in the middle grades.

## The Impact of the Teacher Advancement Program on Student Achievement, Teacher Attitudes, and Job Satisfaction

Author(s): Schacter, J., Schiff, T., Thum, Y. M., Fagnano, C., Bendotti, M., Solmon, L., et al. Date: 2002

Source: Santa Monica, CA: Milken Family Foundation

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study analyzes the achievement of students in schools in Arizona and the effects of the Teacher Advancement Program (TAP) on teachers' attitudes and satisfaction. Survey data show that teachers supported the different components of TAP, but that far fewer teachers supported TAP's accountability or pay for performance. The study found that the schools that implemented TAP had greater student achievement gains although these gains varied across the schools.

## Incentives for Teachers: What Motivates, What Matters?

Author(s): Johnson, S. M. Date: 1986

Source: *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 22(23), 54–79

Type: Literature review

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This article examines intrinsic and extrinsic motivation theories related to teachers; specifically, pay as an extrinsic factor and pride in one's work as an intrinsic factor. The author reviews the debates regarding merit pay compensation systems and how they affect teacher motivation. The research suggests that some concerns regarding pay for performance are echoed in discussions of career ladders and differentiated staffing plans because these systems are put into place as incentives for those teachers who want more and varied responsibility in their jobs. With organizational incentives, extrinsic rewards are targeted to the individual interested in financial gain. The author suggests further research should be conducted to understand the implications and interaction of intrinsic and extrinsic motivation factors in education

## Intrinsic and Extrinsic Motivation

Author(s): Straw, B. M. Date: 1989

Source: In H. J. Leavitt, L. R. Pondy, & D. M. Boje (Eds.), *Readings in Managerial Psychology* (4th ed.) (pp. 36–71). Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Type: Research reviews and books

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This research focuses on the different types of motivation in people. The study of motivation focuses on research in psychology; however it has implications for many professions, including teachers. The researchers hope to answer questions on the driving forces of motivation by reviewing recent research. The findings indicated that educational organizations are much like voluntary work organizations and their members are often intrinsically motivated to perform certain tasks while extrinsic rewards are generally not necessary to induce the performance of many desired behaviors.

## Intrinsic Motivation and Extrinsic Incentives

Author(s): Kreps, D. M. Date: 1997

Source: *The American Economic Review*, 87(2), 359–364

Type: Perspective piece; issue paper

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This article discusses the effect norms have on intrinsic motivation and economic incentives. People adhere to norms because adherence to norms leads to multiple benefits otherwise not reachable if norms are violated. In context of work, adherence to work norms can be economically beneficial or offer other extrinsic motivators. Intrinsic motivation is a response to extrinsic motivators.

## Job Satisfaction Among America's Teachers: Effects of Workplace Conditions, Background Characteristics, and Teacher Compensation

Author(s): Perie, M., & Baker, D. P. Date: 1997

Source: Washington, DC: National Center for Education Statistics

Type: Scientific research

Full text: <http://nces.ed.gov/pubs97/97471.pdf>

Abstract: This report from the National Center for Education Statistics explores satisfaction with teaching as a profession by looking at indicators associated with satisfaction, including salary, school characteristics, and teacher background. The 1993-94 Schools and Staffing Survey was the source of data for this study. The results from this study are presented using descriptive statistics and regression analysis and suggest that student behavior, administrative support, and teacher autonomy are working conditions important in teacher satisfaction. Teachers with fewer years of experience often experience more satisfaction than more experienced teachers, although teaching experience was not considered to be as significant an indicator of satisfaction as working conditions. The report discusses these and many other details in depth.

## Leading Gen Y Teachers: Emerging Strategies for School Leaders

Author(s): Behrstock, E., & Clifford, M. Date: 2009

Source: Washington, DC: National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality

Type: Literature review

Full text: <http://www.tqsource.org/publications/February2009Brief.pdf>

Abstract: This Research and Policy Brief, from the National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality, offers teacher-retention strategies specifically tailored to the next generation of American public-education practitioners, Generation Y. Defined as those born between 1977 and 1995, Gen Yers are characterized by realism and focus on achievement and commitment; "they are creative, innovative, and self-confident" (p. 2). As such, Gen Y teachers have a strong desire to fill teacher-leader positions and should be compensated accordingly. The brief considers ten different methods for supporting Gen Y teachers, including involving Gen Y teachers in the development of a vision and shared goals, empowering Gen Y teachers to assume leadership responsibilities from day one, providing professional development opportunities that involve collaboration and technology, and offering in-depth feedback and praise where appropriate.

