

# *Bibliography*

## Performance Measures



This annotated bibliography contains publications that discuss measures used in evaluating the performance of educators and schools, especially as those evaluations relate to compensation.

This bibliography presents findings from a thorough scan of the literature. CECR does not necessarily promote the ideas shared in the publications but seeks to present the reader with a comprehensive list of recent relevant publications on various subtopics of compensation reform.

Each citation includes the following information:

- The title, author, source, and date of publication
- The publication type—CECR has typed each publication according to one or more of the following eight publication types.
  - **Scientific research:** Peer-reviewed reports on quantitative or qualitative research
  - **Rigorous research:** Peer-reviewed reports on research of a more general nature
  - **Case study:** Systematic reviews of one or more individual compensation reform initiatives
  - **Policy paper:** Reports on public policies affecting educator compensation reform
  - **Issue paper:** Brief overviews of specific educator compensation reform topics of interest that might prove useful to those implementing such programs
  - **Information guide:** Practical suggestions for implementing educator compensation reform programs
  - **Literature review:** Systematic evaluations of educator compensation reform research or reflections on the current state of the art
  - **Perspective piece:** First-person reflections offering perspective or personal experience with educator compensation reform programs
- A link to the publication if it is electronically available
- An abstract of the publication

---

## Actionable Feedback: Unlocking the Power of Learning and Performance Improvement

Author(s): Cannon, M. D., & Witherspoon, R. Date: 2005

Source: *Academy of Management Executive*, 19(2), 120–134

Type: Issue paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article discusses how cognitive and emotional dynamics complicate the process of giving and receiving feedback. These dynamics can make people react negatively to feedback and not allow constructive impact. For givers of feedback, these dynamics can prevent them from providing feedback that is useful. This article details how this process occurs and the emotional and cognitive dynamic relationship to both giving and receiving critical feedback.

## Advances in Teacher Assessments and Their Uses

Author(s): Porter, A. C., Youngs, P., & Odden, A. Date: 2000

Source: In V. Richardson (Ed.), *Handbook on Research and Teaching* (2nd ed.)

Type: National reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: The authors present a comprehensive overview of the many components of teacher assessment. They begin with a brief discussion documenting the various available teacher assessments, their purposes, and the processes around development, administration, and measurement of the tests. The authors then share information about recent developments around performance-based assessments, such as Praxis and National Board assessments. The information includes purposes, development, similarities and differences, and some technical aspects of the tests. They then present a summary of studies regarding psychometric issues of the tests. At the state level, the authors provide information about the implementation of these teacher assessments in both Connecticut and California. They do the same at the local level for Cincinnati, Ohio, and Rochester, New York. The report concludes with a brief description of the Tennessee Value-Added Assessment System and examples of using assessments for teacher compensation.

## Aligning Teacher Compensation With Systemic School Reform: Skill-Based Pay and Group-Based Performance Awards

Author(s): Mohrman, A. M., Mohrman, S. A., & Odden, A. R. Date: 1996

Source: *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 18(1), 51–71

Type: Scientific research; policy paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: The educational reform strategy requires that teachers develop a new array of professional knowledge and skills. It also requires a change in the organization and management of schools to focus on performance. This article describes a potential compensation structure that is consistent with these changes. Drawing on recent organization and compensation theory and practice, the authors emphasize the importance of matching pay practices to the strategic needs of the organizations. Core notions of skill-based pay in education are that knowledge and skills needed by the organization would be described explicitly, and individuals would be assessed against objective standards to determine whether they had and could use the skills. Skill-based pay is particularly appropriate in settings in which we want to motivate people to acquire new skills so they can contribute more flexibly and broadly to the school's purpose. The authors discuss three types of skills: depth, breadth, and vertical. The authors suggested a number of steps to follow in creating a skills-based pay system. The article shows how various components in the compensation system work and outlines several ways each component could be incorporated into a revised compensation system.

---

## All Teachers Are Not the Same

Author(s): Koppich, J. E. Date: 2005

Source: *Education Next*, 1

Type: Policy paper; issue paper

Full text: <http://educationnext.org/all-teachers-are-not-the-same/>

Abstract: This article looks at the need to adapt a new teacher salary schedule that is based on incorporating all facets of teaching, not just student performance, into a merit-based system. Existing compensation systems do not acknowledge the complexity of the teaching profession, and they do not reward performance. Compensation that relies solely on test scores fails to address value-added issues associated with measuring teacher performance.

## Alternative Teacher Compensation

Author(s): Goorian, B. Date: 2000

Source: *ERIC Digest Number 142*. Eugene, OR: ERIC Clearinghouse on Educational Policy and Management

Type: Case study

Full text: [http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content\\_storage\\_01/0000019b/80/16/92/16.pdf](http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/0000019b/80/16/92/16.pdf)

Abstract: This report examines various alternative methods of teacher compensation. The single-salary schedule, which pays individual teachers on the basis of their years of experience and educational units or degrees has been criticized for valuing seat time more than teaching skill. The four main types of alternative compensation systems are discussed: Pay for performance, knowledge- and skills-based pay systems, school-based performance award programs, and compensation for certification with the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards. Cincinnati is the first big-city public school district to replace the traditional salary structures with compensation based on evaluations of teachers grouped into five career categories ranging from “apprentice” to “accomplished,” with specific goals and standards attached to each. Denver’s pilot program offers three different pay-for-performance plans. The performance is evaluated from standardized test scores, achievement on teacher-made assessments, and acquisition of new knowledge and skills. Douglas County, Colorado, used multifaceted, comprehensive compensation plans that combine pay-for-performance plans and knowledge- and-skills-based plans. The author suggests many resources for guidance in teacher compensation, including the Consortium for Policy Research in Education’s Teacher Compensation Project; a Milken Family Foundation report; and publications by the American Federation of Teachers, the National Commission on Teaching and America’s Future, and *Education Week*.

## An “Education Professions Performance Development Act”: A Prospectus for Providing “Highly Qualified” and More Motivated Teachers and Leaders for America’s Schools

Author(s): Guthrie, J. W. Date: 2005

Source: *Peabody Journal of Education*, 80(3), 6–14

Type: Policy paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article presents the proposed Education Professions Performance Development Act, which includes changes to the No Child Left Behind Act to introduce a fair and accurate teacher assessment and reward system based on performance. The author examines value-added measurement and barriers to its implementation and expands on these barriers, providing proposed policy changes that represent a developmental effort to address unresolved issues.

---

## An Empirical Analysis of Teacher Spillover Effects in Secondary School

Author(s): Koedel, C. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/news/PapersNews/Koedel\\_2008Empirical\\_Analysis.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/news/PapersNews/Koedel_2008Empirical_Analysis.pdf)

Abstract: This paper explores teacher impact effects across subjects. The paper uses data from a secondary school from the San Diego Unified School District. The goal of the study was to determine teacher spillover effects using value-added measurements. The report concludes that mathematics teachers do not have an impact on reading test scores as previously thought.

## Assessing and Supporting New Teachers: Lessons From the Southeast

Author(s): Berry, B., Hopkins-Thompson, P., & Hoke, M. Date: 2002

Source: Chapel Hill, NC: Southeast Center for Teaching Quality

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content\\_storage\\_01/0000019b/80/1a/dc/04.pdf](http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/0000019b/80/1a/dc/04.pdf)

Abstract: This report examines the progress of southeastern states in new-teacher assessment and support programs. The authors highlighted the programs in Connecticut and North Carolina. Connecticut's Beginning Educator Support and Training system is the most developed program in the nation and has made the most progress in connecting its assessment and support components, which span up to three years of a new teacher's career. North Carolina's performance-based licensing system is the most comprehensive program in the region, but its development has been threatened by infrastructure problems. The authors offer a set of recommendations for effective new-teacher assessment and support programs, including: providing teachers with opportunities to observe and analyze good teaching in real classrooms; assisting teachers in transferring knowledge, skills, beliefs, and attitudes to improve student learning; providing ongoing guidance and assessment by an expert; eliminating unnecessary workload; providing mentor support to assist teachers to meet standards; and including rigorous evaluations that determine the effectiveness of the program.

---

## Assessing the Potential of Using Value-Added Estimates of Teacher Job Performance for Making Tenure Decisions

Author(s): Goldhaber, D., & Hansen, M. Date: 2008

Source: Seattle, WA: Center on Reinventing Public Education

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.crpe.org/cs/crpe/download/csr\\_files/brief\\_crpe\\_badclass\\_nov08.pdf](http://www.crpe.org/cs/crpe/download/csr_files/brief_crpe_badclass_nov08.pdf)

Abstract: In recent years, education researchers and policymakers alike have conceptualized and posited many different strategies for evaluating teacher effectiveness. One strategy, value-added modeling, has emerged as both widely recognized and highly controversial. In this research brief, authors Dan Goldhaber and Michael Hansen of the Center on Reinventing Public Education examine the utility and stability of value-added modeling, and provide accompanying policy recommendations and implications. Using a longitudinal data set provided by the North Carolina Department of Public Instruction, the researchers attempt to find a correlation between teacher effectiveness (as measured by value-added methods) and student achievement, both for pretenure and posttenure teachers. In addition, it is noteworthy that the sample size drops significantly for the second group of teachers; only roughly 500 of the original 1,363 teachers observed stayed in teaching long enough to gain posttenure status. The resulting statistics provide mixed results, which could be used to fuel either side of the value-added debate. On the one hand, the study shows that “a nontrivial percentage of teachers who are found to be ineffective pretenure appear to be more effective in a posttenure period” (p. 10). On the other hand, descriptive data about these teachers imply that school administrators are not selective about which teachers receive tenure, which could damage the validity of pro-tenure arguments.

## Assessment of Teacher Reactions to a Standards-Based Teacher Evaluation System: A Pilot Study

Author(s): Milanowski, A. T., & Heneman, H. G., III. Date: 2004

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 15(3), 193–212

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: A new standards-based teacher evaluation system has been developed in a medium-size Midwestern school district based on the Danielson Framework for teaching. This study assesses teachers' reaction to a pilot implementation of this new evaluation system in 1999–2000 school year, using survey and interview methods. Overall, teachers neither fully embraced the new system nor rejected it out of hand. Teachers perceived both positive and negative aspects of the system. While most teachers accepted the evaluation standards and the need for a new evaluation system, many also perceived the system as adding too much workload on teachers. As a result of the pilot test, significant changes in the evaluation system were made before its full implementation in all schools in the 2000–01 school year.

## Audit of Principal Effectiveness: A Method for Self-Improvement

Author(s): Valentine, J. W., & Bowman, M. L. Date: 1988

Source: *National Association of Secondary School Principals Bulletin*, 72(508), 18–26

Type: Issue paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This issue paper briefly discusses the measurement of principal effectiveness. To fulfill the leadership roles necessary, principals consistently must obtain appropriate feedback. The principal then must find methods to identify the feedback and analyze the data. This article discusses effective methods that can be used for principal evaluation.

---

## The Business Model

Author(s): Greene, J. P. Date: 2002

Source: *Education Next*, 2, 20–22.

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20022\\_20.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20022_20.pdf)

Abstract: This article focuses on the usefulness of value-added analysis in measuring accountability. While there are many arguments against the use of value-added analysis, this issue paper posits that the development of a value-added testing system might create a data pool that could improve hiring systems, promotion of schools, and teacher compensation. The article also theorizes that value-added systems could improve the governing of schools and hold them accountable.

## A Case Study of the Boston Public Schools School Improvement Awards

Author(s): Schwedel, A., Veysey, P., Conti, E., Kellor, E., & Odden, A. Date: 2000

Source: Madison, WI: Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: Case study

Full text: <http://cpre.wceruw.org/papers/Boston%20SBPA%203-00.pdf>

Abstract: This case study explores the Boston Public Schools School Improvement Award program. This program is a combination of two previous programs that were designed to assist school improvement through accountability indicators and schoolwide incentives. The program is one part of a multi-pronged strategic plan to increase student achievement. The program uses the ninth edition of the Stanford Achievement Test to measure student achievement. The awards are not distributed to individual teachers as a bonus but rather shared schoolwide and can be used for supplies and other discretionary purposes.

## A Case Study of the Dallas Public School School-Based Performance Award Program

Author(s): Mendro, B., Olivarez, R., Peters, M., Milanowski, T., Kellor, E., & Odden, A. Date: 1999

Source: Madison, WI: Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: Case study

Full text: <http://cpre.wceruw.org/papers/Dallas%20SBPA%201-99.pdf>

Abstract: This case study explores the school-based performance program in Dallas, Texas. The program was designed to increase district and school accountability for increased student achievement. The program offered varying monetary awards including \$1,000 for professional staff, \$500 for support staff, and \$2,000 for a school activity fund. The Dallas School Effectiveness Index, a compilation of student test results, schoolwide attendance, dropout and/or promotion rates, and participation in AP classes and college entrance examinations at the secondary level, was used as the performance measure to determine awards.

---

## A Case Study of the State of Kentucky's School-Based Performance Award Program

Author(s): Willis, T., Koch, K., Lampe, G., Young, R., Kellor, E., & Odden, A. Date: 1999

Source: Madison, WI; Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: Case study

Full text: <http://cpre.wceruw.org/papers/Kentucky%20SBPA%206-99.pdf>

Abstract: Beginning in the early 1990s, Kentucky implemented a statewide program designed to increase school accountability on student achievement. The program is one part of a complex reform initiative and utilizes performance-based assessments. A school's performance is measured over two years and is based on an accountability index that includes both student achievement scores and classroom dropout and attendance scores. Schools that meet their improvement goals were rewarded with the award dependent each year on the number of schools eligible for an award. The case study also provides lessons learned from the implementation of this program.

## Case Study of the Initiation of Standards-Based Principal Performance Evaluation in Washoe County School District

Author(s): Kimball, S. M. Date: 2006

Source: Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin–Madison, Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: [http://cpre.wceruw.org/principal/washoe\\_prin\\_case.pdf](http://cpre.wceruw.org/principal/washoe_prin_case.pdf)

Abstract: This report details the performance based principal evaluation program implemented in Washoe County. Growing accountability demands, as well as dissatisfaction among principals with the existing system led to the need to create an evaluation system that better judged their performance. The new system was a substantial financial investment, while not requiring the major time investments of personnel. The article examines how the new system evaluates principals.

## Catching Up With the Vaughn Express: Six Years of Standards-Based Teacher Evaluation and Performance Pay

Author(s): Kellor, E. Date: 2005

Source: *Educational Policy Analysis Archives*, 13(7)

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaa/v13n7/v13n7.pdf>

Abstract: The Vaughn Next Century Learning Center is a public conversion charter school in the Los Angeles Unified School District. Vaughn Center developed a new knowledge- and skills-based pay program in 1997–98 school year. This also came with a new evaluation system. This paper provides an overview of the development and evolution of the performance-pay program and the new teacher evaluation system implemented at the Vaughn Center. Vaughn teachers' reactions to these innovations are discussed. Finally, the author offers key recommendations to help those who plan to implement knowledge- and skills-based pay or standards-based teacher evaluation.

---

## The Changing Leadership Role of the Principal: Implications for Principal Assessment

Author(s): Glasman, N. S., & Heck, R. H. Date: 1992

Source: *Peabody Journal of Education*, 68(1), 5–24

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0161-956X\(199223\)68%3A1%3C5%3ATCLROT%3E2.0.CO%3B2-E](http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0161-956X(199223)68%3A1%3C5%3ATCLROT%3E2.0.CO%3B2-E)

Abstract: This article aims to review existing research on principal evaluation that focuses on four related themes: creating the link between principals and school effectiveness, school contextual factors that have an impact on leadership, the effect of reform on the role of principals in schools, and assessing principal performance for increased effectiveness.