## Merit Pay and Job Enlargement As Reforms: Incentives, Implementation, and Teacher Response

Author(s): Firestone, W. A. Date: 1991

Source: *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 13(3), 269–288

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This is an exploratory study of two school districts: one with a merit-pay system and another with a job-enlargement program. The merit-pay system provides financial rewards to teachers who demonstrate excellent performance in the form of bonuses (true merit pay) or permanent salary increases (master teacher programs). The job-enlargement program rewards some teachers to do more and different work. The findings suggest that job enlargement is more likely than merit pay to improve teacher motivation. It also enriches teaching materials and the range of instructional practice while merit pay standardizes it. Money does not contribute directly to teachers' commitments. Intrinsic incentives can be increased in the job-enlargement system; however, a crucial problem in getting intrinsic rewards for teachers is the lack of time.

## Merit Pay and the Evaluation Problem: Why Most Merit Pay Plans Fail and a Few Survive

Author(s): Murnane, R., & Cohen, D. Date: 1986

Source: *Harvard Educational Review*, 56(1), 1–17

Type: Scientific research; research reviews and books

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** Applying microeconomics to the issues of merit pay, this article examines why most merit pay systems have failed, and samples a few districts that have had success with merit pay plans. A historical review shows that merit pay systems were considered and implemented as early as 1918. Since that time, interest has grown both in paying teachers based on merit and on the impact of that reward structure. The authors argue that the merit pay models, as commonly implemented, have failed to motivate teachers to perform at higher levels. Interviews with principals revealed that merit pay systems are viewed as a hindrance, and can be decisive, hampering their abilities to work effectively and closely with teachers. The authors note that teacher performance evaluations should be carried out by experienced and knowledgeable administrators in order to be effective in determining performance-based incentives. In evaluating merit pay systems that have been implemented successfully, the authors found no evidence of sustained merit pay systems in urban districts, but did find evidence of success among a large number of smaller districts of homogenous students. The authors examined six school districts and found similar characteristics among them: they were the top ranked districts in their regions, the working conditions were positive, and the salaries were higher than other areas and were supplemented by merit pay. Other characteristics of these compensation systems were noted as having attributed to their success – making everyone feel important, extra pay for extra work and teacher participation in the plan design. However, these six systems did not appear to have impacted overall teacher quality, how teachers taught their students, or overall teacher motivation.

## Monetary Incentives and the Reform of Teacher Compensation: A Persistent Organizational Dilemma

Author(s): Jacobson, S. L. Date: 1995

Source: *International Journal of Educational Reform*, 4(1), 29–35

Type: Policy paper

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** The use of monetary incentives in the private sector is based on the basic economic assumption that workers will increase their level of effort if they believe their rewards will increase accordingly. The application of monetary incentives to education assumes that teachers are subject to the same income and leisure substitution effects as workers in other careers. Merit-pay plans have been tried in public education, but their use has always been short-lived. This article examines the conflicting values that underlie debates about the reform of teacher compensation. The author examines the effects of monetary incentives on teacher recruitment, retention, and absence, focusing on the conflicts in personal and organizational values that cause problems in teacher compensation. The author points out that while monetary incentives can influence teacher recruitment, retention, and attendance, their use tends to conflict with personal and societal expectations of what a good teacher is and wants.

## The Motivational Effects of School-Based Performance Awards

Author(s): Kelley, C., Odden, A., Milanowski, A., & Heneman, H., III. Date: 2000

Source: Philadelphia: Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: [http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content\\_storage\\_01/0000019b/80/16/2d/e3.pdf](http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/0000019b/80/16/2d/e3.pdf)

Abstract: From 1995–98, Consortium for Policy Research in Education teacher-compensation researchers conducted interviews and survey questionnaires of teachers and principals in three sites to measure the motivational effects of school-based performance award (SBPA) programs. The Charlotte-Mecklenburg's benchmark goals program and Kentucky's accountability program provided salary bonuses to all teachers in the school who met educational objectives. Maryland's school performance program provided monetary awards to schools that showed progress toward state standards. Goal clarity was related positively to school performance. Providing rewards for too many goals could diffuse effort and responsibility so teachers would lose focus on how to achieve the goals. The most important motivation to determine whether schools succeeded in meeting the SBPA performance goals was whether teachers thought they could produce the desired improvements. On average, teachers neither agreed nor disagreed that the SBPA programs were fair; teachers who perceived the programs as fair are likely to believe that their efforts could improve student performance. SBPA programs work to focus teacher and system attention on key educational goals. The authors suggest that the motivational effects of SBPA programs could be strengthened by a better communication of goals, enhanced teacher expectancy, enhanced teacher perceptions that earned awards will be funded, and experimentation with larger award amounts.

## Pay for Performance Where Output Is Hard to Measure:

### The Case of Performance Pay for School Teachers

Author(s): Marsden, D., & Belfield, R. Date: 2006

Source: London: Centre for Economic Performance

Type: Scientific research

Full text: <http://cep.lse.ac.uk/pubs/download/dp0747.pdf>

Abstract: This report explores the opinions of teachers before and after the implementation of a performance-based pay system in England and Wales in 2000. The new program allowed teachers to participate in an additional pay scale based on performance assessments as opposed to seniority. Using survey data from teachers participating in the program, descriptive analysis indicates that teacher opinions on the new system changed from initially being skeptical about performance pay to becoming more accepting of the program, in part due to the bargaining involved in the development of performance assessments. The authors go on to discuss the potential impact of performance pay on teachers and the need for negotiation in the development of components of performance assessment.

## Perceived Workplace Conditions and First-Year Teachers' Morale, Career Choice Commitment, and Planned Retention: A Secondary Analysis

Author(s): Weiss, E. M. Date: 1999

Source: *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 15, 861–879

Type: Scientific research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study used data from the 1987–88 and 1993–94 Schools and Staffing Surveys on more than 5,000 first-year teachers to examine the effects of perceived workplace conditions and other factors on morale and intentions to remain in teaching. Perceived school leadership, school culture, teacher autonomy, and discretion were the main factors predicting teacher morale and intentions to remain in teaching. The author argues for the importance of supportive principals and opportunities for teacher involvement in decision-making in particular. Salary was not a major influence on morale, but did predict intentions to leave in the 1987–88 sample. Student discipline and behavioral problems were linked with low teacher morale, though when teachers were able to influence discipline policy, morale and commitment were better. Middle school teachers had the lowest morale, while elementary school teachers were most likely to report intentions to remain in teaching.

## Performance Pay and Productivity

Author(s): Lazear, E. P. Date: 2000

Source: *The American Economic Review*, 90(5), 1346–1361

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available.

Abstract: This paper examines the theory that an incentive-based compensation structure spurs employee productivity by testing the theory in a private corporation. The data examined indicate that an incentive-based compensation structure results in a rise of employee productivity, which in this case, allowed the company to attract a more experienced workforce. In addition, company profits increased due, in part, to this new compensation structure.

## Performance Pay and Teachers' Effort, Productivity and Grading Ethics

Author(s): Lavy, V. Date: 2004

Source: *NBER Working Paper No. 10622*. Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article examines a performance pay plan in Israel featured cash bonuses for teachers whose students showed improvement on high school matriculation exams in mathematics, Hebrew, and English. Students' passing rates and average exam scores were the indicators used to measure student achievement. The program was structured in the form of a 'rank-order tournament' which rewarded teachers for their performance relative to teachers of the same subject. The theoretical framework relying on economic theory, suggests that extrinsic incentives can improve performance. Using school-level data, the effects of the incentive program are measured by using a regression discontinuity as propensity score matching. Results suggest that the incentive program had a positive impact on student achievement, which is attributed to changes in teacher performance.

### School-Based Performance Award Programs, Teacher Motivation, and School Performance: Findings From a Study of Three Programs

Author(s): Kelley, C., Heneman, H., III, & Milanowski, A. T. Date: 2000

Source: Philadelphia: CPRE Research Report Series, University of Pennsylvania, Graduate School of Education, Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: Rigorous research; state or regional reports; policy report

Full text: [http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content\\_storage\\_01/00000196/80/1b/26/55.pdf](http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/00000196/80/1b/26/55.pdf)

Abstract: This study looks at school-based performance award programs and their effect on student performance. The implementation of these programs is reported to have a positive impact on student performance. Using survey data, the authors describe the benefits of increased expectations and how individual and group motivation affects the teacher. The article goes on to examine principal reactions to expectancy changes.

### A Study of the Relationships Between Compensation Package, Work Motivation and Job Satisfaction

Author(s): Igalens, J., & Roussel, P. Date: 1999

Source: *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 20(7), 1003–1025

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study examines the three elements of total compensation's impact on job motivation and satisfaction. The study begins by detailing the total compensation package that consists of fixed pay, variable pay, and benefits. Using a questionnaire to gather opinions by French employees, the study concludes that work motivation and satisfaction are impacted by fixed pay of exempt employees. Variable pay and benefits did not show an impact on satisfaction.

### The Teacher Advancement Program (TAP): National Teacher Attitudes

Author(s): Agam, K., Reifsneider, D., & Wardell, D. Date: 2006

Source: Santa Monica, CA: The Teacher Advancement Program Foundation

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This report summarizes the findings of a Teacher Advancement Program (TAP) survey that was completed by approximately 1,700 teachers currently participating in the TAP program in spring 2005. The survey was designed to gauge their attitude about and satisfaction with the TAP program. Overall, the survey found that TAP teachers support the program, support for TAP increases over time, novice teachers are the most supportive of TAP, and teachers in all roles (master, mentor, career, specialist) support TAP.

### Teacher Attitudes Toward Pay for Performance: Evidence From Hillsborough County, Florida

Author(s): Jacob, B., & Springer, M. G. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Jacob\\_and\\_Springer\\_2008.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Jacob_and_Springer_2008.pdf)

Abstract: The authors administered a survey to all full-time instruction personnel in a large urban school district in Florida. Data was collected during a two-week period from 199 schools, and the survey was intended to gauge teacher attitudes toward pay-for-performance as well as to ask specific questions on the statewide pay-for-performance initiatives, MAP and STAR. The survey had a response rate of 20 percent. Overall, the survey indicated that there was a modest amount of support for pay-for-performance as a compensation system. The survey also found that teachers were more supportive of pay-for-performance compensation when they had strong principal leadership in their school. Finally, the survey indicated that among those teachers who responded to the survey, there was very little understanding of the Florida STAR and MAP performance-based compensation initiatives.