## Cincinnati's New Approach to Teacher Compensation

Author(s): Odden, A. Date: 2002

Source: *School Business Affairs*, 68(5), 20–23

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article describes the Cincinnati public school district's efforts in restructuring its teacher compensation system from a traditional single-salary schedule to a performance-based payment system, which uses both a knowledge- and skills-based salary structure and school-based performance award. The three major steps in making this change are: developing acceptable teaching standards, which then were organized into four domains: planning and preparing for student learning, creating a learning environment, teaching for learning, and professionalism; restructuring of teacher evaluation system; and creating a new salary schedule that includes five categories of teachers: apprentice, novice, career, advanced, and accomplished. The author also summarizes findings from the pilot implementation of this new teacher compensation system in 10 schools during 1999–2000 school year.

## A Collaborative Approach to the Development and Validation of a Principal Evaluation System: A Case Study

Author(s): Amsterdam, C. E., Johnson, R. L., Monrad, D. M., & Tonnsen, S. L. Date: 2003

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 17(3), 221–242

Type: Case study

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article details the principal evaluation system created for South Carolina by the South Carolina Department of Education, the South Carolina Educational Policy Center, and the University of South Carolina. The evaluation standards and its instrument were created by a collaboration of experts. The validity of the evaluation system standards was reviewed by the collaborative using the Personnel Evaluation Standards and the Standards for Educational and Psychological Testing. A pilot study was conducted to test the instrument and its validity.

---

## Communication Framework for Measuring Teacher Quality and Effectiveness: Bringing Coherence to the Conversation

Author(s): Coggshall, J. Date: 2007

Source: Washington, DC: National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality

Type: Information guide; literature review; policy paper

Full text: <http://www.tqsource.org/publications/NCCTQCommFramework.pdf>

Abstract: This guide serves as a framework for stakeholders discussing teacher effectiveness. Although the framework does not define teacher effectiveness, it provides talking points and discussion components that must be addressed when stakeholders discuss teacher effectiveness. Also, the framework provides stakeholders with common definitions for key measurement terms to ensure that common language is used when discussing such a complex topic. The framework provides examples of the various teacher quality dimensions, measurements, or instruments that can be used to evaluate each dimension and the recommended resources for conversation for each dimension. Finally, the framework offers potential policy questions surrounding the evaluation of teacher effectiveness.

## Conceptualising and Evaluating Teacher Quality: Substantive and Methodological Issues

Author(s): Ingvarson, L., & Rowe, K. Date: 2008

Source: *Australian Journal of Education*, 52(1), 5–35

Type: Literature review; policy paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article examines the difficulties, both substantive and methodological, in evaluating teacher quality. The paper argues that teacher performance should be rooted in the teacher standards, both their subject-knowledge and their pedagogical skills. The article also presents two approaches toward the current lack of information on the limitations of teacher quality evaluation. These approaches include evidence-based, inservice professional development and identifying and evaluating teacher standards. The paper concludes that because teachers are the most important factor in student achievement, policymakers should seriously consider pay-for-performance evaluations to determine teacher quality.

## Connecting Teacher Assessment and School Reform

Author(s): Pecheone, R. L., & Stansbury, K. Date: 1996

Source: *The Elementary School Journal*, 97(2), 163–177

Type: Case study; policy paper

Full text: [http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0013-5984\(199611\)97%3A2%3C163%3ACTAASR%3E2.0.CO%3B2-9](http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0013-5984(199611)97%3A2%3C163%3ACTAASR%3E2.0.CO%3B2-9)

Abstract: Connecticut, in coalition with other states in the Interstate New Teacher Assessment and Support Consortium, developed a portfolio assessment for beginning elementary teachers for licensure. This article provides an overview of Connecticut's Beginning Educator Support and Training program compared with programs in other states. The authors discuss four major areas of concern in designing an elementary teaching assessment: focus, method, legitimacy, and capacity building. Drawing from program development concerns, the authors discuss the implementations from the policy perspective. The authors conclude that the development of elementary teaching standards linking to complementary student standards provides a way to focus attention on important issues in elementary school teaching and learning.

---

## Continuing Assessment of Teacher Reactions to a Standards-Based Teacher Evaluation System

Author(s): Heneman, H. G., III, & Milanowski, A. T. Date: 2003

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 17(2), 173–195

Type: Rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This article presents the results from a continuing evaluation of a newly designed and implemented standards-based evaluation system in the Cincinnati school district in 2000–02. This evaluation system was based on a set of teaching standards derived from the framework for teaching that categorizes 16 performance standards into four domains: planning and preparation, creating an environment for learning, teaching for learning, and professionalism. Teachers' performance on each standard was to be rated at one of four levels (unsatisfactory, basic, proficient, and distinguished), as defined by a behaviorally anchored rating scale. The instrument was field-tested in 10 schools during the 1999–2000 school year. Based on the field test, several major changes were made to the evaluation system. This study focused on the full implementation of this evaluation in 2000–02 to address two major issues: to assess interrater agreement between teacher evaluators and administrators, and to assess teachers' reactions to the new evaluation system. The researchers found that carefully selected and trained peer evaluators provided ratings that have moderate to high agreement with administrators' ratings. Most teachers' specific reactions were neutral; however, teachers' overall reactions to the new system were less favorable. The authors make several suggestions on steps that districts should take to increase the likelihood of designing and implementing an effective and sustainable standards-based teacher evaluation system.

## Controlling for Student Background in Value-Added Assessment of Teachers

Author(s): Ballou, D., Sanders, W., & Wright, P. Date: 2004

Source: *Journal of Educational and Behavioral Statistics*, 29(1), 37–65; 2004

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This article uses data from the Tennessee Value-Added Assessment Systems (TVAAS) to measure teacher effectiveness, controlling for student background. The researchers include an analysis of socioeconomic and demographic variables. The article concludes that controlling for student background has no significant effect on teacher effectiveness variables

---

## The Criterion-Related Validity of the Performance Assessment System in Cincinnati

Author(s): Milanowski, A. Date: 2003

Source: *Working Paper TC-03-07*. Presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Chicago. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin–Madison, Wisconsin Center for Education Research, Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports; policy paper; issue paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This paper presented the results of an analysis of the relationship among teachers' evaluation scores and student achievement. This was an exploration of the feasibility of linking teacher compensation on student achievement. The author analyzed reading, math, and science test scores from two consecutive years for students in grades 3 through 8. The student achievement tests were either the district test, state proficiency test, or for one year the Terra Nova test. The state proficiency test was based on student content standards and had four score ranges: below basic, basic, proficient, and advanced. The district tests covered similar content. The teacher evaluations were in four domains (e.g., planning and preparation, creating an environment for learning, teaching for learning, and professionalism). The results showed that the teacher evaluation system had a moderate degree of criterion-related validity. The results suggest that a teacher evaluation system is able to identify teachers with students who achieved higher than expected achievement.

## Cumulative and Residual Effects of Teachers on Future Student Academic Achievement

Author(s): Sanders, W. L., & Rivers, J. C. Date: 1996

Source: Knoxville, TN: University of Tennessee Value-Added Research and Assessment Center

Type: Scientific research

Full text: <http://www.mccsc.edu/~curriculum/cumulative%20and%20residual%20effects%20of%20teachers.pdf>

Abstract: This article uses data from the Tennessee Value-Added Assessment System to examine teacher effects in mathematics. The authors found that there were differences in student achievement after three years. Also, the effects of teachers are additive and cumulative. A final conclusion was that lower achieving students are the first to benefit from teacher effectiveness increases.

## Defining Merit: How Should We Pay Teachers?

Author(s): Odden, A., Ballou, D., & Podgursky, M. Date: 2001

Source: *Education Next*, 1(1), 16–25

Type: Policy paper; information guide

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: The article provides two perspectives on merit-pay system. The first perspective suggests a design of compensation systems that provides direct incentives for teachers to improve the quality of their instruction and to raise student achievement while aligning with current education policy. A discussion on pay for knowledge and skills, pay for performance, and pay for professionals is provided. The authors give two examples of innovative changes in the teacher pay system: the Cincinnati Public Schools and the Vaughn Next Century Learning Center. The second perspective also supports a knowledge- and skills-based pay system. The use of external assessments is compared to internal peer review. Teacher compensation in private schools is discussed. Pay for knowledge and skills is a flexible alternative to the single-salary schedule; however, the essential feature of the single-salary schedule (paying teachers with equivalent credentials equally) is retained.

---

## Designing an Effective 360-Degree Appraisal Feedback Process

Author(s): Antonioni, D. Date: 1996

Source: *Organizational Dynamics*, 25(2), 24–38

Type: Literature review; perspective piece

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This article explores the characteristics of properly designed 360-degree appraisal system. 360-degree appraisal systems feature self-evaluation and feedback from work supervisors and peers. 360-degree appraisals of management personnel are based on feedback from subordinates. Effective appraisal systems must be designed to result in specific outcomes, with the goals and expectations clearly stated. The process of designing an appraisal system has three major components: inputs, process, and outcomes. Antonioni discusses each in detail. The article also explores the existing literature base on these systems.

## Designing Incentive Systems for Schools

Author(s): Neal, D. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Information guide

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Neal\\_2008\\_v4.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Neal_2008_v4.pdf)

**Abstract:** This article offers guidance to educators on the development and design of incentive programs. The author discusses elements that should be included in all programs including the importance of and definition of performance, the differences between school performance versus teacher performance, and potential measurement models that can be used. In addition, this article references the public sector and the lessons learned in the public sector and performance-based compensation.

## Developing a Technology Infrastructure to Support a High-Stakes Teacher Performance Assessment Program

Author(s): Muenzen, P. M. Date: 2001

Source: Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Seattle, WA

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** Connecticut is the first state to implement mandatory portfolio assessment as a component of its teacher certification program known as the Beginning Educator Support and Training (BEST) program. The program is a three-year induction process that includes both support (mentorship from an experienced teacher and attendance at professional development seminars) and assessment (subject-specific portfolio). The Connecticut Educator Database was developed to handle the information related to implementing the BEST program. This article describes the development of this database system and the strategies used to manage various kinds of information in the BEST program.

---

## Dilemmas and Solutions Regarding Principal Evaluation

Author(s): Ginsberg, R., & Thompson, T. Date: 1992

Source: *Peabody Journal of Education*, 68(1), 58–74

Type: Policy paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article discusses the challenges that exist in developing principal evaluation systems. The discussion begins by examining the ambiguous nature of principal work and how that contributes to the difficulty in developing a concrete system that will evaluate their performance. The authors believe a Consumer-Oriented Outcomes-Based (CO-OB) principal evaluation, assessments that do not focus on preestablished standards, would avoid having to evaluate the vague tasks of principals and would refocus the evaluation on the ability of principals to meet school consumer needs. The article also discusses the evaluation criteria included in an effective CO-OB plan.

## Does Merit Pay Reward Good Teachers? Evidence From a Randomized Experiment

Author(s): Dee, T. S., & Keys, B. J. Date: 2004

Source: *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 23(3), 471–488

Type: Policy paper; rigorous research; case study

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: In this article, new evidence is presented regarding the ability of the merit pay structure to properly reward teachers for increased student achievement. The data for the study are taken from Tennessee's Career Ladder Evaluation System, and Tennessee's Project STAR (Student Teacher Achievement Ratio), which randomly assigned students and teachers in different-size classrooms in an attempt to measure the relative quality of teachers certified in the Career Ladder Evaluation System. Analysis of the data suggests mixed success of the Career Ladder system in rewarding teachers who improved student achievement. While there was a slight increase in mathematics scores (3 percentile points), increases in reading scores were statistically insignificant.

## Effective Teaching Results in Increased Science Achievement for All Students

Author(s): Johnson, C. C., Kahle, J. B., & Fargo, J. D. Date: 2007

Source: *Science Education*, 91(3), 371–383

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study is designed to determine the impact of teacher effectiveness on student achievement in science. The data was collected using the Discovery Inquiry Test, collected over three years, and observational data using the Local Systemic Change Classroom Observation Protocol conducted several times throughout the study. The participating teachers included eleven middle school science teachers with varying years of experience and education levels.

---

## Effects of Teachers' Mathematical Knowledge for Teaching on Student Achievement

Author(s): Hill, H. C., Rowan, B., & Ball, D. L. Date: 2005

Source: *American Educational Research Journal*, 42(2), 371–406

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; policy paper

Full text: [http://www.aera.net/uploadedFiles/Journals\\_and\\_Publications/Journals/American\\_Educational\\_Research\\_Journal/Hill\\_PDF.pdf](http://www.aera.net/uploadedFiles/Journals_and_Publications/Journals/American_Educational_Research_Journal/Hill_PDF.pdf)

Abstract: In this article, researchers examine the relationship between teachers' content knowledge in mathematics and teacher contributions to student achievement gains in mathematics. Relying on student achievement data collected from more than 100 elementary schools implementing school improvement initiatives and from teacher data collected through self-report logs and questionnaires, analyses indicates there is a positive relationship between teachers' mathematical knowledge and predicted student gains in first and third-grade students. The authors conclude with a discussion of the research model and the policy implications of the results.

## Enemy of the Good

Author(s): McAdams, D. R. Date: 2002

Source: *Education Next*, 2, 23

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20022\\_23.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20022_23.pdf)

Abstract: This brief article discusses the usefulness of high-stake standardized tests in measuring school improvement, despite its many faults. While not able to measure school improvement perfectly, testing that is aligned with performance and content standards can be very effective in value-added measurements.

## Enhancing Professional Practice: A Framework for Teaching (2nd ed.)

Author(s): Danielson, C. Date: 2007

Source: Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development

Type: Information guide; literature review

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This book serves as an information guide outlining the knowledge and skills necessary for teachers to be effective and successful in the classroom. The framework is designed to give beginning, veteran, and mentor teacher's guidelines for being the most effective they can be in the classroom. As the book states, "The framework for teaching described in this book identifies those aspects of a teacher's responsibilities that have been documented through empirical studies and theoretical research as promoting student achievement; these responsibilities seek to define what teachers should know and be able to do" (p. 1).

---

## Enhancing Teacher Quality Through Knowledge- and Skills-Based Pay

Author(s): Odden, A., Kelley, C., Heneman, H., & Milanowski, A. Date: 2001

Source: Madison, WI: Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: Policy paper; information guide

Full text: [http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content\\_storage\\_01/00000196/80/1b/5ff10.pdf](http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/00000196/80/1b/5ff10.pdf)

Abstract: Knowledge- and skills-based pay systems are emerging as a potentially promising way of leveraging the investment in teacher pay to improve teacher quality and to provide clearer signals to teachers about how they should focus their professional energies. This report discussed key issues in designing knowledge- and skills-based pay systems, including deciding to supplement, modify, or replace the traditional pay schedule; deciding on what knowledge and skills to reward; methods of knowledge and skills assessment; types and amount of pay incentives; the role of teacher association and collective bargaining; and costs of knowledge- and skills-based pay programs. The authors summarize 11 key lessons learned from implementing knowledge- and skills-based pay systems. Finally, they recommend the policy implementations for state policymakers.

## Ensuring Effective Teachers for All Students: Six State Strategies for Attracting and Retaining Effective Teachers in High-Poverty and High-Minority Schools

Author(s): Chait, R. Date: 2009

Source: Washington, DC: Center for American Progress

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2009/05/pdf/teacher\\_effectiveness.pdf](http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2009/05/pdf/teacher_effectiveness.pdf)

Abstract: This brief, developed by the Center for American Progress, outlines six strategies that states can adopt to attract and retain effective teachers in high-minority and high-poverty schools. The strategies are as follows: using value-added estimates and other measures to report on teacher distribution, designing an evaluation system that can be used as a model to determine teacher effectiveness and for teacher development, supporting alternative compensation programs that use incentives for effective teachers, funding recruitment and preparation programs designed for hard-to-staff schools, investing in mentoring and induction for new teachers, and requiring school budgets to reflect actual expenditures. In addition, the paper offers ideas for using American Recovery and Reinvestment Act funds to implement these strategies.

## Evaluating the Performance of Principals: A Descriptive Study

Author(s): Duke, D. L., & Stiggins, R. J. Date: 1985

Source: *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 21(4), 71–98

Type: Perspective piece; issue paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article examines principal evaluation practices; specifically whether evaluation standards are a valid measure of principal performance. Relying on a questionnaire administered to Oregon principals and administrators, the study examines perceptions of 11 principal evaluation characteristics and their effectiveness. The article explores opinions on each characteristic and compares them between principals and administrators.

---

## Evaluating Value-Added Models for Teacher Accountability

Author(s): McCaffrey, D. F., Lockwood, J. R., Koretz, D. M., & Hamilton, L. S. Date: 2003

Source: Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://www.rand.org/pubs/monographs/2004/RAND\\_MG158.pdf](http://www.rand.org/pubs/monographs/2004/RAND_MG158.pdf)

Abstract: This monograph provides a comprehensive overview of value-added modeling (VAM) by discussing the critical issues and question about VAM, reviewing existing literature, and examining existing VAM efforts. VAM models must account for the potential bias and measurement error in attempts to measure teacher-effects. Using value-added models for high-stakes decisions is cannot be supported by the limited research base. It is recommended that for lower-stakes purposes, value-added models could be used as a component of a more throughout review of teacher effect. Implications for VAM are also discussed.

## The Evaluation of Teachers

Author(s): Dwyer, C. A. Date: 1998

Source: In B. Álvarez & M. Ruiz-Casares (Eds.), *Evaluation and Educational Reform: Policy Options* (pp. 171–202).

Washington, DC: The Advancing Basic Education and Literacy Project, Academy for Educational Development

Type: Literature review

Full text: [http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf\\_docs/PNACD054.pdf](http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/PNACD054.pdf)

Abstract: This paper reviews the purpose of teacher evaluations, the standards that should be applied to teacher evaluations, and the methodologies that are available to complete teacher evaluations. The author suggests various purposes for evaluation including improvement of teaching, professional accountability and development, administrative control, and merit pay. The paper also explores curricular standards, knowledge and skill-based standards, and evaluations based on standards.

## Everyone's Doing It, But What Does Teacher Testing Tell Us About Teacher Effectiveness?

Author(s): Goldhaber, D. Date: 2006

Source: Seattle, WA: Center on Reinventing Public Education

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.crpe.org/cs/crpe/download/csr\\_files/wp\\_crpe1\\_ttdoingit\\_apr06.pdf](http://www.crpe.org/cs/crpe/download/csr_files/wp_crpe1_ttdoingit_apr06.pdf)

Abstract: This research study examines the issue of linking teacher testing to teacher effectiveness. For the purposes of this report, teacher testing is limited to licensure exams, and teacher effectiveness is measured through student test scores. Author Dan Goldhaber uses a data set from a 10-year period of time in North Carolina; these data allow the author to match teachers and their descriptive data kept on file in Human Resources with students and their outcome data kept on file at their schools. The results of this study show a marginal positive correlation between teacher test scores and student test scores, but the implications of the study are much larger than these statistics alone. For instance, because there is evidence to support the claim that many prospective teachers fail to join the teaching force once they have failed the initial licensure exam, there is no way of knowing whether those teachers would have grown to be highly effective educators had they been allowed to remain in teaching. Furthermore, because there are documented instances of teacher self-sorting across achievement levels, it can be assumed that teachers listed as “high-quality” are already teaching the students who need less guidance. With this potential bias in mind, there is no way of knowing whether or not there is a valid and reliable read on teacher-student matching.

---

## Examining District Guidance to Schools on Teacher Evaluation Policies in the Midwest Region

Author(s): Brandt, C., Mathers, C., Oliva, M., Brown-Sims, M., & Hess, J. Date: 2007

Source: Washington, DC: REL Midwest

Type: Policy paper; scientific research

Full text: [http://ies.ed.gov/ncee/edlabs/regions/midwest/pdf/REL\\_2007030.pdf](http://ies.ed.gov/ncee/edlabs/regions/midwest/pdf/REL_2007030.pdf)

Abstract: This scientific research study offers a glimpse into the teacher evaluation policies that are in place in the Midwest. The study examined 13 common teacher evaluation practices and noted where they were part of state policy. The study used a stratified sample design to select school districts that represent the diversity of the Midwest states. Participating districts were asked to submit their evaluation policies and procedures, and the authors then coded the documents and analyzed them using the SPSS Complex Samples add-on module. The findings include the following: many of the policies distinguish between beginning teachers and experienced teachers, fewer than half of the policies detail how the results are used, few districts referenced resources or guidance to support evaluations, and few districts required the evaluator to be trained.

## Examining the Relationship Between Teacher Evaluation and Student Assessment Results in Washoe County

Author(s): Kimball, S. M., White, B., Milanowski, A. T., & Borman, G. Date: 2004

Source: *Peabody Journal of Education*, 79(4), 54–78

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: In the search for adequate measures of teacher effect on student achievement, teacher performance assessment results could be considered one possible alternative if the evaluation scores can be shown to be valid measures of teaching practice and to have the expected positive relationship to student achievement. The authors analyzed the relationship between scores on a standards-based teacher evaluation system and student achievement measures in Nevada's Washoe County School District (WCSD). The WCSD developed a new teacher evaluation system designed to measure four domains of teaching practice: planning and preparation, classroom environment, instruction, and professional responsibilities. Each domain has a number of teaching components, and every component has several elements. Each element includes separate behavioral descriptions on a four-level rubric scale: unsatisfactory, target for growth, proficient, and area of strength. There are 23 components of professional practice and 68 elements in the WCSD system. Student achievement was assessed with several measures including results from district, state, and national norm-referenced tests for third-, fourth-, and fifth-grade students in mathematics and reading. The two-level regression model was used to study the relationship between teacher evaluation scores and student achievement, controlling for the effects of other student and teacher characteristics. Positive relationships between teacher evaluation scores and student achievement were demonstrated, but not for all cases.

---

## Expert Measures

Author(s): Summers, A. A. Date: 2002

Source: *Education Next*, 2, 16–19

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20022\\_16.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20022_16.pdf)

Abstract: Value-added analyses of state test results do not always provide an accurate picture of teacher effectiveness. Summers argues that while errors associated with Value-added assessment can be clearly identified, these assessments overemphasize the random error associated with measuring student performance. Summers suggests that a more effective way of measuring teacher effectiveness would be to use more subjective criteria to evaluate teachers, or to establish specific thresholds of student achievement that define adequate performance.

## Exploring Teacher Peer Review

Author(s): Escamilla, P., Clarke, T., & Linn, D. Date: 2000

Source: Washington, DC: National Governors Association Center for Best Practices, Education Policy Studies Division

Type: Issue paper

Full text: <http://www.nga.org/Files/pdf/000125PEERREVIEW.pdf>

Abstract: This issue paper, disseminated by the Education Policy Studies Division of the National Governors' Association, offers a brief summary of the purpose of and ingredients for a successful system of teacher peer review. According to the authors, teacher peer review can have a positive impact on such school-based issues as teacher accountability, teacher tenure, and teacher performance. And though a system of teacher peer review can be beneficial when implemented efficiently and expertly, the authors of this brief indicate that such systems have yet to be embraced by many teachers unions, as they are viewed as subjective. To close, the paper includes examples of best practices within teacher peer review from California; Columbus, Ohio; and Toledo, Ohio.

## Formative Feedback Systems and the New Instructional Leadership

Author(s): Halverson, R., Prichett, R., & Watson, J. Date: 2007

Source: Madison, WI: Wisconsin Center for Education Research

Type: Case study; scientific research

Full text: [http://www.wcer.wisc.edu/publications/workingPapers/Working\\_Paper\\_No\\_2007\\_03.pdf](http://www.wcer.wisc.edu/publications/workingPapers/Working_Paper_No_2007_03.pdf)

Abstract: This paper reports findings of a case study into the formative feedback systems present at one American public elementary school. The authors approach their study with the view that “a school’s formative feedback system structures opportunities for teachers and school leaders to (a) learn from organizational performance information and (b) adjust instructional programs and practices accordingly” (p. 5). The research was designed to determine how and when teachers and administrators were using data-sharing techniques and which systems of feedback (social and technical) were most successful for influencing and revising practice. Though the authors could not find hard data to support a positive correlation between formative feedback systems and student achievement, they were able, through qualitative research methods, to show that these systems work positively to ease teacher anxiety about assessments, communication, and curriculum.

---

## A Framework for School Leaders: Linking the ISLLC Standards to Practice

Author(s): Hessel, K., & Holloway, J. Date: 2002

Source: Princeton, NJ: Educational Testing Service

Type: Policy paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This framework uses standards created by the Interstate School Leaders Licensure Consortium (ISLLC) in rubrics to guide the practice of school administrators. The standards are based on indicators of principal performance and knowledge that indicate effective school leadership. The framework creates a standards-based approach of measuring their leadership ability.

## From Data to Bonuses:

### A Case Study of the Issues Related to Awarding Teachers Pay on the Basis of Their Students' Progress

Author(s): McCaffrey, D. F., Han, B., & Lockwood, J. R. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Scientific research; case study; information guide

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/McCaffrey\\_et\\_al\\_2008.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/McCaffrey_et_al_2008.pdf)

Abstract: This paper examines the type of data used in pay-for-performance programs to determine the financial incentives offered. The authors use case study data from a large urban school district to analyze value-added and other models of measuring student achievement. The authors detail the process of awarding teacher bonuses from the data to use, the different types of analysis needed (including strengths and weakness of the systems of measurement), and methods for awarding the bonuses.

## From Qualifications to Results: Promoting Teacher Effectiveness Through Federal Policy

Author(s): Chait, R. Date: 2009

Source: Washington, DC: Center for American Progress

Type: Policy paper

Full text: <http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2009/01/pdf/bet.pdf>

Abstract: This paper provides specific recommendations for the federal government to increase teacher effectiveness. Because determining teacher effectiveness requires longitudinal and comprehensive data, one role the federal government could play would be to invest in a data infrastructure. In addition, the government could establish competitive state and district teacher effectiveness grants. To attract high-quality educators into the teaching profession who could be dissuaded by the copious amount of schooling needed to become a teacher, the government could provide funding for additional alternative compensation grants. The policy paper also recommends that the federal government pilot state grant programs and provide other incentives to states and districts to adopt programs that evaluate teacher effectiveness. The paper concludes with the political barriers that arise when using effectiveness data.

---

## Grading Teachers, Grading Schools

Author(s): Millman, J. Date: 1997

Source: Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press

Type: Research reviews and books

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This book highlights four incentive programs implemented in different locations across the country. Oregon's Teacher Work Sample Methodology (TWSM), the Dallas Value-Added Accountability System, the Kentucky Instructional Results Information System, and the Tennessee Value-Added Assessment System (TVAAS) are discussed and in an attempt to explore the ability of these system in their measurement of student achievement, that criterion validity that exists in there systems, and the effectiveness of these system to improve both teaching and learning.

## Handbook on Teacher Evaluation: Assessing and Improving Performance

Author(s): Stronge, J. H., & Tucker, P. D. Date: 2003

Source: Larchmont, NY: Eye on Education

Type: Information guide

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This handbook, authored by James H. Stronge and Pamela D. Tucker, presents a comprehensive picture of the reasons for and methods of teacher evaluation. The book is separated into three sections: several chapters that define the overall concept of teacher evaluation, as well as several objectives, guidelines, and methods for rating; a list of all teacher responsibilities, organized around a set of specified domains and performance indicators; a toolkit of sorts, created to help administrators and school officials develop the forms and rubrics necessary to implement a successful system of teacher evaluation. The book also comes with a CD-ROM, on which readers will find examples and templates for many of the forms discussed in the third section of the handbook.

## How and Why Do Teacher Credentials Matter for Student Achievement?

Author(s): Clotfelter, C. T., Ladd, H. F., & Vigdor, J. L. Date: 2007

Source: Washington, DC: National Center for the Analysis of Longitudinal Data in Education Research

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.caldcenter.org/PDF/1001058\\_Teacher\\_Credentials.pdf](http://www.caldcenter.org/PDF/1001058_Teacher_Credentials.pdf)

Abstract: This report uses data collected in North Carolina over ten years and incorporates a variety of administrative information. The data is used to examine the relationship between student achievement and teacher characteristics and credentials. Overall, this report concludes that teacher credentials and characteristics play a significant role in student achievement, with the achievement effects having a larger impact in math than in reading.

## How and Why Money Matters: An Analysis of Alabama Schools

Author(s): Ferguson, R. F., & Ladd, H. F. Date: 2004

Source: In H. F. Ladd (Ed.),  *Holding Schools Accountable: Performance-Based Reform in Education* (pp. 265–298).

Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study used value-added models to examine the relationship between school inputs and student outcomes in Alabama. Student-level models used data on 29,544 students in 690 schools, while district models used aggregated data from 127 school districts. Both the student-level and district-level analyses found that school inputs such as class size and teacher quality—as measured by teacher test scores and master's degrees—appear to affect student test scores.

---

## How Large Are Teacher Effects?

Author(s): Nye, B., Konstantopoulos, S., & Hedges, L. V. Date: 2004

Source: *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 26(3), 237–257

Type: Scientific research; policy paper; issue paper

Full text: <http://www.sesp.northwestern.edu/docs/publications/169468047044fcbd1360b55.pdf>

Abstract: This article examines teacher effects and sheds light on methods for determining effectiveness. The researchers use data from a four-year experiment in Tennessee, which randomly assigned students and teachers to classrooms. The researchers examine teacher effects on student achievement through teacher variance of student achievement gains. The researchers found larger effects on mathematics than reading achievement; however, the estimates were similar to previous research findings in the teacher effects literature.

## How Valid Are the National Board of Professional Teaching Standards Assessments for Predicting the Quality of Actual Classroom Teaching and Learning? Results of Six Mini Case Studies

Author(s): Pool, J. E., Ellett, C. D., Schiavone, S., & Carey-Lewis, C. Date: 2001

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 15(1), 31–48

Type: Scientific research

Full text: <http://www.springerlink.com/content/u0420hg7k3067lt6/>

Abstract: This study examines the variation among the professional practices of teachers who were recently certified by the National Board of Professional Teaching Standards (NBPTS) to assess the job-related validity of the NBPTS assessments. Case studies of six NBPTS-certified teachers were conducted, using classroom observations, individual teacher interviews, and semistructured interviews with school administrators and colleague teachers. The quality of teaching and learning practices among teachers is described using the Professional Assessment and Comprehensive Evaluation System (PACES). PACES is a comprehensive, classroom-based observation and assessment system used in urban districts in the southeast. Considerable variability exists in teaching practices. NBPTS was viewed as a good tool for validating teaching abilities, but it was not thought to be the only source for recognition of teaching excellence. The variability of teaching performance of these teachers raised questions about the job-related validity of the NBPTS assessment process. On the other hand, this study shows that PACES can differentiate, to a high degree, the quality of teaching and learning among teachers, thus providing supporting validity evidence for the use of the PACES as a classroom-based observation and assessment system.