### Teachers' Attitudes About Teacher Bonuses Under School-Based Performance Award Programs

Author(s): Heneman, H. G., III, & Milanowski, A. T. Date: 1999

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 12(4), 327–341

Type: Case study; rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article examines the attitudes of teachers in School-Based Performance Award (SBPA) programs in the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Schools and in Kentucky and the bonuses awarded to teachers for increased student achievement. Teachers in both SBPAs were administered surveys aimed to gauge the perceived desirability of various rewards for increased achievement, both intrinsic and extrinsic. Results suggest that teachers in both SBPAs rated the bonuses among their top type of rewards. A separate analysis of Kentucky's SBPA suggests that teachers are not motivated highly by the bonuses, citing a satisfaction with the base salary of teachers in the state. The implications of these findings are discussed.

### Teachers' Attitudes Toward Merit Pay: Examining Conventional Wisdom

Author(s): Ballou, D., & Podgursky, M. Date: 1993

Source: *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*, 47(1), 50–61

Type: Scientific research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: The authors examined data from the 1987–88 Schools and Staffing Survey to investigate teachers' attitudes toward a merit-pay system. The conventional belief is that teachers oppose a merit-pay system because they doubt the fairness of performance evaluations, expect dissension and demoralization as a result of competition, and regard the base payment as too low. However, based on data from 56,000 public school and 11,500 private school teachers, a majority of teachers demoralized. The level of pay in the district appears to have no effect on teachers' attitudes in the survey favor a merit-pay system. Teachers in districts that use merit pay do not seem toward merit pay. In addition, teachers in the private sector are far more favorably inclined toward merit pay than are public school teachers.

### Teachers' Long-Range Teaching Plans: A Discriminate Analysis

Author(s): Hall, B. W., Pearson, C. L., & Carroll, D. Date: 1992

Source: *Journal of Educational Research*, 85(4), 221–225

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study used discriminate analysis to find differences between teachers who were contemplating quitting teaching and teachers whose long-range plans were to continue teaching. Data came from surveys of 369 public school teachers in a large urban district in Florida. Compared with those who were contemplating quitting, teachers who planned to stay in teaching reported more satisfaction with their job, less stress, and more satisfaction with their current salary. Those who planned to stay in teaching believed they had more influence over their students and had more positive attitudes toward school administration, teaching, and students than did teachers who considered leaving the profession. Teachers who planned to quit cited insufficient rewards, limited opportunity for advancement, and stressful working conditions as the most important reasons teachers leave the teaching profession.

### Teachers' Perceptions of Their Jobs: A Multilevel Analysis of the Teacher Follow-up Survey for 1994–95

Author(s): Liu, X. S., & Meyer, J. P. Date: 2005

Source: *Teachers College Record*, 107(5), 985–1003

Type: Scientific research; national reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This study uses a national representative survey (i.e., Schools and Staffing Survey of 1993 and associated follow-up) to examine teacher satisfaction with student discipline, school climate, professional support, compensation, and work conditions. The study then examines the relationship between teacher satisfaction and whether teachers worked in a public or private school, whether they had left their school, and whether they were a minority. Generally, teachers were most satisfied with professional support and school climate and least satisfied with compensation and discipline. Private school teachers were more satisfied in every area except compensation. Those who left their schools were less satisfied with every area except compensation. Minority teachers were less satisfied in every area measured. The researchers suggest these findings support policies to improve discipline instead of increased compensation.

---

## Examples of Compensation Reform

### Alternative Teacher Compensation in Manitowoc, Wisconsin: Six Years Later

Author(s): Carlson, J. Date: 2006

Source: Sheboygan, WI: Kettle Moraine UniServ Council

Type: Case study

Full text: [http://www.edcomp.org/uploadedFiles/Content/Research\\_and\\_Reports/The%20Manitowoc%20Story.pdf](http://www.edcomp.org/uploadedFiles/Content/Research_and_Reports/The%20Manitowoc%20Story.pdf)

Abstract: This case study examines the alternative teacher-pay system implemented in Wisconsin's Manitowoc School District in the late 1990s. As laid out in the 1999–2001 Collective Bargaining Agreement, the new system was designed to incentivize the pursuit of knowledge and professional development in an innovative way. Rather than being rewarded only for the achievement of an advanced degree, Manitowoc's new system allows teachers to move ahead on the pay scale incrementally; the increments are aligned with measurable progress toward advanced degrees. The hypothesis was that teachers would be further incentivized to attain advanced degrees if they could be rewarded for effort throughout the process. In the six years between implementation and this report, there was a significant increase in both positive teacher behavior (as measured in numbers of teachers with advanced degrees) and student achievement.