## Identifying Effective Teachers Using Performance on the Job

Author(s): Gordon, R., Kane, T. J., & Staiger, D. O. Date: 2006

Source: Washington, DC: The Brookings Institution

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.brookings.edu/~media/Files/rc/papers/2006/04education\\_gordon/200604hamilton\\_1.pdf](http://www.brookings.edu/~media/Files/rc/papers/2006/04education_gordon/200604hamilton_1.pdf)

Abstract: This report focuses on the policy of linking teacher effectiveness to salary. After a review of the research, the authors provide five recommendations to create the most effective performance pay systems: reduce barriers to entry into teaching for alternatively certified teachers, increase standards required for a teacher to receive tenure, provide bonuses for effective teachers in high-poverty schools, use multiple measures for teacher effectiveness, and provide federal funding to help states apply performance pay programs.

---

## The Impact of Individual Teachers on Student Achievement: Evidence From Panel Data

Author(s): Rockoff, J. E. Date: 2003

Source: *American Economic Review*, 94(2), 247–252

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article focuses on the impacts of teachers on student achievement. The author uses panel data from two districts in New Jersey to estimate teacher fixed effects. Through statistical analysis, the author found that there were significant differences among teachers with higher ratings of teacher quality. The author also found that teaching experience had an effect on reading test scores.

## Implementation of Standards-Based Principal Evaluation in One School District: First Year Results From Randomized Trial

Author(s): Kimball, S. M., Milanowski, A. T., & McKinney, S. A. Date: 2007

Source: Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin–Madison, Wisconsin Center for Education Research, Consortium for Policy Research in Education. Paper presented at the annual conference of the American Educational Research Association, Chicago

Type: Scientific research

Full text: <http://cpre.wceruw.org/publications/KimballMilanowskiMcKinney.pdf>

Abstract: This article presents the findings from a study of principals in a large school district regarding the introduction of a new standards-based principal evaluation system. The author uses interview and survey data to demonstrate that the new evaluation system provided more clarity in the standards of evaluation and that principals appreciated the transparency of the evaluation. The article also provides important components to keep in mind when implementing similar evaluation systems.

## Implementing Teacher Evaluation Systems: How Principals Make Sense of Complex Artifacts to Shape Local Instruction Practice

Author(s): Halverson, R., Kelley, C., & Kimball, S. Date: 2004

Source: Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin–Madison

Type: Scientific research; case study

Full text: <http://www.education.wisc.edu/elpa/people/faculty/halverson/HalversonKelleyKimballTREA.pdf>

Abstract: This case study explores schools in a large district and evaluates those schools on how they implement standards-based teacher evaluation systems. In addition, the study explores how the school and district leaders select and implement specific components of their teacher evaluation frameworks. The study was conducted because the authors believe, “Evaluation is a formal means for school leaders to communicate organizational goals, conceptions of teaching, standards, and values to teachers” (p. 2). The study concludes by discussing the processes that were implemented at each of the schools studied. The processes that were successful, unsuccessful, and omitted led to the implementation of high-quality teacher evaluations or low-quality teacher evaluations.

---

## Improving Instruction Through Effective Teacher Evaluation: Options for States and Districts

Author(s): Mathers, C., Oliva, M., & Laine, S. Date: 2008

Source: Washington, DC: National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality

Type: Policy paper

Full text: <http://www.tqsource.org/publications/February2008Brief.pdf>

Abstract: This policy paper presents a comprehensive view of effective methods for measuring teacher performance. The authors provide a brief literature review outlining current efforts in teacher evaluation; this section concludes with a summary of the REL Midwest study Examining District Guidance to Schools on Teacher Evaluation Policies in the Midwest Region (Brandt et al., 2007). In addition, the paper delineates several tools currently used in teacher evaluation systems, such as lesson plans, classroom observations, portfolio assessments, and student achievement data. For each tool, the authors present strengths and limitations. Based on this information, recommendations and policy options are provided as well as some examples of teacher evaluation systems.

## Improving Student Learning Through Strategic Compensation

Author(s): Center for Teaching Quality. Date: 2008

Source: Hillsborough, NC: Center for Teaching Quality

Type: Policy paper

Full text: <http://catalog.proemags.com/showmag.php?mid=ggfgt#/page0/>

Abstract: In 2007, the Center for Teaching Quality convened a small group of highly accomplished teachers from the state of Kansas to think strategically about innovative and transformative teacher incentives. The initiative, TeacherSolutions, funded the Alternative Compensation Study Committee; the work of that committee is summarized in this executive summary. Among the recommendations of the committee is the notion that student growth must be included in any measurement of teacher performance that will eventually lead to additional compensation and the idea that extra pay should be granted to teachers who agree to teach mathematics or science or are willing to relocate to a high-needs, high-risk school setting. Finally, the report stresses the group's strong feeling that all teachers be eligible to participate in an alternative compensation system to ensure a sense of equity among all faculty members in a school or across a district.

## The Influence of Upward Feedback on Self- and Follower Ratings of Leadership

Author(s): Atwater, L., Roush, P., & Fischthal, A. Date: 1995

Source: *Personnel Psychology*, 48, 35–60

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article assesses the impact of positive feedback on self- and follower evaluation. Using data collected from subjects at the U.S. Naval Academy student leaders and followers (juniors and freshman, respectively). Followers were given surveys to determine the positive leadership behaviors. Regression analysis indicates that the feedback from the followers on leader performance led to improvements specific leader behaviors postfeedback. This study also explores the limitations of the study, and implications for future research.

---

## The Intertemporal Stability of Teacher Effect Estimates

Author(s): McCaffrey, D. F., Sass, T. R., & Lockwood, J. R. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/news/PapersNews/McCaffrey\\_et\\_al\\_2008.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/news/PapersNews/McCaffrey_et_al_2008.pdf)

Abstract: This research study funded by the National Center for Performance Incentives seeks to determine the reliability of using value-added measures to estimate teacher effectiveness. The authors use regression to investigate the intertemporal stability of value-added initiatives (i.e., how greatly the utility of value-added measures varies over time). McCaffrey, Sass, and Lockwood conclude that the variance present in the data is mostly due to random error and “noise” in average test score gains. In addition, the research team finds that some variation occurs depending on the specific testing instrument being used, which implies that changes in tests over time could be more powerful than teacher effectiveness.

## Is It Just a Bad Class? Assessing the Stability of Measured Teacher Performance

Author(s): Goldhaber, D., & Hansen, M. Date: 2008

Source: Seattle, WA: Center on Reinventing Public Education

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.crpe.org/cs/crpe/download/csr\\_files/wp\\_crpe5\\_badclass\\_nov08.pdf](http://www.crpe.org/cs/crpe/download/csr_files/wp_crpe5_badclass_nov08.pdf)

Abstract: This research report presents findings on teacher effectiveness in North Carolina’s schools. The author provides value-added calculations for test proctors in North Carolina and specifically considers proctors between the 1995–96 through 2005–06 school years. The research infers that the test proctor is the classroom teacher by taking several precautions to ensure this is a valid inference. The authors restrict the scale to matches for which the proctor has a separate personnel file and classroom assignment that is consistent with him or her teaching the grade and class specified for which he or she proctored the exam and only used a data sample of self-contained, nonspecialty classes. Also, the authors only used scores from students with test scores for Grades 3–5 and only used classes that were larger than 10 students. The results show that teachers certified through an approved North Carolina education program attain high scores on teacher licensure exams, and those who are certified by the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards have higher student achievement scores. Also, students assigned to teachers who are frequently absent do poorer on standardized tests.

---

## Is National Board Certification an Effective Signal of Teacher Quality?

Author(s): Cavalluzzo, L. C. Date: 2004

Source: Alexandria, VA: The CNA Corporation

Type: Scientific research

Full text: <http://www.cna.org/documents/cavaluzzostudy.pdf>

Abstract: This research study examines the controversial issue of linking teacher inputs to teacher effectiveness. Rather than focusing on the traditional tenets of teacher quality, such as credentials and postsecondary degrees, the team behind this study seeks to discover the correlation between national board certification and teaching quality. Using high school data from the Miami-Dade school district, the study employs both student achievement data and descriptive teacher data to prove the hypothesis. Controlling for different variables and using a student fixed-effects model, the researchers show that holding national board certification is highly correlated with student success. With this finding in mind, recommendations are made to districts that wish to implement differentiated pay schemes for their teaching forces. In other words, “school systems that wish to target pay increases to teachers of the highest quality can use NBC for this purpose” (p. 34).

## ISLLC Educational Leadership Policy Standards: 2008

Author(s): Council of Chief State School Officers Date: 2008

Source: Washington, DC: Council of Chief State School Officers

Type: Policy paper

Full text: <http://www.ccsso.org/Publications/Download.cfm?Filename=ISLLC%202008%20final.pdf>

Abstract: This report presents and explains the 2008 Educational Leadership Policy Standards. The standards were previously established in 1996 by the Council for Chief State School Officers. The newest version was funded by the Wallace Foundation to keep the standards timely and relevant by ensuring they are policy-oriented, practitioner-based, and research-based. In addition, higher education faculty and leadership consultants provided advice for the update.

## Issues in Implementing a New Teacher Assessment System in a Large Urban School District: Results of a Qualitative Field Study

Author(s): Davis, D. R., Pool, J. E., & Mits-Cash, M. Date: 2000

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 14(4), 285–306

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article reports the results of the 2000 Professional Assessment and Comprehensive Evaluation System (PACES) field study in an anonymous district. PACES is a classroom-based educator assessment system designed to improve practice by using observations, best practices conversation, and self- and group assessments. Data were collected using interviews. The article details PACES and its history.

---

## Limitations in the Use of Achievement Test as Measures of Educators' Productivity

Author(s): Koretz, D. Date: 2000

Source: Madison, WI: Institute for Research on Poverty, University of Wisconsin–Madison

Type: Policy paper; issue paper

Full text: <http://www.irp.wisc.edu/newsevents/other/symposia/koretz.pdf>

Abstract: This paper examines the use of student test scores as a measure of accountability in the context of teacher effectiveness and argues that multiple measures are needed due to the debatable nature of the accuracy of standardized student achievement exams in measuring student learning. Specifically, the authors suggest that using student test scores as a measure of teacher effectiveness fails to accurately capture the nuances in teaching, which could create disincentives for high-quality teachers to teach in districts and schools that focus heavily on test-based accountability. The paper concludes by offering suggestions of multiple measures that might be considered by states, districts, and schools implementing an accountability system.

## Linking Teacher Compensation to Teacher Career Development

Author(s): Conley, S., & Odden, A. Date: 1995

Source: *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 17(2), 219–237

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0162-3737\(199522\)17%3A2%3C219%3ALTCTTC%3E2.0.CO%3B2-V](http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0162-3737(199522)17%3A2%3C219%3ALTCTTC%3E2.0.CO%3B2-V)

Abstract: Alternatives to the traditional single-salary schedule of teacher compensation have been proposed to base payment on: evaluations of the performance of individual teachers, teachers' job responsibilities or tasks, and teachers' professional skills and knowledge. This report explored the advantages and disadvantages of these three alternatives. Four examples of skill- and knowledge-based pay systems in education are given, including career ladder programs in three districts (Flowing Wells, Arizona; Charlotte-Mecklenburg, North Carolina; and Pocatello, Idaho) and the Advanced Skills Teacher system in Australia. The authors proposed a model for a career development-based compensation structure composed of three components: starting pay, career stages that qualify teachers for a major pay increase, and a mechanism for increasing pay separate from knowledge and skill enhancement. Finally, the authors provided strategic considerations to guide the development of an alternative compensation approach. A strategic reevaluation of teacher pay should consider not only basic organizational goals but also school culture, norms, and micropolitical processes. The ideal model would address educators' low compensation and complement collective bargaining, teacher development, and collegiality.

## Key Issue: Using Performance-Based Assessment to Identify and Support High-Quality Teachers

Author(s): National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality Date: 2008

Source: Washington, DC: National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality

Type: Information guide; literature review

Full text: <http://www.tqsource.org/publications/keyIssue-June2008.pdf>

Abstract: This key issue explores using performance-based assessments to recognize and assist highly qualified teachers. The report identifies numerous performance assessments that can be used to recognize highly effective teachers including teacher portfolios, using videos to assess teachers, incorporating peer reviews and other types of assessments. In addition to identifying performance-based assessments, the report also offers real-life examples as well as links to websites where the assessments suggested are in use.

---

## Key Issue: Using Value-Added Models to Identify and Support Highly Effective Teachers

Author(s): Goe, L. Date: 2008

Source: Washington, DC: National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality

Type: Information guide; policy paper; literature review

Full text: <http://www2.tqsource.org/strategies/het/UsingValueAddedModels.pdf>

Abstract: This comprehensive volume is a collection of strategies and resources aimed at building an understanding among school and state officials of the value-added model of teacher evaluation. The text includes a working definition of “value-added,” a list of some of the major benefits of such measures, some tips and cautions for implementation, and a “real-life” example of value-added measures in action. This resource includes links to program websites, scholarly articles, and media pieces related to the topic of value-added evaluation.

## Lessons Learned About Standards-Based Teacher Evaluation Systems

Author(s): Odden, A. Date: 2004

Source: *Peabody Journal of Education*, 79(4), 126–137

Type: Issue paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article reviews the forms of evaluation for teacher effectiveness, focusing on methods to link student achievement to teachers. The author provides lessons learned in using statistical models, such as hierarchical linear modeling and the reliability of such methods.

## Linking Teacher Assessment to Student Performance: A Benchmarking, Generalizability, and Validity Study of the Use of Teacher Work Samples

Author(s): Denner, P. R., Salzman, S. A., & Bangert, A. W. Date: 2001

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 15(4), 287–307

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: The authors examined the validity and generalizability of the use of teacher work samples to assess preservice and inservice teachers' abilities to meet national and state teaching standards and to impact the learning of their students. Teacher Work Sample Methodology (TWSM) is a complex assessment developed at Western Oregon University. Teachers are asked to document their teaching of an actual set of lessons. The documentation includes planning for instruction, the design of an instructional sequence, a plan for the assessment of learning, demonstration and analysis of the impact of instruction on student learning, and reflection upon the success of the instructional unit. The authors adapted Western Oregon's TWSM to the undergraduate teacher preparation context in the way the work samples were structured and scored. To assess the validity of this adapted teacher work sample assessment, they collected 54 work samples from junior-level candidates, 44 samples from senior student-teaching interns, 30 samples from experienced teachers, and 4 samples from National Board Certified teachers. The findings supported several aspects of the content validity of teacher work sample assessments as valid and authentic measures of teaching performance. A panel of five raters, including external ones, was able to achieve a high degree of reliability in their ratings of benchmarked sets of teacher work samples. An acceptable level of reliability could be achieved with as few as two raters.

---

## A Longitudinal Hierarchical Linear Model for Estimating School Effects and Their Stability

Author(s): Willms, D. J., & Raudenbush, S. W. Date: 1989

Source: *Journal of Educational Measurement*, 26, 209–232

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This paper looks at a longitudinal model for estimating school effects. Previous research on the subject, as discussed in the paper, has indicated that the stability of school performance over successive years has produced inconsistent findings. This research looks at two different types of school effects and presents a model capable of separating true changes in school effects from sampling and measurement error. The paper also provides an example of the approach based on data on two cohorts of students from on Education Authority in Scotland.

## The Market for Teacher Quality

Author(s): Hanushek, E. A., Kain, J. F., O'Brien, D. M., & Rivkin, S. G. Date: 2005

Source: *Working Paper No. 11154*. Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: [http://www.aeaweb.org/annual\\_mtg\\_papers/2005/0107\\_0800\\_0803.pdf](http://www.aeaweb.org/annual_mtg_papers/2005/0107_0800_0803.pdf)

Abstract: This study uses teacher administrative data and student assessment data from a large Texas school district to examine the recruitment and retention of teachers associated with large and small (value-added) improvements in student achievement. The authors find that there are large differences in teacher value-added. Teacher experience is linked to value-added, with first-year teachers having lower-than-average value-added that peaks in the fourth year of teaching and then levels off. The authors find that students learn more with teachers of their same race. Teachers generally leave after a poor year in student learning; however, these departing teachers are not necessarily poor teachers for a longer period of time. The authors also find that teachers remaining in the urban district are equally as effective as those that move from the urban district to suburban districts. They conclude by arguing that the main cost of teacher turnover is the introduction of inexperienced and low-performing teachers into the classroom.