### The Benwood Plan: A Lesson in Comprehensive Teacher Reform

Author(s): Silva, E. Date: 2008

Source: Washington, DC: Education Sector

Type: Case study

Full text: [http://www.educationsector.org/usr\\_doc/TheBenwoodPlan.pdf](http://www.educationsector.org/usr_doc/TheBenwoodPlan.pdf)

Abstract: This report tells the story of the Benwood Initiative in Hamilton County, Tennessee. The Benwood Initiative utilized funds from the Benwood Foundation and other local organizations to address eight low-performing and high-poverty schools in Hamilton County. The initiative included instituting a policy by which all teachers, approximately 300, had to reapply for their placements. In addition, the initiative focused on intensive professional development for all teachers and financial incentives awarded to teachers who increased student achievement. Student achievement has steadily increased during the past six years, and teacher retention also has increased.

### A Case Study of the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Public Schools School-Based Performance Award Program

Author(s): Johnson, A., Potter, P., Pughsley, J., Wallace, C., Kellor, E., & Odden, A. Date: 1999

Source: Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin–Madison, Wisconsin Center for Education Research

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: <http://cpre.wceruw.org/papers/Charlotte-Mecklenburg%20SBPA%204-99.pdf>

Abstract: This report details the history of the pay-for-performance program in Charlotte-Mecklenburg County. The initial plan evolved into a school-based performance award program rewarding individual and group improvements.

### Catalyst for Change: Pay for Performance in Denver Final Report

Author(s): Community Training and Assistance Center Date: 2004

Source: Boston: Community Training and Assistance Center

Type: Scientific research

Full text: <http://www.ctacusa.com/PDFs/Rpt-CatalystChangeFull-2004.pdf>

Abstract: The Denver Pay-for-Performance plan was created under the joint sponsorship of the Denver Public Schools and the Denver Classroom Teachers Association. The pilot program was run from 1999–2003 in hopes of creating a link between student achievement and teacher compensation. This report details the pilot program and investigates the effect the pilot had on student achievement as well as the teachers. Collecting data from pilot schools in the form of surveys and interviews of all stakeholders in education, a quantitative analysis suggests that the pilot program positively affected student achievement.

### Catching Up With the Vaughn Express: Six Years of Standards-Based Teacher Evaluation and Performance Pay

Author(s): Kellor, E. Date: 2005

Source: *Educational Policy Analysis Archives*, 13(7)

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaa/v13n7/v13n7.pdf>

Abstract: The Vaughn Next Century Learning Center is a public conversion charter school in the Los Angeles Unified School District. Vaughn Center developed a new knowledge- and skills-based pay program in 1997–98 school year. This also came with a new evaluation system. This paper provides an overview of the development and evolution of the performance-pay program and the new teacher evaluation system implemented at the Vaughn Center. Vaughn teachers' reactions to these innovations are discussed. Finally, the author offers key recommendations to help those who plan to implement knowledge- and skills-based pay or standards-based teacher evaluation.

### Challenging Myths: The Benwood Initiative and Education Reform in Hamilton County

Author(s): Handley, C., & Kronley, R. A. Date: 2006

Source: Chattanooga, TN: Public Education Foundation and Benwood Foundation

Type: Case study

Full text: <http://www.pefchattanooga.org/Portals/0/Benwood/challengingmyths.pdf>

Abstract: This report tells the story of the Benwood Initiative, a five-year school-reform collaboration between the Benwood Foundation, the Hamilton County Department of Education, and the Public Education Foundation, all located in and around Chattanooga, Tennessee. Targeting nine at-risk elementary schools in the area, the initiative attempts to take on all aspects of school reform, from setting high expectations for students to providing fiscal incentives for teachers to building the capacity of school leaders. After four years of active intervention, significant gains have been made in all nine schools in 3rd grade standardized test scores and in the percentage of 3rd grade students reading on grade level.

## Cincinnati: A Case Study of the Design of a School-Based Performance Award Program

Author(s): Kellor, E., & Odden, A. Date: 1999

Source: Madison, WI: Consortium for Policy Research in Education, University of Wisconsin–Madison

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This report details the process of implementing a pay-for-performance pilot in Cincinnati schools. This process involved the school district and the union working together to devise a plan to create a program that would benefit schools as well as teachers. The need to create a school-based performance award program was not only aimed at improving student performance, but also to raise accountability and to incorporate that into the program. The article details changes to the plan throughout time.