## Measurement and Research Issues in Teacher Assessment

Author(s): Dwyer, C. A. Date: 1991

Source: *Educational Psychologist*, 26(1), 3–22

Type: Issue paper; case study

Full text: [http://www.leaonline.com/doi/abs/10.1207/s15326985ep2601\\_1](http://www.leaonline.com/doi/abs/10.1207/s15326985ep2601_1)

Abstract: This paper focused on a new teacher assessment program developed by ETS. This new assessment program consists of three stages. Stage I assesses skills in reading, writing, and mathematics, using a computerized test. Stage II measures subject-matter knowledge. Stage III focuses on the ability to teach. The author addressed three major issues in teacher assessment: engaging adult learners, choosing appropriate assessment methods, and defining what is important to measure about beginning teaching.

---

## Measuring Effect Sizes: The Effect of Measurement Error

Author(s): Boyd, D., Grossman, P., Lankford, H., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. Date: 2008

Source: Washington, DC: National Center for Analysis of Longitudinal Data in Education Research

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.caldercenter.org/PDF/1001257\\_measuring\\_effect\\_sizes.pdf](http://www.caldercenter.org/PDF/1001257_measuring_effect_sizes.pdf)

Abstract: This research study considers two components that influence how teachers are deemed effective. The first piece hypothesizes that model coefficients should be compared to the standard deviation of gain scores, not the standard deviation of scores. The second part studies test measurement error. The paper uses student test score data from New York City, across multiple grades from 1999 to 2007. The authors use a value-added model and include different teacher attributes that affect teacher effectiveness in conjunction with test measurement error. The study concludes that the observable teacher attributes account for roughly half a standard deviation of universe test scores and these qualities should be considered when developing policies.

## Measuring School Effectiveness in Memphis

Author(s): Booker, K., & Isenberg, E. Date: 2008

Source: Princeton, NJ: Mathematica Policy Research

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This report examines the methods for identifying effective teachers, used by New Leaders for New Schools, in conjunction with Memphis City Schools. The researchers focus on the value-added measures of student achievement in the schools. In order to maintain confidentiality, specific results were not presented. The authors conclude with limitations to the use of value-added modeling and include in the appendix the details of the formula that the model uses.

## Measuring Teachers' Effectiveness Through Value-Added Modeling

Author(s): Murnane, R. J., & Steele, J. L. Date: 2007

Source: *The Future of Children*, 17(1), 15–43

Type: Issue paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This issue paper explains the benefits and disadvantages of using a value-added modeling system to estimate teacher effectiveness. The authors define value-added modeling in this way: “Value-added models estimate the academic progress that students make in a given teacher’s class (or in a given school) from one year to the next, and they attempt to isolate the impact that a particular teacher or school has on student achievement” (p. 1). After noting some advantages to value-added modeling, the authors outline several challenges, such as the effect of sample size on effectiveness scores and separating contextual factors from the actual impact of teachers on student achievement.

---

## Measuring What Matters: How Value-Added Assessment Can Be Used to Drive Learning Gains

Author(s): Hershberg, T., Adams Simon, V., & Lea-Kruger, B. Date: 2004

Source: *American School Board Journal*

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://www.cgp.upenn.edu/pdf/measuring\\_what\\_matters.pdf](http://www.cgp.upenn.edu/pdf/measuring_what_matters.pdf)

Abstract: This article looks at value-added assessment and discusses both the strengths and weaknesses of using this tool in accountability measurement. This form of assessment is considered by the authors as a solid approach, statistically speaking, and can be used as a powerful diagnostic tool in predicting student progress. Value-added may also help schools with achievement of NCLB goals. The authors continue to offer some recommendations to policymakers on the use of value-added assessment.

## Merit Pay and the Evaluation Problem: Why Most Merit Pay Plans Fail and a Few Survive

Author(s): Murnane, R., & Cohen, D. Date: 1986

Source: *Harvard Educational Review*, 56(1), 1–17

Type: Research reviews and books

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: Why have merit pay system historically been unsuccessful despite an enduring desire to implement systems paying teachers based on merit? This article explores that question by examining the frameworks used to create these systems. Murnane suggests that the failure of merit pay is cannot solely be attributed to resistance to these systems Previous literature on merit pay system indicate that two different frameworks, the ‘new style merit pay,’ where teachers are paid based on student test score gains, and ‘old style merit pay,’ which bases merit pay on principal evaluations have not lasted over time. Murnane concludes by examining the characteristics of merit pay that have endured over time.

## Methodological Concerns About the Education Value-Added Assessment System

Author(s): Amrein-Beardsley, A. Date: 2008

Source: *Educational Researcher*, 37(2), 65–75

Type: Case study; issue paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: Audrey Amrein-Beardsley uses this issue paper to explore the benefits of using value-added assessment in public education and, more specifically, to present a case study of the Education Value-Added Assessment System (EVAAS). She lays out specific tenets of the EVAAS system and explains why EVAAS is so much more widely received than other value-added systems. In particular, the author notes that the EVAAS system is unimpaired by student-level characteristics that can often muddy findings in other systems. Furthermore, EVAAS lends itself to large-scale use because “the software for processing EVAAS data permits [wide] analysis (p. 66). In conclusion, the author discusses the American Educational Research Association’s recommendations for high-stakes testing, some of which, such as “high-stakes decisions should not be made on the basis of a single-test score” and “the intended and unintended effects of the testing program must be continually evaluated and disclosed,” pertain specifically to the EVAAS value-added model.

---

## Methods of Evaluating Teacher Effectiveness

Author(s): Goe, L., & Croft, A. Date: 2009

Source: Washington, DC: National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality

Type: Literature review; information guide

Full text: [http://www.tqsource.org/publications/RestoPractice\\_EvaluatingTeacherEffectiveness.pdf](http://www.tqsource.org/publications/RestoPractice_EvaluatingTeacherEffectiveness.pdf)

Abstract: This Research-to-Practice Brief, disseminated by the National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality, helps state education officials and other stakeholders begin to consider the need for teachers to be highly effective, rather than simply highly qualified. Given that nearly all teachers are currently meeting the highly qualified criteria, and also given that there is no real research to show correlation between highly qualified status and positive impact on student achievement, the real metric of interest is the utility of a practitioner in the classroom. With this in mind, the TQ Center staff has designed this brief to serve as a concise guide to defining, measuring, and compensating highly effective teaching. The brief incorporates in-depth explanations of value-added measurement, classroom observations, and a few other strategies for measuring effective teaching.

## Models and Predictors of Teacher Effectiveness: A Review of the Literature With Lessons From (and for) Other Occupations

Author(s): Harris, D. N., & Rutledge, S. A. Date: 2007

Source: Teacher Quality Research

Type: Information guide; literature review

Full text: <http://www.teacherqualityresearch.org/models.pdf>

Abstract: This paper examines the research on teacher effectiveness, paying close attention to the models and predictors of effectiveness in comparison with other occupations. The authors find that the research on teacher effectiveness can be improved in three ways: research from other professions introduce theories that will fit well into the education model, with the various models of teacher effectiveness, there is a place for a detailed comparison of each model, and look to research on other professions for strategies to improve the measurement of indicators of teacher effectiveness.

## Most Likely to Succeed: How Do We Hire When We Can't Tell Who Is Right for the Job?

Author(s): Gladwell, M. Date: 2008, December 15

Source: The New Yorker

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://www.newyorker.com/reporting/2008/12/15/081215fa\\_fact\\_gladwell](http://www.newyorker.com/reporting/2008/12/15/081215fa_fact_gladwell)

Abstract: This issue paper explores the difficulty of identifying an effective teacher prior to him or her entering the classroom. The article acknowledges that teachers who are viewed as “desirable” based on the selectivity of their college degree, their college GPA, and other indicators may not necessarily be effective in the classroom. As a result, the article suggests that extensive collection of student achievement data and teacher data over a long period of time is the best indicator of a teacher’s effectiveness. The identification of the “soft skills” that make a teacher effective also is crucial in determining teacher effectiveness.

---

## New Trends in Teacher Evaluation

Author(s): Danielson, C. Date: 2001

Source: *Educational Leadership*, 58(5), 12–15

Type: Information guide

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article summarizes some new trends in teacher evaluation that merge professional development with quality assurance. These evaluation systems include differentiated systems, multiyear evaluation cycles, and active roles of teachers in various forms, including portfolios, professional conversation, and student achievement. With these new trends in teacher evaluation, educators have come to recognize the value of teacher evaluation as both professional development and quality assurance.

## Paying for What You Need: Knowledge- and Skill-Based Approaches to Teacher Compensation

Author(s): California State University Institute for Education Reform. Date: 1997

Source: Sacramento, CA: California State University Institute for Education Reform

Type: Policy paper

Full text: <http://www.csus.edu/ier/reports/teachercomp.pdf>

Abstract: This report revisits a 1997 seminar sponsored by the Consortium for Policy Research in Education, at which the focus was on knowledge- and skill-based compensation systems. The focus on compensation systems reflects changes believed to be necessary to improve instruction and ultimately student achievement. The report details knowledge- and skill-based compensation systems, methods to create school-based performance awards and the processes for implementing changes in pay systems.

## The Performance Assessment System: A Portfolio Assessment Model for Evaluating Beginning Teachers

Author(s): Oakley, K. Date: 1998

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 11(4), 323–341

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article reports the development and implementation of the Performance Assessment System (PAS), a portfolio assessment mechanism for evaluating beginning teacher performance through a collection of evidence of teachers' effectiveness in increasing student learning (associated with Teach For America). The PAS approaches teacher performance from two distinct perspectives: the extent to which students have attained the goals established by the teacher and the degree to which teachers' demonstrated practice meets articulated performance standards. Teachers develop portfolios consisting of nine components, including: a compilation of student goals, a report of teaching philosophy and practice, an assessment of students' progress, lesson plans, videotaped classroom instruction, a principal evaluation, a peer evaluation, parent evaluations, and student evaluations. Each portfolio is rated independently by two assessors. Assessors determine an overall performance rating using a four-point rating scale ranging from 1 (ineffective) to 4 (exemplary). The author also discusses several issues that have recurred throughout the ongoing design-revision process of the PAS, including technical evaluation, anchoring the levels of performance across implementations and through time, and stability across teacher populations. The PAS continues to be piloted as an assessment tool that eventually will help districts retain only effective teachers and will empower states to license only teachers whose performance meets approved standards.

---

## Performance-Based Assessment of Biology Teachers: Promises and Pitfalls

Author(s): Collins, A. Date: 1993

Source: *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 30(9), 1103–1120

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content\\_storage\\_01/00000196/80/23/25/2e.pdf](http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/00000196/80/23/25/2e.pdf)

Abstract: The Teacher Assessment Project (TAP) is a performance-based model for assessing experienced teachers. These assessments were considered alternatives to existing multiple-choice tests and checklist-based classroom-observation procedures. This article focuses on BioTAP, which is a part of the TAP that focuses on high school biology teachers. BioTAP explores three modes of performance-based assessment: portfolios, simulations, and portfolio-based simulations. Fifteen high school biology teachers completed 11 assessment activities during the 1988–89 academic year and the summer of 1989. A portfolio was defined as a container of documents that provides evidence of teachers' knowledge, skill, and dispositions. The portfolios had four sections: planning, instruction, assessment, and professional development. Simulations were assessments based on the rating of teaching performance in typical teaching tasks under standardized conditions. Portfolio-based simulations integrated the context from the portfolio and standardization from a simulation. Using a holistic process, teachers were rated in categories derived from the five core propositions of teacher knowledge and skill proposed by the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards: attending to students' learning; knowing the subject matter; class management and monitoring; learning from teaching activities; and participating in a learning community. Teachers reported that the assessments had a high degree of fidelity to teaching and provided stimuli to improve teaching.

## Pitfalls in the Evaluation of Principals

Author(s): Harrison, W. C., & Peterson, K. D. Date: 1986

Source: *The Urban Review*, 18(4), 221–235

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article details a state principal evaluation system in a southern state. A questionnaire given to state administrators was used to explore how principals are evaluated. Results from the questionnaire talk about how principals feel about their evaluation systems and how their perceptions of evaluations differ from the perceptions of state superintendents.

## The Politics of Principal Evaluation

Author(s): Davis, S. H., & Hensley, P. A. Date: 1999

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 13(4), 383–403

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article discusses the politics involved in principal evaluations. The highly politicized position of principals further requires the representative evaluation of principals' performance. Relying on data collected from principal and superintendent interviews and questionnaires that investigate their perception of the principal evaluation process in their respective districts, the results suggest that most principals did not believe their evaluation processes was having a strong impact on professional development and school effectiveness. Principals also did not have a lot of trust in the evaluation process and the evaluators responsible for the process.

---

## Portfolios, the Pied Piper of Teacher Certification Assessments: Legal and Psychometric Issues

Author(s): Wilkerson, J. R., & Lang, W. S. Date: 2003

Source: *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 11(45)

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaal/v11n45/>

Abstract: This article discusses the legal implications and psychometric issues around using portfolios as assessments for teachers. Scenarios are presented that explore the legal issues that an institution might face should they use portfolios as the primary source for evaluating teachers. In the conclusion, requirements and caveats are discussed that assist institutions in determining if this is a route that they would like to pursue.

## A Practical Guide to Evaluating Teacher Effectiveness

Author(s): Little, O., Goe, L., & Bell, C. Date: 2009

Source: Washington, DC: National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality

Type: Literature review; information guide; policy paper

Full text: <http://www.tqsource.org/publications/practicalGuide.pdf>

Abstract: This information guide outlines the numerous methods available to measure teacher effectiveness and reviews the pros and cons of using the different methods. The guide also acknowledges the myriad problems that arise when determining measures of teacher effectiveness including the limits of test scores, the outside influences that affect student learning, and common measurement errors. The brief provides a five-point definition of teacher effectiveness.

## Principal Assessment: Conceptual Problem, Methodological Problem, or Both?

Author(s): Heck, R. H., & Marcoulides, G. A. Date: 1992

Source: *Peabody Journal of Education*, 68(1), 24–144

Type: Policy paper; information guide; perspective piece; literature review

Full text: [http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0161-956X\(199223\)68%3A1%3C124%3APACPMP%3E2.0.CO%3B2-A](http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0161-956X(199223)68%3A1%3C124%3APACPMP%3E2.0.CO%3B2-A)

Abstract: This article examines issues and methodological concerns that exist in developing principal evaluation systems. The authors rely on existing literature and data to create a basic model for evaluating principals.

## Principals as Agents?

### Investigating Accountability in the Compensation and Performance of School Principals

Author(s): Billger, S. M. Date: 2007

Source: *IZA Discussion Paper No. 2662*. Bonn, Germany: Institute for the Study of Labor

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: [http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=977506](http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=977506)

Abstract: This report explores the relationship between school accountability measures, student performance, and principal pay. The presence of measures for state- or district-imposed accountability impacts the instructional goals of teachers as well as the role of the principal. Using cross-sectional Schools and Staffing Survey (SASS) data, regression analysis reveals no variations on pay when connected to school performance outcomes. Accountability measures have a positive relationship to college matriculation and pay for principals in the best schools, and to retention rates in the worst schools. The author discusses the implications of these results.

---

## The Promise and Peril of Using Value-Added Modeling to Measure Teacher Effectiveness

Author(s): RAND Corporation. Date: 2004

Source: Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.rand.org/pubs/research\\_briefs/2005/RAND\\_RB9050.pdf](http://www.rand.org/pubs/research_briefs/2005/RAND_RB9050.pdf)

Abstract: This article examines the advantages and disadvantages of using value-added modeling (VAM) to measure the impact of teachers and schools on student achievement. The authors argue that while VAM can estimate teacher and school impact on student achievement, it cannot account for many of the biases in student performance. A discussion of these biases is presented along with issues of data quality. The report concludes by stating that empirical research does not yet support the use of VAM; it then provides recommendations on the proper use of this approach given what is known to date.

## Quantitative Studies of Effective Schools: What Have We Learned?

Author(s): Murnane, R. J. Date: 1983

Source: In A. Odden and L. Webb (Eds.), *School Finance and School Improvement: Linkages for the 1980s* (pp. 193–209). Cambridge, MA: Ballinger

Type: Research reviews and books

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This report reviews quantitative studies done that looked at impact various school ‘resources’ have had on what studies define as school effectiveness. Studies have shown that there are ‘significant differences’ in school effectiveness. The resources discussed in the piece included studies that attempted to measure the impact of on school effectiveness are teacher quality, the impact of peer groups on learning, class size, instructional time, school facilities.

## The Relationship Between Measures of Teacher Quality and Student Achievement: The Case of Vaughn Elementary

Author(s): Gallagher, H. A. Date: 2002

Source: *CPRE-UW Working Papers Series TC-02-5*. Madison, WI: Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: Using Teacher Evaluation Scores (TES) and Stanford Achievement Test, Ninth Edition scores; the author tested the extent to which TES are associated with student achievement. Using a sample of students and teachers from one PK–5 urban elementary school in California, results show a moderately significant relationship between teacher-evaluation scores and classroom achievement in reading. However, the relationships between TES and achievement in mathematics and language arts were not significant. Study limitations and suggestions for future research are presented.

---

## The Relationship Between Teacher Evaluation Scores and Student Achievement: Evidence From Coventry, RI

Author(s): White, B. Date: 2004

Source: Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin–Madison, Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: State or regional reports; rigorous research

Full text: <http://cpre.wceruw.org/papers/CoventryAERA04.pdf>

Abstract: This report presents findings on the knowledge and skills based pay system for teachers in Coventry, Rhode Island. The researchers measure the relationship between teacher evaluation scores and student achievement. Using a similar methodology to a study of Cincinnati, the analysis uses value-added approach to looking at the data. The results of the study indicate a weak relationship between the teacher evaluation scores and student achievement in this school district.

## The Relationship Between Teacher Performance Evaluation Scores and Student Achievement: Evidence From Cincinnati

Author(s): Milanowski, A. Date: 2004

Source: *Peabody Journal of Education*, 79(4), 33–53

Type: Scientific research; rigorous research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: The author examines the relationship between teacher evaluation scores in the Cincinnati public school district, which has a rigorous, standards-based teacher evaluation system and a value-added measure of student achievement. The teacher assessment system was based on a set of teaching standards derived from the framework for teaching. Sixteen performance standards were grouped into four domains: planning and preparation, creating a learning environment, teaching for learning, and professionalism. Each standard has a set of behaviorally anchored rating scales described in four levels: unsatisfactory, basic, proficient, and distinguished. Teachers were evaluated based on six classroom observations and a portfolio. Student achievement was assessed from student test scores from the district and state for students in Grades 3–8 in reading, mathematics, and science. A two-level, hierarchical linear model was used to study the relationship between teacher evaluation scores and student achievement, controlling for extraneous variables of teacher and student characteristics. Small to moderate positive correlations were found for most grades in each subject tested. The results showed that scores from a rigorous teacher evaluation system can be related substantially to student achievement and provide criterion-related validity evidence for the use of performance-evaluation scores as the basis for a performance-based pay system for teachers.

---

## Relationships Among Dimension Scores of Standards-Based Teacher Evaluation Systems, and the Stability of Evaluation Score—Student Achievement Relationships Over Time

Author(s): Milanowski, A. Date: 2004

Source: *CPRE-UW Working Paper Series TC-04-02*

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This report takes a look at the use of standards-based teacher evaluation scores and their relationship to student achievement. Specifically, the authors examine the extent to which specific evaluation domains are related to student achievement, and whether teacher evaluation scores can accurately predict average student achievement results one year after the evaluation. Teacher evaluation data were collected from the Cincinnati Public Schools and the Vaughn (CA) Next Century Learning Center, and were analyzed across dimensions and correlated with student achievement. Cincinnati correlations show a positive relationship between teacher evaluation scores and student achievement. Vaughn evaluation scores indicate that instruction evaluation scores are the best predictors of student achievement in reading and mathematics. Evaluation scores at both sites did not accurately predict student achievement scores after the year of the evaluation. The authors conclude by discussing the implication of the results in the design and implementation of teacher evaluation systems.

## Requirements for an Assessment Procedure for Beginning Teachers: Implications From Recent Theories on Teaching and Assessment

Author(s): Uhlenbeck, A. M, Verloop, N., & Beijaard, D. Date: 2002

Source: *Teachers College Record*, 104(2), 242–272

Type: Policy paper; literature review

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** Existing teacher evaluation procedures have been criticized for assessing elements that are not relevant to teaching, for failure to take the classroom context into consideration, and for evaluating teaching processes without referring to the adequacy of the content transmitted. This article sought guidance on how to develop teacher-evaluation procedures that avoid these weaknesses. The authors examined studies on teacher thinking, teacher development, teacher learning, and teacher knowledge to obtain the current views on the nature of teaching. New approaches to teacher assessment, especially performance or authentic assessment were explored. The authors focus on problems of validity and reliability of performance assessment. Finally, the authors propose a framework that consists of 15 implications for the development of teacher assessments.

---

## Research Findings From the Tennessee Value-Added Assessment System (TVAAS) Database: Implications for Educational Evaluation and Research

Author(s): Sanders, W. L., & Horn, S. P. Date: 1998

Source: Knoxville, TN: University of Tennessee Value-Added Research and Assessment Center

Type: Research reviews and books

Full text: [http://www.sas.com/govedu/eduled\\_eval.pdf](http://www.sas.com/govedu/eduled_eval.pdf)

Abstract: The Tennessee Value-Added Assessment System tracks student academic growth overtime to determine the effectiveness of school systems, schools, and teachers. A longitudinally merged database that links students to the schools in which they are enrolled and to the teachers they are assigned as they transition from grade to grade is a fundamental component of TVAAS. An effective teacher is a significant determinant of student academic progress, making the link between teacher effectiveness and student outcomes necessary for any effective educational evaluation system. This article discusses the research findings extracted from the TVAAS to explore the level of effect various factors have on the academic gains of students, including school building changes; race socioeconomic status; and teachers.

## Revamping a Teacher Evaluation System

Author(s): Sawyer, L. Date: 2001

Source: *Educational Leadership*, 58(5), 44–47

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article describes a change process of teacher-evaluation methods used in the Washoe County School District in Reno, Nevada. Drawing on the understanding of the need for changes, a new system has been developed. This new evaluation system assesses four domains of teaching: planning and preparation, classroom environment, instruction, and professional responsibilities. Each domain identifies components and specific elements of teacher behaviors. Each element uses a rubric rating of teacher behavior from unsatisfactory to target for growth to proficient to area of strength. A two-year field test was conducted. All principals and assistant principals were invited to test the system with volunteer teachers. At the end of each of two school years, surveys and focus groups were used to collect feedback data separately from administrators, novice teachers, and postprobationary teachers. The majority of experienced teachers were satisfied with the new system. They appreciated the increased control they felt in determining the outcome of their performance ratings and expressed renewed motivation toward personal improvement. Novice teachers felt secure in knowing what the indicators of success were. Dissatisfaction was noted with certain aspects of new system implementation, but not of the system itself.

## The Revelations of Value-Added

Author(s): Hershberg, T., Adams Simon, V., & Lea Kruger, B. Date: 2004

Source: *The School Administrator*, 10–14

Type: Issue paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article looks at what value-added assessment can contribute to education research and policy implementation. The authors posit that his tool can be useful in isolating and measuring the impact of instruction on student learning and providing useful information at the classroom level. The article mentions current use of value-added assessments in various states and points to implications of the system's usefulness in the future.

---

## A Review of Value-Added Models

Author(s): Hibpshman, T. Date: 2004

Source: Frankfort, KY: Kentucky Education Professional Standards Board

Type: Literature review; issue paper

Full text: <http://www.kyepsb.net/documents/Stats/Journals/Heterogeneity%20of%20regression.pdf>

Abstract: As the call for measurement of teacher effectiveness grows louder throughout the education system of the country, value-added models have emerged as both potentially useful and highly questioned. Commissioned by the Kentucky Education Professional Standards Board, this policy report examines the most prominent value-added models currently implemented throughout the country and synthesizes elements of several of these models to propose a model well-suited for the education system of the state of Kentucky. After showing that none of the models are suitable for use in a high-stakes school environment, the authors make the conclusion that the state of Kentucky needs to make further strides into data collection and processing before accepting a model of its own.

## The Revolving Door

Author(s): Hanushek, E., & Rivkin, S. G. Date: 2004

Source: *Education Next*, 1

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20041\\_76.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20041_76.pdf)

Abstract: This article reports on research that has been conducted in Texas on the reasons that teachers leave the profession. There are many different factors that influence the recruitment and retention of teachers such as salary, working conditions, and preferences. The research that this article reviews posits that working conditions mattered more to teachers than salary when making decisions to stay, leave, or teach in a certain district. Teaching in low achievement schools was also a strong decision factor in movement between districts. The results of this study have policy implications for the recruitment and retention of teachers in Texas public schools.

## Rewarding Teachers for Student Performance

Author(s): Cohen, D. K. Date: 1996

Source: *Rewards and Reform: Creating Educational Incentives That Work*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass

Type: Issue paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This chapter, taken from Fuhrman and O'Day's "Rewards and Reform," discusses in detail teacher performance reward plans and factors that come into play in creating such a plan, both inside the classroom and out. Satisfying the stakeholders in education becomes a challenge. The politics of such a system also come into play into making such a change.

---

## Rush to Judgment: Teacher Evaluation in Public Education

Author(s): Toch, T., & Rothman, R. Date: 2008

Source: Washington, DC: Education Sector

Type: Policy paper; information guide; issue paper

Full text: [http://www.educationsector.org/usr\\_doc/RushToJudgment\\_ES\\_Jan08.pdf](http://www.educationsector.org/usr_doc/RushToJudgment_ES_Jan08.pdf)

Abstract: This report examines the necessity for high-quality teacher evaluation in making the teaching profession competitive and market driven. The article provides examples of what comprehensive evaluations look like in comparison to less rigorous evaluations and the importance of having multiple measures in teacher evaluations. In addition, this report provides examples of evaluations in practice, particularly at sites where teacher evaluations influence teacher compensation. Finally, the article offers recommendations to administrators looking to implement teacher evaluations. These recommendations include a blended approach to analyzing teacher effectiveness as well as important components in successful teacher evaluations.

## School Self-Evaluation and School Improvement: A Critique of Values and Procedures

Author(s): Kyriakides, L., & Campbell, R. J. Date: 2004

Source: *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, 30(1), 23–36

Type: Research reviews and books

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article reviews relevant literature existing on self-school evaluation to guide in the development of evaluations. This is used to create a blueprint of self-school evaluations, and what characteristics they should include.

## Selection and Survival in the Teacher Labor Market

Author(s): Murnane, R. J. Date: 1984

Source: *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, 66, 513–518

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This study examined the relationship between the attrition of elementary school teachers and their productivity, as measured by supervisors' evaluations and student test score gains. Data were collected on 104 elementary teachers in an urban school district and on 1,027 students taught by the teachers in the sample. The study found that teachers who had received lower ratings from their principals in their first years of teaching were more likely to leave the school system than teachers with higher ratings. The study did not find a strong relationship between student test score gains and teacher attrition.

## Sizing Up Test Scores

Author(s): Ballou, D. Date: 2002

Source: *Education Next*, 2

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20022\\_10.pdf](http://educationnext.org/files/ednext20022_10.pdf)

Abstract: This article addresses the issues related to using testing for high-stakes purposes such as salary determinations. Three primary problems with testing are that testing are not reliable for accurately measuring students gains, there are outside factors that contribute to student gain scores that value-added systems are difficult to analyze and control for completely, and it is difficult to compare similar gain score and determine what they mean.

---

## The Social and Organizational Influence of Principals: Evaluating Principals in Context

Author(s): Hart, A. W. Date: 1993

Source: *Peabody Journal of Education*, 68(1), 37–57

Type: Issue paper; information guide; perspective piece

Full text: [http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0161-956X\(199223\)68%3A1%3C37%3ATSATIO%3E2.0.CO%3B2-C](http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0161-956X(199223)68%3A1%3C37%3ATSATIO%3E2.0.CO%3B2-C)

Abstract: This article looks at the role of principals within their schools and the link to principal evaluations. The role of principals, which encompasses multiple relationships with all stakeholders, and their relationship to school goals are important to account for in principal evaluation. Hart provides a literature-based investigation of this dynamic as well as the implications of the blueprint for principal evaluation that results from existing literature.

## State Intervention and Contract Choice in the Public Teacher Labor Market

Author(s): Hansen, M. Date: 2009

Source: Washington, DC: National Council on Teacher Quality

Type: Policy paper; rigorous research

Full text: [http://www.nctq.org/tr3/conference/docs/tr3\\_conf\\_hansen.pdf](http://www.nctq.org/tr3/conference/docs/tr3_conf_hansen.pdf)

Abstract: This rigorous policy study uses the Teacher Rules, Roles and Rights database created by the National Council on Teacher Quality to explore the impact of state policies on teacher labor contracts. The study finds that the greatest differences do not exist between states but within states. Local discretion, the study finds, holds a great influence on teacher evaluations, seniority decisions, and collective bargaining.

## Standards-Based Teacher Evaluation As a Foundation for Knowledge- and Skill-Based Pay

Author(s): Heneman, H. G., III, Milanowski, A. T., Kimball, S., & Odden, A. R. Date: 2006

Source: *CPRE Policy Briefs*, RB-45. Madison, WI: Consortium for Policy Research in Education

Type: Policy paper

Full text: [http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content\\_storage\\_01/0000019b/80/1b/e5/1e.pdf](http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/0000019b/80/1b/e5/1e.pdf)

Abstract: This policy brief focuses on accountability systems for knowledge- and skill-based teacher pay. The report reviews previous research done on current programs in various states. The researchers found positive relationships between teacher evaluation scores and student achievement, though the relationship varied across sites. They also assessed the effects on teaching practice, which was shown to be positive with the new compensation systems. The report concludes with a discussion of policy implications and guidelines for future compensation reforms.

## Status Versus Growth: The Distributional Effects of School Accountability Policies

Author(s): Ladd, H. F., & Lauen, D. L. Date: 2009

Source: Washington, DC: National Center for Analysis of Longitudinal Data in Education Research

Type: Scientific research; policy paper

Full text: [http://www.caldcenter.org/PDF/1001260\\_status\\_vs\\_growth.pdf](http://www.caldcenter.org/PDF/1001260_status_vs_growth.pdf)

Abstract: In recent years, education-researchers and policymakers alike have conceptualized and posited a series of different strategies for estimating student achievement. Under No Child Left Behind, school success is measured by the status of single test scores. Recently, however, it has been argued that a better measure of school success (or failure) is student growth and progress. This research study examines the effects of the pressures that accompany these two different measures on student achievement. Using a ten-year longitudinal data set from North Carolina, the research team found that although the status approach reduces academic achievement for high-performing students in certain content areas, the growth model does not. On a more positive note, the study found that neither approach ignores students far below proficiency.