## Cincinnati's New Approach to Teacher Compensation

Author(s): Odden, A. Date: 2002

Source: *School Business Affairs*, 68(5), 20–23

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article describes the Cincinnati public school district's efforts in restructuring its teacher compensation system from a traditional single-salary schedule to a performance-based payment system, which uses both a knowledge- and skills-based salary structure and school-based performance award. The three major steps in making this change are: (1) developing acceptable teaching standards, which then were organized into four domains: planning and preparing for student learning, creating a learning environment, teaching for learning, and professionalism; (2) restructuring of teacher evaluation system; and (3) creating a new salary schedule that includes five categories of teachers: apprentice, novice, career, advanced, and accomplished. The author also summarizes findings from the pilot implementation of this new teacher compensation system in 10 schools during 1999–2000 school year.

## Developing a Performance Pay Plan for Teachers: A Process, Not an Event

Author(s): Hartman, D., & Weil, R. Date: 1997

Source: Paper submitted to the American Federation of Teachers Research Department

Type: Policy paper; issue paper

Full text: <http://67.199.26.188/topics/teacher-quality/downloads/perfplan.pdf>

Abstract: This report details the performance pay plan in Douglas County, Colorado. Information is presented on the inspiration to reform teacher compensation in the county, along with the structure of the committee and process for developing the performance pay system. There is also an overview of the plan implemented by the county and lessons learned. The program consists of multiple performance pay options, providing teachers with a sense of professional collaboration. The goal of the program is to encourage higher levels of teacher performance while avoiding old concepts of merit pay based on student achievement.

## Different Designs, Common Paths:A First Look at the Ohio Teacher Incentive Fund

Author(s): Raue, K., MacAllum, K., Winkler, A., & Ristow, L. Date: 2008

Source: Ohio Teacher Incentive Fund, *Issue Paper*

Type: Policy paper; perspective piece; literature review

Full text: <http://www.ode.state.oh.us/GD/DocumentManagement/DocumentDownload.aspx?DocumentID=62740>

Abstract: This issue paper provides an overview of the Ohio Teacher Incentive Fund (TIF) program. The Ohio TIF is currently implemented in four districts in the state: Cincinnati, Cleveland, Columbus, and Toledo. The paper offers insight into the key features of each of the programs within the four districts. The paper also discusses the importance of stakeholder buy-in and how clear communication can facilitate necessary buy-in. The paper concludes with the essential resources needed for the successful implementation of teacher incentive programs.

## Diversifying Teacher Compensation

Author(s): Azordegan, J., Byrnett, P., Campbell, K., Greenman, J., & Coulter, T. Date: 2005

Source: Denver, CO: Education Commission of the States

Type: Issue paper

Full text: <http://www.ecs.org/clearinghouse/65/83/6583.pdf>

Abstract: This report details state efforts to reform teacher compensation since 1995, including revisiting past pay-for-performance programs. Reform efforts were placed within three frameworks: maintaining current systems while dedicating state funds to bonuses for teachers based on student achievement, teacher incentive programs, and pilot programs completely dedicated to linking pay to student performance. The authors discuss state-, district-, and school-level examples including Minnesota's Quality Compensation (Q Comp) plan.

## Douglas County Colorado Performance Pay Plan

Author(s): Kelley, C. Date: 2000

Source: Madison, WI: Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article details the history of the pay for performance program implemented in Douglas County, Colorado in 1994. This program was developed in the height of a population boom in the county, at a time where there was growing desire to implement such a system. The program would remove the single salary schedule and reward teachers based on skill. The article looks at changes made to the program over time, in order to focus on the strong aspects of the program, such as promoting teacher skill development and group collaboration.

## Eyes on the Prize: Performance Pay for Principals and Teachers Who Produce Results

Author(s): Bushweller, K. Date: 1999

Source: *American School Board Journal*, 186(8), 18–22

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: The author asserts that Douglas County's performance-pay program, which includes teachers as well as administrators, is one of the most comprehensive and well-designed performance-pay systems in the country. It recognizes individual achievements and offers financial rewards to groups and whole schools. The district's performance-pay program is broken into four key components: outstanding performance, skills blocks, group incentive, and district responsibility pay. Outstanding performance is demonstrated with the achievement of a goal in improving student achievement. Skills blocks require teachers to demonstrate the knowledge and skills they acquired from a specified course. Group incentive pays bonuses to a teacher group that presents data showing that their group effort has improved student achievement. Finally, district responsibility pay is awarded to teachers who contribute to special committees. The author discusses the advantages and drawbacks of performance-pay systems.

## How Vaughn Next Century Learning Center Developed a Knowledge- and Skill-Pay Program

Author(s): Kellor, E., Milanowski, A. T., & Odden, A. R. Date: 2000

Source: Madison, WI: Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: <http://cpre.wceruw.org/papers/vaughn%20KSBP%208-01.pdf>

Abstract: This article details the pay for performance programs implemented in the Vaughn Next Century Learning Center. The system was to be competency-based, promoting increasing student achievement as well as teacher retention. This smaller-scale pilot ultimately led to redesigning the compensation for all new teachers, and aligned itself with the goals of Vaughn.