---

## A Summary of Conclusions Drawn from Longitudinal Analyses of Student Achievement Data Over the Past 22 Years (1982–2004)

Author(s): Sanders, W. L. Date: 2004

Source: Paper presented to the Governors Education Symposium, Asheville, NC

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://www.sas.com/govedu/edu/hunt\\_summary.pdf](http://www.sas.com/govedu/edu/hunt_summary.pdf)

Abstract: This presentation states that data extracted from standardized testing of students in public schools has been used for very narrow purposes. Beyond comparing the achievement levels of students, this data can be invaluable to education decisions makers. The author concludes that value-added assessment—following a student’s academic progress over time—allows an objective measure of the influence of the district, school, and teacher on the rate of academic progress.

## Taking the Lead: One District’s Approach to Principal Evaluation

Author(s): Brown, G., Irby, B. J., & Neumeyer, C. Date: 1998

Source: *National Association of Secondary School Principals Bulletin*, 82(602), 18–25

Type: Case study

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article assesses changes made to the principal evaluation system in the Judson Independent School District (Live Oak, Texas). Principals expressed concern that the evaluation system in place was not able to adequately assess the role of the principal. The Administrative Portfolio Appraisal System (APAS) was created in response to these concerns. Principals expressed a greater level of confidence in the new system and its ability to measure the many responsibilities of the principal.

## Teacher and Classroom Context Effects on Student Achievement: Implications for Teacher Evaluation

Author(s): Wright, S. P., Horn, S. P., & Sanders, W. L. Date: 1997

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 11, 57–67

Type: State or regional reports; rigorous research

Full text: [http://www.sas.com/govedu/edu/teacher\\_eval.pdf](http://www.sas.com/govedu/edu/teacher_eval.pdf)

Abstract: This article examines the impact of teacher effects on student achievement in Tennessee, following the value-added system. The results of the study indicate that teacher effects are a strong factor affecting student achievement in the Tennessee schools, in comparison to classroom context variables which showed little influence on academic gain. This study shows that teachers make a difference with students, which has implications for teaching evaluation and future research.

## Teacher Credentials and Student Achievement in High School: A Cross-Subject Analysis With Student Fixed Effects

Author(s): Clotfelter, C. T., Ladd, H. F., & Vigdor, J. L. Date: 2007

Source: Washington, DC: National Center for Analysis of Longitudinal Data in Education Research

Type: Scientific research; policy paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article uses data collected from North Carolina’s end-of-course tests to study the interconnection of teacher credentials and student achievement. The report uses test data for high school students in multiple subjects. The results conclude that there is a significant impact on student achievement based on teacher credentials. This report also suggests policy implications for the findings.

---

## Teacher Evaluation, Teacher Effectiveness and School Effectiveness: Perspectives From the USA

Author(s): Ellett, C. D., & Teddlie, C. Date: 2003

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 17(1), 101–128

Type: Policy paper; literature review

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article examines the history of teacher effectiveness research in the United States. The authors look at multiple factors, including evaluation of teachers, teacher effectiveness, and school-level variables of effectiveness. Through a systematic evaluation of the literature, the researchers find that the three factors have not been merged in the research and that further research in teacher evaluation and effectiveness should be linked to school effectiveness.

## Teacher Evaluation: A Comprehensive Guide to New Directions and Practices

Author(s): Peterson, K. Date: 2000

Source: Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press

Type: Information guide

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This informational handbook, authored by Kenneth Peterson, seeks to propose a new perspective on teacher evaluation; namely, a system that is responsive to the needs and professional desires of practitioners in American public schools. Rather than focusing on the faults and shortcomings of teachers, Peterson argues that teacher-evaluation models can be designed and implemented such that teachers can learn about their own pedagogy and can be encouraged to reflect, grow, and hone their craft. The textbook is organized into five different sections: Thinking About Teacher Evaluation, Multiple Data Sources for Teacher Evaluation, Tools for Improved Teacher Evaluation, Evaluation of Other Educators, and School District Responsibilities and Activities. The components within these sections are presented as a model of systemic reform for teacher evaluation, and, according to Peterson, aim for the following objectives: emphasizing that good teaching does exist, using sound reasons to evaluate, focusing the evaluation model on teachers (and allowing them to be self-reflective), triangulating evaluation data to ensure validity and reliability, and limiting the role of administrator judgment.

---

## Teacher Knowledge and Skill Assessments and Teacher Compensation: An Overview of Measurement and Linkage Issues

Author(s): Milanowski, A., Odden, A., & Youngs, P. Date: 1998

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 12(2), 83–101

Type: Policy paper; information guide

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** A pay system based on knowledge and skills in teaching would involve not only a more detailed, practice-oriented specification of teacher knowledge and skills but also an assessment system to determine whether these components are present. New measures of teacher skills, based on conceptions of professional practice consistent with the requirements of standards-based reform, have been developed at the national level. They include assessments of beginning teachers developed by the Interstate New Teacher Assessment and Support Consortium, the PRAXIS III assessment developed by ETS, and assessments for the certification of experienced teachers developed by the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards. This article discusses the measurement quality of these assessments and their linkage to teacher compensation system. Important measurement issues addressed include criterion-related validity, content validity, and reliability and consistency. More information is needed for valid measurement quality of these assessments. The authors point out many unresolved issues of these measures, including generalizability, interrater agreement, adverse impact, and consequential validity. The authors also suggest a way to combine national and local standards and assessments with locally developed definitions and assessments of skills to form a coherent knowledge- and skills-based pay system.

## Teacher Licensure Tests and Student Achievement: Is Teacher Testing an Effective Policy?

Author(s): Goldhaber, D. Date: 2005

Source: Seattle, WA: Center on Reinventing Public Education

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://www.crpe.org/cs/crpe/download/csr\\_files/wp\\_crpe4\\_tcblicensure\\_mar05.pdf](http://www.crpe.org/cs/crpe/download/csr_files/wp_crpe4_tcblicensure_mar05.pdf)

**Abstract:** In an effort to further the conversation on teacher effectiveness, this study analyzes the relationship between teacher licensure tests and student learning gains, so as to better understand ways in which teacher testing can be a useful policy lever. Using a dataset from North Carolina, Goldhaber uses an estimation analysis to examine the correlation between Praxis scores and Grade 4 reading scores. North Carolina is a unique sample for this study because its current data system allows for teachers and students to be linked and tracked over time. Overall, Goldhaber finds that in reading class, students benefit, in a statistically significant way, from having a more experienced teacher. This benefit is not present in mathematics.

---

## Teacher Mobility and Effectiveness in Restructuring and Non-Restructuring Schools in an Inner-City District

Author(s): Ross, S. M., Wang, W., Sanders, W. L., Wright, S. P., & Stringfield, S. Date: 1999

Source: University of Memphis, University of Tennessee, and Johns Hopkins University October

Type: Report

Full text: [http://www.sas.com/govedu/edu/teacher\\_mobility.pdf](http://www.sas.com/govedu/edu/teacher_mobility.pdf)

Abstract: This study looks at how teacher behaviors, specifically teacher effectiveness and mobility are impacted by educational reform efforts. This study is placed in Memphis, TN to examine the effects of reform in an inner-city district. The major questions this study aims to address are: Does teacher effectiveness differ for restructuring schools versus non-restructuring schools. Does the level of teacher mobility differ overall for restructuring schools versus non-restructuring schools? Are mobility and teacher effectiveness outcomes consistent for two cohorts of restructuring schools? Are mobility and teacher effectiveness outcomes consistent for individual restructuring designs? Teacher effectiveness is measured by looking at Tennessee Value-Added Assessment System (TVAAS) scores over a four-year period. TVAAS scores reflect student growth free of biases. The implications of the results are discussed.

## Teacher Objective-Setting and Monitoring Process

Author(s): Denver Public Schools. Date: 2004

Source: Denver, CO: Denver Public Schools

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: In spring 2004, the Denver Public Schools' Board of Education and the Denver Classroom Teachers Association ratified a labor agreement instituting the Professional Compensation Systems for Teachers (ProComp). ProComp is a compensation system in which teachers are rewarded throughout their careers for their professional accomplishments. ProComp pays teachers for demonstrated accomplishment in four areas: student growth, knowledge and skills, professional evaluation, and market incentives. The issues addressed by ProComp are central to the mission of Denver Public Schools. This report focuses on student growth as measured in the objective-setting and monitoring system. The teacher objective-setting and monitoring process is a collaborative procedure in which the principal and teacher set expectations for growth in student learning and monitor progress toward those expectations. This report provides guiding principles for the objective-setting and monitoring process. It also provides examples of the process in a studio course, connected mathematics, and cognitive tutor algebra.

## Teacher Quality and Equity in Educational Opportunity: Findings and Policy Implications

Author(s): Rivers, J. C., & Sanders, W. L. Date: 2002

Source: In L. T. Izumi & W. M. Evers (Eds.), *Teacher Quality* (pp. 13–23). Stanford, CA: Hoover Institution Press

Type: Policy paper; issue paper

Full text: [http://media.hoover.org/documents/0817929320\\_13.pdf](http://media.hoover.org/documents/0817929320_13.pdf)

Abstract: This paper explores the Tennessee Value-Added Assessment System (TVAAS) as an indicator of student achievement and teacher effectiveness. The TVAAS utilizes an extensive database of student and teacher information to determine the effects of individual teachers on student achievement. The paper also includes policy implications for teacher quality that have been determined by using the TVAAS. These implications include the following: teacher effects are different from race, socioeconomic status, and parental influence; teacher effects are measurable at least four years after the student has left that teacher; and children, regardless of ethnicity, respond positively to effective teachers.

---

## Teacher Quality and Student Achievement: A Review of State Policy Evidence

Author(s): Darling-Hammond, L. Date: 2000

Source: *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 8(1)

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaal/v8n1/>

Abstract: This article looks at various data sources throughout the nation and examines the relationship between teacher qualifications, other school inputs, and student achievement. Using both qualitative and quantitative analysis, the results suggest that there is a relationship. Policy investments in the quality of teachers may be related to improvements in student performance. Quantitative results focus on measures of teacher preparation and certification. State policy analysis indicates that states adopting innovative policies may make an importance difference in the capacity of teachers in their schools.

## Techniques of Evaluation of Principals and Assistant Principals: Four Case Studies

Author(s): Redfern, G. B. Date: 1986

Source: *National Association of Secondary School Principals Bulletin*, 70(487), 66–74

Type: Case study

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This report describes four evaluation programs used to evaluate principals and assistant principals. Both individual and comprehensive evaluations are designed using applicable criterion on which to judge job performance. All evaluation systems rely heavily on evaluator judgments to accurately assess performance on the designed scale.

## The Tennessee Value-Added Assessment System (TVAAS): Mixed-Model Methodology in Educational Assessment

Author(s): Sanders, W. L., & Horn, S. P. Date: 1994

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 8, 299–311

Type: State or regional reports; issue paper

Full text: [http://www.sas.com/govedu/edu/mixed\\_model.pdf](http://www.sas.com/govedu/edu/mixed_model.pdf)

Abstract: The Tennessee Value-Added Assessment System (TVAAS), a statewide accountability system, was an integral part of the state's 1991 Education Improvement Act and continues its prominence in the state today. This journal article describes the TVAAS—a statistical process that measures the influence of school systems, schools, and teachers on indicators of student learning. The authors also address the challenge of using student achievement data in educational assessment and describe how these can be overcome by using a mixed-model methodology on which TVASS relies.

## Test Scaling and Value-Added Measurement

Author(s): Ballou, D. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Policy paper; information guide

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/news/PapersNews/Ballou\\_2008.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/news/PapersNews/Ballou_2008.pdf)

Abstract: This policy paper and information guide provides insight into the obstacles that arise when using interval scales to express an increment of learning. The article suggests that it is difficult to assume that the test items are designed in a conjoint structure, and as a result, may have a substantial impact on students' measured growth or value-added measurement. The author suggests using an ordinal data method instead and argues that this method best indicates how a portion of the students' mean score performs in comparison to another.

---

## The Transformational Leadership Questionnaire (TLQ-LGV): A Convergent and Discriminant Validation Study

Author(s): Alimo-Metcalfe, B. M., & Alban-Metcalfe, R. J. Date: 2000

Source: *Leadership and Organization Development Journal*, 21(6), 280–296

Type: Rigorous research

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** In this study, the convergent and discriminant validity of a newly developed leadership questionnaire, the Transformational Leadership Questionnaire (Local Government Version) (TLQ-LGV) is explored. The design of the questionnaire is based on gender constructs of leadership. The instrument consists of nine scales designed to measure an aspect of transformational leadership and five criterion variables that measure job satisfaction. Administering the questionnaire to a stratified random sample of more than 1,400 managers in government work in the United Kingdom, regression analysis suggests different levels of relationships that exist between the scales and criterion variables when looking at subgroups of level and gender.

## Turning Merit Scores Into Salaries

Author(s): Becker, W. E. Date: 1999

Source: *Journal of Economic Education*, 30(4), 20–26

Type: Information guide; issue paper

Full text: <http://www.journalofeconed.org/pdfs/fall1999/10beckerfall99.pdf>

**Abstract:** This information guide provides a single formula for merit-raise salary schemes. Taking into account the worth of merit-pay systems, the author provides the steps necessary to implement such a plan, from creating a strategy for assigning merit scores to doling out salary increases. The author uses a hypothetical East Coast research university as the location for his innovative salary scheme. Most importantly, the author stresses that funds and resources for this system should be a direct combination of available funds and individual merit scores, and not “some magical box with unknown workings” (p. 425).

## The Use of Portfolios for In-Service Teacher Assessment: A Case Study of Foreign Language Middle School Teachers in Texas

Author(s): Moore, Z., & Bond, N. Date: 2002

Source: *Foreign Language Annals*, 35(1), 85–92

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** Texas legislated a new form of teacher assessment called the Professional Development and Appraisal System (PDAS), which evaluates teachers according to 51 criteria in eight domains. This system has three components: an administrative observation, a teacher self-report, and a summative conference. The researchers introduced the concept of portfolio to help organize a teacher self-report. This case study documents the efforts of a group of foreign language middle school teachers as they developed professional portfolios. Their portfolio items were organized into three categories according to the requirement of the PDAS: academic skills, instructional modifications, and goals and professional activities. The portfolios contained minimal evidence of language teaching. Teachers seemed to have difficulty making distinctions between goal setting and instruction modifications. This confusion, accompanied with a lack of peer collaboration, resulted in a poor selection of artifacts. The authors make two major recommendations: teachers developing a portfolio may need to see an exemplary model to help them understand how to select artifacts, and full administrative support for teachers developing portfolios is needed.

---

## The Use of Student Ratings of Teacher Behaviors With Academically Talented High School Students

Author(s): Worrell, F. C., & Kuterbach, L. D. Date: 2001

Source: *The Journal of Secondary Gifted Education*, 12(4), 236–247

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This research report presents the findings from a study on the validity of student ratings of teaching. The report uses data from two different cohorts of high school students that attended a summer program for academically gifted students. Students self-report their observations of teaching, and responses are based on a five-point Likert scale. The report concludes that student ratings of low-inference teaching behaviors in the first cohort were reliable indicators of teacher effectiveness. The findings were supported by the second cohort of student ratings.

## Using More Data Sources to Evaluate Teachers

Author(s): Peterson, K. D., Wahlquist, C., Bone, K., Thompson, J., & Chatterton, K. Date: 2001

Source: *Educational Leadership*, 58(5), 40–43

Type: State or regional reports

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: The Davis (Utah) District Educator Assessment Committee decided to improve teacher evaluation by creating an innovative teacher evaluation program. This article focuses on the effort to improve data-gathering process in this teacher evaluation program. The important feature of this evaluation program is allowing teachers to choose which data to present for evaluation. Teachers can choose among several data sources, including parent surveys, student surveys, student achievement data, documentation of professional activity, teacher tests, reports by administrators, action-research results, results of school improvement programs, and licensing by the National Board of Professional Teaching Standards. The program has received favorable responses from participating teachers and principals. The program is continuing to study and control its costs for this substantially increased data gathering for teacher evaluation.