## The Implementation and Early Findings From a Professional Development and Performance Based Teacher Compensation System

Author(s): Mathis, W. J. Date: 2002

Source: Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, New Orleans, LA

Type: Case study

Full text: [http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content\\_storage\\_01/0000019b/80/1a/4e/ad.pdf](http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/0000019b/80/1a/4e/ad.pdf)

Abstract: This paper described the process used at the Rutland Northeast school district in Vermont in developing a new teacher compensation system that links teacher compensation to school and district goals instead of student achievement test scores. Under the new system, teachers present a professional portfolio, which mirrors the state's relicensing criteria, to a committee made up of board members, administrators, and peers. This portfolio contains annual professional-growth plans, annual summative evaluations, and evidence of meeting the state standards. Requirements may be met by a combination of courses, workshops, mentoring, public engagements, or any other appropriate academic activity. They avoid direct links of achievement test scores to teacher pay. They also emphasize a plan for a smooth transition from an old to a new system. The author summarizes six factors leading to the successful program adoption, including: all teachers can participate, professional development is broadly defined, group activities are counted, sufficient development and implementation time is provided, the boards and teachers have leadership maturity, and the plan progresses with recognition of local culture and synergy. The author reports preliminary findings from the implementation of the program in the first two years. The transition to the new compensation system has been smooth because of the consistency of the committees and the mature leadership of school board members, administrators, and teachers.

## A Leap of Faith? Performance Pay for Teachers

Author(s): Storey, A. Date: 2000

Source: *Journal of Education Policy*, 15(5), 509–523

Type: Perspective piece

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This report evaluates the plans and preparations of the English government for a new performance-management and performance pay scheme for teachers. The rationale for England's new merit-pay model was first provided in the Green Paper "Teachers: Meeting the Challenge of Change," published in 1998. Storey's paper explains the implementation stages of the strategy set out in the Green Paper and sheds light on the feelings of teachers nationwide with regard to the new scheme.

## Pathway to Results: Pay for Performance in Denver

Author(s): Bell, D. A., Gratz, D. B., Helms, B. J., Slotnik, W. J., & Smith, M. Date: 2001

Source: Boston: Community Training and Assistance Center

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: <http://www.ctacusa.com/PDFs/Rpt-PathwaytoResults-2001.pdf>

Abstract: This report examines the impact of the Denver ProComp pay-for-performance program during the pilot year and the first full year of implementation (1999–2001). Using surveys, interviews, and extant data from schools and the district, the researchers examine the initial impact of ProComp. Specifically, the researchers focus on the impact on student achievement and teacher objectives in addition to factors at the school level that impact teachers. The study includes detailed data analysis and recommendations for the continued implementation of the program.

## Pay for Performance: It Can Work—Here's How

Author(s): Delisio, E. R. Date: 2003

Source: *Education World*

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://www.educationworld.com/a\\_issues/issues/issues374c.shtml](http://www.educationworld.com/a_issues/issues/issues374c.shtml)

Abstract: This article is a snapshot look at the performance pay systems in place in Colorado. The Douglas and Denver County programs have been maintained and are working on a basic level. The article indicates that the program working in Douglas County can be attributed to teacher participation in developing the system. It also indicates that Denver is not far behind in making the program sustainable.

## Pay-for-Performance: Key Questions and Lessons From Five Current Models

Author(s): Wyman, W., & Allen, M. Date: 2001

Source: Denver, CO: Education Commission of the States

Type: State or regional reports; policy paper; issue paper

Full text: <http://www.ecs.org/clearinghouse/28/30/2830.htm>

Abstract: This report looks at the idea of a teacher pay scale based on performance, which many districts and states are beginning to create and implement. The issue paper looks at five different pay-for-performance models, detailing the key issues for policymakers to be aware of. The paper also summarizes current models for pay-for-performance and provides references for further information on the programs.

### Pay for Performance: More States Brave Teacher-Pay Debate

Author(s): Delisio, E. R. Date: 2003

Source: *Education World*

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://www.educationworld.com/a\\_issues/issues/issues374d.shtml](http://www.educationworld.com/a_issues/issues/issues374d.shtml)

Abstract: This article discusses the new policies and programs related to pay for performance that states are engaging in. The examples in the article are of new programs in Arizona, Florida, Iowa, and Kentucky. These programs all focus on teachers working together to improve student achievement as a side bonus to the compensation reform.

### Performance Incentives in Texas: Why Schools Chose Not to Participate

Author(s): Lewis, J. L., & Springer, M. G. Date: 2008

Source: *Working Paper 2008-18*. Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Lewis\\_and\\_Springer\\_2008.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Lewis_and_Springer_2008.pdf)

Abstract: This report focuses on the teacher incentive program in Texas and why a significant number of schools decided not to participate in the Texas Educator Excellence Grant (TEEG). The authors use data from the evaluation of the TEEG program to conduct their research. Their findings from the data indicate that schools were concerned about the structure of the TEEG program, specifically the distribution of awards, the effect of performance incentives on school culture, the school selection process, and the implementation of the program.