## Using Performance-Based Pay to Improve the Quality of Teachers

Author(s): Lavy, V. Date: 2007

Source: *The Future of Children*, 17(1)

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://www.princeton.edu/futureofchildren/publications/docs/17\\_01\\_05.pdf](http://www.princeton.edu/futureofchildren/publications/docs/17_01_05.pdf)

Abstract: This paper analyzes the benefits and drawbacks of performance-based reward programs in public schools. Performance-based reward schemes lead to increased productivity and efficiency among teachers. The author discusses a number of drawbacks to performance-based rewards, including the difficulty of measuring teacher performance, and the unintended consequences of these programs, including the potential for teachers to focus solely on improving rewarded measures, not measures improvable by other stakeholders or measures that do not generate rewards. Another unintended consequence is the potential for “game play,” in which teachers focus on generating responses for the sole purpose of rewards, causing unprofessional behavior. The article discusses other drawbacks and explores lessons learned from previous school-based and individual-based performance incentive programs in the United States and abroad. The author concludes with a discussion of the policy implications for future incentive programs.

---

## Using R for Estimating Longitudinal Student Achievement Models

Author(s): Lockwood, J. R., Doran, H., & McCaffrey, D. F. Date: 2003

Source: *R News*, 3(3), 17–23

Type: Scientific research

Full text: [http://cran.r-project.org/doc/Rnews/Rnews\\_2003-3.pdf](http://cran.r-project.org/doc/Rnews/Rnews_2003-3.pdf)

Abstract: This article examines linear mixed effect models and their use in value-added modeling (VAM) to measure teacher effects on student achievement. The authors demonstrate the use of value-added modeling by presenting a variety of examples—all with varying degrees of complexity—and conclude with a nuanced discussion of strengths and weaknesses of the approach.

## Using Student Progress to Evaluate Teachers: A Primer on Value-Added Models

Author(s): Braun, H. I. Date: 2005

Source: Princeton, NJ: Educational Testing Service

Type: Policy paper; issue paper; perspective piece

Full text: <http://www.ets.org/Media/Research/pdf/PICVAM.pdf>

Abstract: This report provides a glimpse into issues surrounding the use of value-added modeling (VAM) to measure teacher effects on student performance. VAM provides an alternative method of accountability that measures student performance over time to estimate teacher effects. The report discusses concerns about the use of VAM, including the inability of VAM to account for the lack of randomization that exists in data about students. There also are serious concerns about the ability of VAM to isolate teacher effects in improved student performance, and to account for biases that impact performance. VAM also must adjust when data are missing on students. The report concludes with a discussion of existing value-added models.

## Using Teaching Portfolios

Author(s): Painter, B. Date: 2001

Source: *Educational Leadership*, 58(5), 31–34

Type: Issue paper

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: A teaching portfolio is a documented history of a teacher's learning process against a set of teaching standards. It is an individualized portrait of the teacher as a professional, reflecting on his or her philosophy and practice. This article focuses on the development and use of teaching portfolios. The author describes how to select artifacts for a portfolio and the importance of thoughtful reflection on the success of teaching portfolios. Given adequate time and energy, teaching portfolios will enhance professional practice.

---

## Value-Added Achievement Results for Two Cohorts of Co-NECT Schools in Memphis: 1995–1999 Outcomes

Author(s): Ross, S. M., Sanders, W. L., & Wright, S. P. Date: 2000

Source: Memphis, TN: University of Memphis and University of Tennessee

Type: Scientific research; state or regional reports

Full text: <http://www.sas.com/govedu/edu/connect.pdf>

Abstract: This report examines the progress of 22 schools in Memphis who implemented the Roots and Wings [comprehensive school reform] design; as compared with 23 schools that did not implement the design (control schools). Student achievement data from all schools was assessed using five subjects on the TerraNova and value-added scores from the Tennessee Value-Added Assessment System (TVAAS) during the range of spring 1995 to spring 1999. The five year findings support the effects of Roots and Wings schools in increasing gains in academic achievement, with an average pre- to post-reform gain of about 20 points higher than control schools.

## Value-Added and Other Methods for Measuring School Performance

Author(s): Meyer, R. H., & Christian, M. S. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Information guide

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Meyer\\_and\\_Christian\\_2008.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/directory/ConferencePapersNews/Meyer_and_Christian_2008.pdf)

Abstract: This document is a study of the different models for the measurement of student achievement that states and districts use to implement pay-for-performance programs. The authors specifically focus on value-added models that measure grade-level performance. The document examines the different models used by Teacher Incentive Fund grantees and provides a detailed description of measuring student performance based on a value-added model. The authors conclude that the models are attractive from a technical perspective and are working to address the feasibility of using the model in districts that historically do not have the technical capacity.

## Value-Added Assessment and Systemic Reform: A Response to the Challenge of Human Capital Development

Author(s): Hershberg, T. Date: 2005

Source: *Phi Delta Kappan*, 87(4), 267–283

Type: Issue paper

Full text: <http://www.cgp.upenn.edu/pdf/Hershberg%20-%20Dec%2005%20%20Phi%20Delta%20Kappan%20Article.pdf>

Abstract: This article offers a review of literature on value-added assessment and its role in school reforms. With the NCLB focus on improving student achievement for all, reform of the system as it was became necessary. The author posits that incentives at the federal level are necessary to encourage states to move in new directions, which includes value-added assessment as a tool to improve teacher quality and student achievement.

---

## Value-Added Assessment From Student Achievement Data: Opportunities and Hurdles

Author(s): Sanders, W. L. Date: 2000

Source: *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 14(4), 329–339

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://www.sas.com/govedu/edu/opp\\_hurdles.pdf](http://www.sas.com/govedu/edu/opp_hurdles.pdf)

Abstract: How can the level of academic achievement of all students be raised? How can the responsibility for their success or failure be appropriately attributed to schools, districts, teachers, and students? This presentation—given at the Create National Evaluation Institute on July 21, 2000, and printed in the *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*—the author attempts to answer these questions by summarizing the attempts made by the educational assessment field to develop various methods of analyzing student test data. Sanders also examines the criticisms of value-added assessments, in particular, and all assessment that rely on student test data, in general.

## Value-Added Indicators: A Powerful Tool for Evaluating Science and Mathematics Programs and Policies. NISE Brief (Vol. 3, no. 3)

Author(s): Meyer, R. H. Date: 2000

Source: Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin, National Institute for Science Education

Type: Issue paper

Full text: [http://www.wcer.wisc.edu/archive/NISE/Publications/Briefs/Vol\\_3\\_No\\_3/Vol%203,%20No%203.pdf](http://www.wcer.wisc.edu/archive/NISE/Publications/Briefs/Vol_3_No_3/Vol%203,%20No%203.pdf)

Abstract: This brief article discusses the misuse of average and median test scores as indicators of school performance. Using these test scores to measure school performance has four major flaws: test score data does not analyze performance on the classroom and grade level, the aggregated information on performance is out-of-date, test score data is affected by student mobility, and test score data fails to separate the direct impact of school programs on student achievement from the impact of outside factors that also impact student achievement. Value-added models are a more effective way of measuring school performance, because they statistically account differences across school, and avoid the issues of using average and median test scores.

## Value-Added Indicators of School Performance

Author(s): Meyer, R. H. Date: 1996

Source: In E. A. Hanushek & D. W. Jorgenson, (Eds.), *Improving America's Schools: The Role of Incentives* (pp. 197–223). Washington, DC: National Academy Press

Type: Research reviews and books

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This article takes a detailed look at the value-added model as an indicator for student performance. With an increased use of educational outcome indicators in assessing school and teacher effectiveness, it is important to understand the attributes of a valid performance indicator system. This article prepares the reader to understand this.

---

## Value-Added to What? How a Ceiling in the Testing Instrument Influences Value-Added Estimation

Author(s): Koedel, C., & Betts, J. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: National Center on Performance Incentives

Type: Rigorous research; policy paper

Full text: [http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/news/PapersNews/KoedelBetts\\_200821\\_v2.pdf](http://www.performanceincentives.org/data/files/news/PapersNews/KoedelBetts_200821_v2.pdf)

Abstract: Value-added measurement has become a popular, if still contentious, method of evaluating teacher effectiveness in American public schools. The main benefit of value-added measurement is that it allows for teachers to be judged on student growth and learning, rather than be evaluated based solely on the results of one standardized test. This report, conducted by staff at the National Center on Performance Incentives, asks readers to think about whether or not the benefits of value-added measurement are as strong at the high end of the distribution. That is, for a test with ceiling effects [here, “ceiling effects” are described as “the tendency for gains in a student’s test score to be smaller if the student’s initial score is toward the top end of the distribution, simply because the student has little room for improvement given the difficulty level of the test” (pp. 1–2)], are students less able to demonstrate growth if their scores are high to begin with? And given this logic, are teachers of these students at a disadvantage in the value-added measurement model? The findings of this study indicate that teacher effectiveness can be proven using value-added measurement even in a situation with test ceiling effects.

## The Vanderbilt Assessment of Leadership in Education: Measuring Learning-Centered Leadership

Author(s): Murphy, J. F., Goldring, E. B., Cravens, X. C., Elliott, S. N., & Porter, A. C. Date: 2008

Source: Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University

Type: Literature review

Full text: URL not available

Abstract: This paper presents both a framework and a literature review of a principal assessment tool. The assessment can be used to evaluate principal leadership in a school, a necessary component for the increased accountability standards present in today’s schools. The tool is called the Vanderbilt Assessment of Leadership in Education (VAL-ED). The paper defines leadership and the importance of leadership, presents the VAL-ED framework, and concludes with a thorough review of the leadership literature.

---

## The Varieties of Knowledge and Skill-Based Pay Design: A Comparison of Seven New Pay Systems for K–12 Teachers

Author(s): Milanowski, A. Date: 2003

Source: *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 11(4)

Type: Research reviews and books; policy paper

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This article described qualitative research on seven “pioneer” knowledge and skills-based pay programs. A theory of action, which linked teacher motivation, type of incentives, and other factors to student achievement, guided the study. First, the author discussed the advantages of knowledge and skills-based pay programs. Second, he developed seven dimensions to structure the analysis and comparison of the programs, including motivation for program development, the design process, types and structures of reward, assessment of skills acquisition, size and structure of knowledge and skills incentives, alignment of other human resource programs, and cost and funding. Third, case study site visits of six school districts and one-charter school informed and supported the analysis a cross-site analysis. The results showed that although the districts had different reasons for implementing the skills-based pay systems, the author identified several lessons learned: the programs retained seniority and degrees as factors for pay increases, teachers’ associations did not summarily dismiss changes in the pay structure, the use of preexisting standards will facilitate adoption of a new pay system, and the transition to a knowledge and skills-based pay system can be low-cost.

## What Do We Know About Instruction From Large-Scale National Surveys?

Author(s): Camburn, E. M., & Han, S. W. Date: 2008

Source: Madison, WI: Wisconsin Center for Education Research

Type: Literature review

Full text: [http://www.wcer.wisc.edu/publications/workingPapers/Working\\_Paper\\_No\\_2008\\_01.pdf](http://www.wcer.wisc.edu/publications/workingPapers/Working_Paper_No_2008_01.pdf)

**Abstract:** This paper provides a synthesis on 27 studies based on national education data. The goal of the research is to investigate what the research says about the link between instructional strategies and student achievement. All of the studies included used inferential statistics to examine instruction. The authors present information on the different dimensions of instruction, as well as make conclusions about the state of the research and where the holes are.

## What Does Certification Tell Us About Teacher Quality? Evidence From New York City

Author(s): Kane, T. J., Rockoff, J. E., & Staiger, D. O. Date: 2006

Source: Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research

Type: Scientific research

Full text: URL not available

**Abstract:** This report examines the alternate certification and traditional teaching programs that contribute teachers to New York City public schools. The report particularly focuses on Teach For America, the New York Teaching Fellows, traditional certification, and uncertified teachers. The report uses six years of student achievement data to determine the effectiveness of New York City teachers. In its evaluation, the report suggests that certification type is not a relevant factor in determining teacher effectiveness.

---

## What Is Required for Performance Assessment of Teaching?

**Author(s):** Stansbury, K. **Date:** 1998

**Source:** San Francisco: WestEd

**Type:** Information guide; policy paper

**Full text:** URL not available

**Abstract:** This report examines the performance assessment of teachers to identify important elements in the process and to summarize lessons learned from the past. The author focuses on four major aspects of performance assessment: purpose of the assessment, components of an assessment system, building capacity, and building legitimacy. It is necessary to have clear purposes for assessments before choosing an instrument. Three major purposes of teacher assessment are discussed: licensure, employment, and professional development. The four components of the assessment system are described: standards, assessment instruments, scoring framework, and exploration of technical quality. Finally, unresolved issues of teacher performance assessments are discussed, including agreement on teaching standards, continued work on the technical quality of assessments, building teacher capacity, and using performance assessments at the district level.

## What Large-Scale, Survey Research Tells Us About Teacher Effects on Student Achievement: Insights From the “Prospects”

**Author(s):** Rowan, B., Correnti, R., & Miller, R. J. **Date:** 2002

**Source:** Philadelphia: Consortium for Policy Research in Education

**Type:** Scientific research

**Full text:** URL not available

**Abstract:** This paper examines the methodological issues using large-scale surveys to determine teacher effects on student achievement. The researchers first describe the various analyses conducted in teacher effect research. They then review teacher effects data to look at why these effects seem to occur. The researchers conclude with lessons learned from the analyses and suggest ways to improve survey research on teaching.

## When Principals Rate Teachers

**Author(s):** Jacob, B., & Lefgren, L. **Date:** 2006

**Source:** *Education Next*, 2

**Type:** Rigorous research

**Full text:** URL not available

**Abstract:** Principals' ability to assess their teacher's performance is explored in this article. The implementation of merit-pay systems requires principals to accurately measure teacher performance in their ability to boost student achievement. Analysis indicates a positive correlation between the principal's assessment of teacher effectiveness and the teacher's actual ability to improve student performance. Jacob and Lefgren consider factors impacting this correlation.

---

## The Widget Effect:

### Our National Failure to Acknowledge and Act on Differences in Teacher Effectiveness

Author(s): Weisberg, D., Sexton, S., Mulhern, J., & Keeling, D. Date: 2009

Source: Brooklyn, NY: The New Teacher Project

Type: Policy paper; case study; scientific research

Full text: <http://widgeteffect.org/downloads/TheWidgetEffect.pdf>

**Abstract:** In an effort to expose the real issues with which we struggle in terms of measuring teacher effectiveness, this study takes a hard look at teacher evaluation systems in public schools districts across the country. Common knowledge about the teaching profession in this country uncovers the fact that once tenured, teachers are almost never dismissed, regardless of their effectiveness. In fact, oftentimes their effectiveness is never observed or measured again. Using survey responses and data collected on district evaluation systems, the report concludes that the lack of accuracy in defining and measuring individual teacher's performances causes districts to assume that effectiveness is identical across the board; this has been called "the widget effect." After making a case for the widget effect across the nation, the authors introduce a series of recommendations geared toward reversing the widget effect. These recommendations include, but are not limited to, adopting a comprehensive teacher evaluation system that uses various instruments to measure an individual teacher's impact on student learning gains; training administrators to use this system well; and using the findings of these new systems to inform professional development, compensation, retention, and dismissal.