### ProComp: Denver Public Schools Professional Compensation System for Teachers

Author(s): Denver Public Schools Date: 2005

Source: Denver, CO: Denver Public Schools

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: ProComp is a compensation system that links teacher pay to the school district's instructional mission. Designed in a partnership between the Denver Classroom Teachers Association and Denver Public Schools, ProComp has received national attention because it rewards teachers for their professional accomplishments while linking pay to student achievement. ProComp promotes improved student achievement by rewarding teachers with bonuses and salary increases for improved student performance and encouraging talented teachers to work in schools and assignments with the greatest needs.

## Recruiting and Retaining Quality Teachers for High-Needs Schools: Insights From NBCT Summits and Other Policy Initiatives

Author(s): Berry, B., Rasberry, M., & Williams, A. Date: n.d.

Source: Hillsborough, NC: Center for Teaching Quality

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.teachingquality.org/legacy/Nat\\_Strategy\\_Forum.pdf](http://www.teachingquality.org/legacy/Nat_Strategy_Forum.pdf)

Abstract: This policy brief provides an informal case study of innovative recruitment and retention strategies for National Board Certified Teachers in five different states: North Carolina, Ohio, Oklahoma, South Carolina, and Washington. These strategies are targeted specifically toward teachers who are certified by the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (NBCTs) due to overwhelming evidence that “poor children and those of color are far less likely to be taught by qualified teachers” (p. 1). With this in mind, the incentives discussed in this paper are aimed at attracting NBCTs to high-needs and high-risk schools. The recommendations in this brief come directly from NBCT summits held nationwide during which these highly qualified teachers collaborate with policymakers to find solutions to the qualified teacher shortage.

## Reflecting on Ten Years of Incentive Programs: The 1993 SREB Career Ladder Clearinghouse Survey

Author(s): Cornett, L., & Gaines, G. F. Date: 1994

Source: Atlanta, GA: Southern Regional Education Board

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content\\_storage\\_01/0000019b/80/13/8d/a0.pdf](http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/0000019b/80/13/8d/a0.pdf)

Abstract: This report reviews teacher incentive programs across the country. Career ladders, providing bonuses for advanced certification, and mentoring and coaching are programs that have been utilized throughout the Southern Regional Education Board states in an attempt to implement incentive programs that also would support state accountability requirements. The report also examines the history of pay-for-performance programs and the lessons learned from pay-for-performance programs implemented in the 1980s and 1990s.

## School and Teacher Performance Incentives: The Latin American Experience

Author(s): Mizala, A., & Romaguera, P. Date: 2004

Source: *International Journal of Educational Development*, 24(6), 739–754

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.sciencedirect.com/science?\\_ob=ArticleURL&\\_udi=B6VD7-4DDXNBX-1&\\_user=10&\\_rdoc=1&\\_fmt=&\\_orig=search&\\_sort=d&view=c&\\_acct=C000050221&\\_version=1&\\_urlVersion=0&\\_userid=10&md5=f46d3272d47d774f6db98fb8ad9e546f](http://www.sciencedirect.com/science?_ob=ArticleURL&_udi=B6VD7-4DDXNBX-1&_user=10&_rdoc=1&_fmt=&_orig=search&_sort=d&view=c&_acct=C000050221&_version=1&_urlVersion=0&_userid=10&md5=f46d3272d47d774f6db98fb8ad9e546f)

Abstract: This paper provides an analysis of teacher performance evaluation systems tied to monetary incentives used in Latin America. The systems include career ladders in Mexico, merit wages, and school awards in Bolivia; school awards in El Salvador; and individual teacher awards in Chile. Case analysis indicates that school-level evaluation programs offering group incentives for performance provide more to the educational improvement process than individual evaluation programs offering individual incentives. In all analyzed programs, there is a greater emphasis on educational inputs than outputs (e.g., student and teacher performance). The authors discuss the impact of these programs on future incentives and educational achievement.

## School Systems and Teachers Unions Mull Over Performance Pay

Author(s): Delisio, E. R. Date: 2000

Source: *Education World*

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://www.educationworld.com/a\\_issues/issues135.shtml](http://www.educationworld.com/a_issues/issues135.shtml)

Abstract: This article focuses on a new salary structure adopted by the Cincinnati Federation of Teachers. Performance based pay for teachers is still being debated among many education stakeholders. The new Cincinnati program will focus on teacher evaluations for the performance measurement, similar to the program in Douglas County, Colorado. The goal is to take note of the lessons learned for the program to be a success.

## The Uniform Salary Schedule

Author(s): Jupp, B. Date: 2005

Source: *Education Next*, 1

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20051\\_10.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20051_10.pdf)

Abstract: This brief article looks at Denver's merit pay system, and the union and teacher response to these programs. Recognizing that Denver's single salary schedule could properly reward teachers in today's current landscape, Jupp acknowledges that teachers are in favor in creating a salary schedule that takes into account performance.